

Wordtrade Reviews: Decadent Signs

Table of Contents

[THE DECADENT SOCIETY: HOW WE BECAME THE VICTIMS OF OUR OWN SUCCESS by Ross Gregory Douthat \[Avid Reader Press / Simon & Schuster, 9781476785240\]](#)

[THE BROKEN HEART OF AMERICA: ST. LOUIS AND THE VIOLENT HISTORY OF THE UNITED STATES by Walter Johnson \[Basic Books, 9780465064267\]](#)

[THE BETRAYAL OF THE DUCHESS: THE SCANDAL THAT UNMADE THE BOURBON MONARCHY AND MADE FRANCE MODERN by Maurice Samuels \[Basic Books, 9781541645455\]](#)

[AMERICAN PROPHETS: THE RELIGIOUS ROOTS OF PROGRESSIVE POLITICS AND THE ONGOING FIGHT FOR THE SOUL OF THE COUNTRY by Jack Jenkins \[HarperOne, 9780062935984\]](#)

[LOSS OF INDIGENOUS EDEN AND THE FALL OF SPIRITUALITY by Blair A Stonechild \[University of Regina Press, 9780889777019\]](#)

[DEFEND THE SACRED: NATIVE AMERICAN RELIGIOUS FREEDOM BEYOND THE FIRST AMENDMENT BY Michael D. McNally \[Princeton University Press, 9780691190891\]](#)

[A CLIMATE POLICY REVOLUTION: WHAT THE SCIENCE OF COMPLEXITY REVEALS ABOUT SAVING OUR PLANET by Roland Kupers \[Harvard University Press, 9780674972124\]](#)

[NATURE'S BROKEN CLOCKS: REIMAGINING TIME IN THE FACE OF THE ENVIRONMENTAL CRISIS by Paul Huebener \[University of Regina Press, 9780889777149\]](#)

[A WILD LOVE FOR THE WORLD: JOANNA MACY AND THE WORK OF OUR TIME by Joanna Macy edited by Stephanie Kaza \[Shambhala, 9781611807950\]](#)

[LIVING LANDSCAPES: MEDITATIONS ON THE FIVE ELEMENTS IN HINDU, BUDDHIST, AND JAIN YOGAS by Christopher Key Chapple, Foreword by John Grim and Mary Evelyn Tucker \[SUNY Press, 9781438477930\]](#)

[TRANSFORMING INDUSTRIAL POLICY FOR THE DIGITAL AGE: PRODUCTION, TERRITORIES AND STRUCTURAL CHANGE edited by Patrizio Bianchi, Clemente Ruiz Durán, Sandrine Labory \[Edward Elgar Publishing, 9781788976145\]](#)

[KALILA AND DIMNA by Nasrullah Munshi, Translated from the Persian by Wheeler Thackston \[Hackett Publishing Company, Inc., 9781624668098\]](#)

[SAINTHOOD AND AUTHORITY IN EARLY ISLAM: AL-HAKĪM AL-TIRMIDHT'S THEORY OF WILAYA AND THE RE-ENVISIONING OF THE SUNNI CALIPHATE by Aiyub Palmer \[Studies on Sufism, Brill, 9789004408302\]](#)

[ON THE SULTAN'S SERVICE HALID ZIYA USAKLIGIL'S MEMOIR OF THE OTTOMAN PALACE, 1909-1912 by Douglas Scott Brookes \[Indiana University Press, 9780253045508\]](#)

[THE EARLY MUSLIM CONQUEST OF SYRIA: AN ENGLISH TRANSLATION OF AL-AZDĪ'S FUTŪH AL-SHAM translated and annotated by Hamada Hassanein and Jens Scheiner \[Culture and Civilization in the Middle East, Routledge, 9780367230258\]](#)

[STUDYING THE QUR'ĀN IN THE MUSLIM ACADEMY by Majid Daneshgar \[AAR Reflection and Theory in the Study of Religion Series, Oxford University Press, 9780190067540\]](#)

[DISRUPTIVE VOICES AND THE SINGULARITY OF HISTORIES \(Histories of Anthropology Annual, Volume 13\) edited by Regna Darnell and Frederic W. Gleach \[Histories of Anthropology Annual, University of Nebraska Press, 9781496217691\]](#)

[THE CHIMERA PRINCIPLE: AN ANTHROPOLOGY OF MEMORY AND IMAGINATION by Carlo Severi, Translated by Janet Lloyd, Foreword by David Graeber \[Hau - Malinowski Monographs, HAU Books, 9780990505051\]](#)

[ANTHROPOLOGICAL THEORY: AN INTRODUCTORY HISTORY, SEVENTH EDITION by R. Jon McGee, Richard L. Warms \[Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 9781538126202\]](#)

[SIGN LANGUAGE AN INTERNATIONAL HANDBOOK edited by Roland Pfau, Markus Steinbach, Bencie Woll \[Handbook of Linguistics and Communication Science: Handbucher zur Sprach-und Kommunikationswissenschaft De Gruyter Mouton, 9783110204216\]](#)

[ESSAY: LINGUISTICS AND HERMENEUTICS by Stanley E. Porter](#)

[Bibliography](#)

Editorial Appraisals:

Some qualified reviewers offer their own brief evaluation of the book. Otherwise most of our content represents the authors'-editors' own words as a preview to their approach to the subject, their style and point-of-view. <>

THE DECADENT SOCIETY: HOW WE BECAME THE VICTIMS OF OUR OWN SUCCESS by Ross Gregory Douthat [Avid Reader Press / Simon & Schuster, 9781476785240]

From the *New York Times* columnist and bestselling author of *Bad Religion*, a powerful portrait of how our turbulent age is defined by dark forces seemingly beyond our control

Today the Western world seems to be in crisis. But beneath our social media frenzy and reality television politics, the deeper reality is one of drift, repetition, and dead ends. *The Decadent Society* explains what happens when a rich and powerful society ceases advancing—how the combination of wealth and technological proficiency with economic stagnation, political stalemates, cultural exhaustion, and demographic decline creates a strange kind of “sustainable decadence,” a civilizational languor that could endure for longer than we think.

Ranging from our grounded space shuttles to our Silicon Valley villains, from our blandly recycled film and television—a new *Star Wars* saga, another *Star Trek* series, the fifth *Terminator* sequel—to the escapism we’re furiously chasing through drug use and virtual reality, Ross Douthat argues that many of today’s discontents and derangements reflect a sense of futility and disappointment—a feeling that the future was not what was promised, that the frontiers have all been closed, and that the paths forward lead only to the grave.

In this environment we fear catastrophe, but in a certain way we also pine for it—because the alternative is to accept that we are permanently decadent: aging, comfortable and stuck, cut off from the past and no longer confident in the future, spurning both memory and ambition while we wait for some saving innovation or revelations, growing old unhappily together in the glowing light of tiny screens.

Correcting both optimists who insist that we’re just growing richer and happier with every passing year and pessimists who expect collapse any moment, Douthat provides an enlightening diagnosis of the modern condition—how we got here, how long our age of frustration might last, and how, whether in renaissance or catastrophe, our decadence might ultimately end.

Review

“Clever and stimulating . . . Informative and well balanced . . . [An] intriguing theological-political idea.”

—**Mark Lilla, *The New York Times Book Review***

“Well-timed . . . This is a young man’s book. Douthat can see our sclerotic institutions clearly because his vision is not distorted by out-of-date memories from a more functional era. . . . Charming and persuasive.” —**Peter Thiel for *First Things***

“A scintillating diagnosis of social dysfunctions . . . His analysis is full of shrewd insights couched in elegant, biting prose. . . . The result is a trenchant and stimulating take on latter-day discontents.” —

Publishers Weekly (starred review)

“Ross Douthat is the rare pundit who has managed to keep his head through the ideological turbulence of recent times — and his new book grows out of his characteristic equanimity and good sense.” — **Damon Linker, *The Week***

“Douthat’s best book yet, a work of deep cultural analysis, elegantly written and offering provocative thoughts on almost every page. It’s hard to think of a current book that is as insightful about the way we live now as is this one.” —**Rod Dreher, *The American Conservative***

“It is a testament to [Douthat's] singular skill and wisdom, then, that he has written so thoughtful and compelling a book that bemoans the end of progress. *The Decadent Society* is Douthat at his best—clever, considered, counterintuitive, and shot through with insight about modern America.” —***The Washington Free Beacon***

"Ambitious and entertaining." —***Financial Times***

"A convincing argument." —***The National Review***

Praise for *To Change the Church*:

"High-minded cultural criticism, concise, rhetorically agile, lit up by Douthat's love for the Roman Catholic Church . . . An adroit, perceptive, gripping account . . . It's strong stuff, conversationally lively and expressive." —***The New York Times Book Review***

"Erudite and thought-provoking . . . Weaves a gripping account of Vatican politics into a broader history of Catholic intellectual life to explain the civil war within the church . . . Douthat manages in a slim volume what most doorstep-size, more academic church histories fail to achieve: He brings alive the Catholic 'thread that runs backward through time and culture, linking the experiences of believers across two thousand years.' He helps us see that Christians have wrestled repeatedly with the same questions over the past two millennia." —***The Washington Post***

Contents
Introduction: The Closing of the Frontier
PART I
THE FOUR HORSEMEN
1 Stagnation
2 Sterility
3 Sclerosis
4 Repetition
PART 2

SUSTAINABLE DECADENCE

5 Comfortably Numb

6 A Kindly Despotism

7 Waiting for the Barbarians

8 Giving Decadence Its Due

PART 3

THE DEATHS OF DECADENCE

9 Catastrophe

10 Renaissance

11 Providence

Acknowledgments

Index

The Closing of the Frontier

The peak of human accomplishment and daring, the greatest single triumph of modern science and government and industry, the most extraordinary endeavor of the American age in modern history, occurred in late July in the year 1969, when a trio of human beings were catapulted up from the earth's surface, where their fragile, sinful species had spent all its long millennia of conscious history, to stand and walk and leap upon the moon.

"Four assassinations later," wrote Norman Mailer of the march from JFK's lunar promise to its Nixon-era fulfillment, "a war in Vietnam later; a burning of Black ghettos later; hippies, drugs and many student uprisings later; one Democratic Convention in Chicago seven years later; one New York school strike later; one sexual revolution later; yes, eight years of a dramatic, near-catastrophic, outright spooky decade later, we were ready to make the moon." We were ready—as though the leap into space were linked, somehow, to the civil rights revolution, the baby boomers coming into their own, the transformation in music and manners and mores, and the hopes of utopia percolating in Paris, Woodstock, San Francisco.

Mailer's was a mystical take on history, but one well suited to its moment. For the society that made it happen, the Apollo landing was both a counterpoint to the social chaos of the 1960s and the culmination of the decade's revolutionary promise. It proved that the efficiency and techno-optimism of Eisenhower-era America could persist through the upheavals of the counterculture, and it represented a kind of mystical, dizzy, Age of Aquarius moment in its own right. As much as anything that happened here on earth, the fire on the moon helped make the summer of '69 seem like a beginning, not a peak—an opening into a new era, in which the frontier would no longer be closed, the map no longer filled in, and human beings would expand their explorations, their empires, their arguments and imaginations and ambitions into the very stars.

This was the space age, which lasted for about thirty years: from Sputnik in 1957 to the space shuttle Challenger explosion in 1986. And we who live in its aftermath have forgotten just how confidently it was expected to continue. In *The Heavens and the Earth: A Political History of the Space Age*, his

magisterial narrative of the period, Walter McDougall runs through the expert predictions of the 1960s and 1970s: that soon reusable spacecrafts would be constantly "ascending and descending like angels on Jacob's ladder" into space; that by the year 2000, both superpowers would have lunar colonies; that human missions to Mars would begin within a decade of the moon landing; that space would soon become the site of revolutions in energy production, weather control, and more. Likewise with Apollo-era pop culture: 2001: A Space Odyssey promised a manned mission to Jupiter in its eponymous year, while the timeline of the future on Star Trek assumed that space exploration and colonization would follow as naturally from the Apollo program as sailors and settlers had followed the course discovered by Columbus.

This dream did not quite die with Challenger, but it had lost adherents across the disappointingly earthbound seventies, and from the Reagan era onward, it became a fond and somewhat fantastical hope, invoked as a flourish by presidents seeking to inspire and pursued by the sort of eccentric billionaires who also invested in cryonics. As it became clear that we would not master the vastnesses of space as easily as explorers crossing the Atlantic, the public's attention waned, political support diminished, and science fiction lost its gee-whiz edge and turned dystopias. The movies especially began to treat the infinite spaces differently—as a zone of terrors where no one hears you scream (*Alien* and its imitators), a source of sinister invasions and a home of malignant demigods (the UFO craze, *The X-Files*), or as a purgatory to be escaped by a safe return to earth (*Apollo 13*, *Gravity*, *The Martian*, *Ad Astra*). Where *Trek* had confidently blended sixties liberalism with the frontier spirit of *Wagon Train*, its successors *Star Wars* and *Battlestar Galactica* were not even visions of the human future at all: they were dispatches from a stellar prehistory; a vision of far away or long ago.

Meanwhile, unmanned spaceflight expanded, robots reached distant worlds, astronomers discovered planets that might well be earthlike—but none of it kindled the popular imagination as the giant leap for mankind had done. For the most part, humanity had decided that whatever might be up there, it would probably remain indefinitely out of reach.

This resignation haunts our present civilization. Across human history, the most dynamic and creative societies have been almost inevitably expansionary, going outward from tribes and cities and nations to put their stamp upon a larger world. Sometimes this has meant settlement and sometimes conquest, sometimes it has meant missionary zeal, sometimes simply exploration for the sake of commerce and curiosity. In the case of the modern West, the first world civilization, it meant all of them: God and gold and glory, settler societies and farflung imperial rule, races to the poles and to the peaks, and the sprawl of roads and railways and steamship lines and airline routes and communication networks that bound the world's peripheries into a universal web.

"Behind institutions, behind constitutional forms and modifications, lie the vital forces that call these organs into life and shape them to meet changing conditions." The American historian Frederick Jackson Turner wrote those words in 1893, opining on how the idea and reality of the Western frontier shaped American history. There is a sense in which Turner's frontier thesis can be usefully applied to the entire modern project, whose institutions and forms and bedrock assumptions—the sense of historical

mission, the expectation of perpetual progress—have been ordered around the permanence of exploration, expansion, and discovery.

Indeed, because the deep forces of modern history—industrialization, political centralization, secularization—so often disrupted the rhythms of lives lived in stability and place and continuity, the ideology of exploration and discovery has been much more necessary than in many past civilizations, offering a new form of consolation to replace what faith and tribe and family and hierarchy had once supplied. In modernity, the former world is always passing away; the solidity of the past always melting into air. But the promise is that tomorrow will bring something new; that a better life is just a long sea voyage or wagon train away; that ours is an age of ever-unfolding wonders that more than compensate for what's been lost.

As the crimes committed by Western empires amply attest, this is a morally ambiguous way of ordering a civilization, and the peoples being "discovered" and displaced and sometimes exterminated have particular reasons to doubt that it represents any sort of high perfection. But an order animated by the dream of progress is now the order in which most human beings live and move and have their being, and the destination toward which all human societies seem to be advancing, including inhabitants of societies that were once victims of its ruthless logic. (There is no society more modern, further out on the edge of history, than the nation of Japan, which just seventy-five years ago was brought to its knees by a weapon that was as much an apotheosis of modernity's spirit of discovery as the moon landing.) From Ireland to sub-Saharan Africa, Amazonia to China, the great modern wave has rolled across cultures and regions and societies that seemed to preserve something premodern or hold something undiscovered in their hearts. And in the Western nations where it all began, it remains a central cultural assumption that unexplored frontiers and fresh discoveries and new worlds to conquer are not just desirable but the very point of life.

So it is a significant factor in our era's anxieties, in the sense of drift and stagnation and uncertainty with which this book is principally concerned, that the actual physical frontier has been closed for a generation or more—that for the first time since 1491, we have found the distances too vast and the technology too limited to take us to somewhere genuinely undiscovered, somewhere truly new. It is not a coincidence that the end of the space age has coincided with a turning inward in the developed world, a crisis of confidence and an ebb of optimism and a loss of faith in institutions, a shift toward therapeutic philosophies and technologies of simulation, an abandonment of both ideological ambition and religious hope.

Of course, this shift might have happened anyway, even if Mars were closer and more habitable or light-speed travel a more realistic possibility. The existence of a frontier does not guarantee that it will be a destination, and past civilizations have given up on exploration for essentially internal reasons, even when new horizons were very much in reach. (The abandonment of major sea voyages by China's Ming dynasty, in the same era as Columbus, did not come about because the world's oceans were too wide but because of the empire's changing intellectual fashions and political priorities.) Already when Neil Armstrong took his first small step, there were many voices making the case for the wastefulness of

NASA's voyages, for the pointlessness of "whitey on the moon," and some of the turn toward pessimism preceded the realization that we would not be sending astronauts to Jupiter by the year 2001. A great deal of post-1960s thought—postcolonial, environmentalist—is premised on the idea that Western expansion was mostly cancerous, and this critique has been extended even to the idea of galactic colonization, with the exact same sort of ideological language applied. When the nonagenarian space optimist Freeman Dyson wrote hopefully about stellar exploration in a 2016 issue of the *New York Review of Books*, three letter writers chastised him for not counting the ecological cost and warned that "a human-designed outer space 'teeming with life and action' sounds like a nightmare out of Joseph Conrad."

Still, sometimes this application of anti-imperialist and environmentalist ideas to space travel feels like a kind of excuse making—that like the fox in Aesop's fable, we enjoy telling ourselves that we wouldn't want the fruit anyway, or that eating it would be immoral, so as to soothe the pain of knowing that it's there but out of reach.

Either way, whether the closing of the stellar frontier somehow caused the West's post-1960s turn toward pessimism or simply interacted with trends already at work, it remains a turning point in the history of the modern world. Before Apollo, it was easy to imagine that "late" was a misnomer for our phase of modernity, that our civilization's story was really in its early days, that the earthbound empires of Europe and America were just a first act in a continuous drama of expansion and development.

Since Apollo, we have entered into decadence.

In our culture, the word decadence is used promiscuously but rarely precisely—which, of course, is part of its cachet and charm. The dictionary associates it with "having low morals and a great love of pleasure, money, fame, etc.," which seems far too nonspecific—Ebenezer Scrooge was immoral and money loving, but nobody would call him decadent—and with cultures "marked by decay or decline," which gets us a little closer but also leaves a great deal undefined. In political debates, it's often associated with a lack of resolution in the face of external threats—with Munich and Neville Chamberlain, with W. B. Yeats's line about the best lacking all conviction. In the popular imagination, it's often associated with sex and gluttony; if you shop for something decadent on Amazon, the search algorithm will mostly deliver pornographic romances and chocolate strawberries. It can be a term of approbation—"I love this cake, it's so decadent"—as well as disparagement; it can refer descriptively to a particular nineteenth-century aesthetic and philosophy; it can refer judgmentally to any style that the critic deems to represent a falling-off from a previous aesthetic high. It hints at exhaustion, finality—"the feeling, at once oppressive and exalting, of being the last of a series," in the words of the Russian poet Vyacheslav Ivanov—but a finality that hasn't yet arrived, so why not eat, drink, and be merry in the meantime?

In trying to distill a useful definition from all these associations, there's a tendency to end up with what might be called "higher" and "lower" understandings of decadence. The low definition, the one familiar from advertising and lazy cultural criticism, basically defines the term to mean "inordinately pleasurable experiences with food and sex and fashion"—from the extreme (orgies, bondage bars, opium dens) to

the rather less adventurous (four-star meals, weekends in Vegas)—and empties out the moral and the political elements entirely.

The high definition, on the other hand, tries to make the aesthetic and moral and political all fit together in a comprehensive civilizational indictment—in which moral decay goes hand in hand with overripe aestheticism and rampant hedonism, which in turn connects to a cowardly failure to make the sacrifices required to protect civilization from its enemies. This sort of decadence is an overture to a catastrophe in which the barbarians sweep in, the orgies are canceled, and the over decorated palaces are all put to the torch.

The problem with this definition is that history doesn't work that neatly. Neither the trajectory of morals nor aesthetics yields to simple

narratives of rise and fall, and their connection to political strength is likewise highly contingent. Empires can fall at the height of their political and cultural vigor if they face a potent-enough enemy, and cultures can give in to appetitive excesses without necessarily seeing their political stability undone. (It was more than four hundred years from Nero's reign to the actual fall of Rome.)

But there might be a useful middle ground: a definition of decadence that's neither empty of any judgment nor excessively deterministic. This definition would follow in the footsteps of the great cultural critic Jacques Barzun, who begins his massive survey of Western cultural history—titled, of course, *From Dawn to Decadence*—by passing a clinical judgment on our own era:

Borrowing widely from other lands, thriving on dissent and originality, the West has been the mongrel civilization par excellence. But in spite of patchwork and conflict, it has pursued characteristic purposes—that is its unity—and now these purposes, carried out to their utmost possibility, are bringing about its demise.

This sense of an ending, Barzun goes on, need not mean "stoppage or total ruin." And this will be crucial to my own argument in this book: that for all its association with decay and decline, a society can be decadent without necessarily being poised for any kind of collapse.

All that is meant by *Decadence* is "falling off." It implies in those who live in such a time no loss of energy or talent or moral sense. On the contrary, it is a very active time, full of deep concerns, but peculiarly restless, for it sees no clear lines of advance. The forms of art as of life seem exhausted; the stages of development have been run through. Institutions function painfully. Repetition and frustration are the intolerable result. Boredom and fatigue are great historical forces.

It will be asked, how does the historian know when *Decadence* sets in? By the open confessions of malaise.... When people accept futility and the absurd as normal, the culture is decadent. The term is not a slur; it is a technical label.

At the risk of being presumptuous, let me try to refine Barzun's definition a bit further. *Decadence*, deployed usefully, refers to economic stagnation, institutional decay, and cultural and intellectual exhaustion at a high level of material prosperity and technological development. It describes a situation

in which repetition is more the norm than innovation; in which sclerosis afflicts public institutions and private enterprises alike; in which intellectual life seems to go in circles; in which new developments in science, new exploratory projects, underdeliver compared with what people recently expected. And, crucially, the stagnation and decay are often a direct consequence of previous development. The decadent society is, by definition, a victim of its own significant success.

Now, all this—both Barzun's meditation and my own attempted definition—may still sound impossibly vague: Isn't "sclerosis" in the eye of the beholder? Who decides what constitutes "the absurd"?

But really it narrows things in quite useful ways. First, emphasizing the economic element limits the scope of decadence to societies that are actually stagnating in a measurable way and frees us from the habit of just associating decadence with anything we dislike in rich societies or with any age (Gilded, Jazz) of luxury, corruption, and excess. Emphasizing the decay of institutions, likewise, frees us from the trap of regarding an individual case—whether a Nero, or a Bill Clinton, or a Donald Trump—as a synecdoche for a civilization as a whole. Focusing on repetition in the cultural and intellectual realm frees us—well, a bit—from the problems of individual intellectual and aesthetic taste and lightens the obligation of deciding exactly which literary style or intellectual shift constitutes the tipping point into decadence.

In each case, the goal is to define decadence as something more specific than just any social or moral trend that you dislike. A society that generates a lot of bad movies need not be decadent; a society that just makes the same movies over and over again might be. A society run by the cruel and arrogant might not be decadent; a society where even the wise and good can't legislate might be. A poor or crime-ridden society isn't necessarily decadent; a society that's rich and peaceable but exhausted, depressed, and beset by flares of nihilistic violence looks closer to our definition.

Most important, the emphasis on stagnation means that we can talk about decadence without implying that some kind of collapse is necessarily looming on the horizon. It makes the word compatible with the reality of nondecadent civilizations falling in a historical heartbeat while decadent civilizations go on and on. It frees us from the assumption that there's some iron logic that links orgies in the capital to barbarian invasions on the frontier, weak-kneed leaders to bombed out cities, corruption in high places to wars that lay those high places low. It lets decadence be decadence without the implication that the "falling-off" leads inexorably to a truly catastrophic fall. And even if certain features of decadence do make a *Götterdämmerung* more likely, it leaves open the more optimistic possibility, with which this book concludes: that a decadent era could give way instead to a recovery of growth and creativity and purpose.

But my first goal in these pages will be to convince you that our society is, indeed, decadent; that my definition actually applies to the contemporary West over the last two generations and may apply soon to all the societies that are currently catching up to Europe and North America and East Asia. To many readers, this argument will seem counterintuitive: a definition of decadence that dealt only with excess and luxury and various forms of political sclerosis might fit our era, but the idea of an overall stagnation

or repetition—of late-modern civilization as a treadmill rather than a headlong charge—doesn't fit particularly well with many readings of the age in which we live. It seems in tension with the sense of constant acceleration, of vertiginous change, that permeates so much of early-twenty-first-century life—as well as with the jargon of our time, which from Davos, to Silicon Valley, to the roving tent-revivalism of TED Talks, retains a breathless faith that the world is changing at a pace that would put Thomas Edison and Samuel Morse to shame.

The question, though, is whether that jargon corresponds with reality anymore, or whether our sense of continued acceleration is now to some extent an illusion created by the Internet—the one area of clear technological progress in our era, but also a distorting filter on the world beyond your screen. The online age speeds up communication in ways that make events seem to happen faster than in the past, make social changes seem to be constantly cascading, and make the whole world seem like it exists next door to you—so that current history feels like a multicar pileup every time you check your Facebook feed or fire up Twitter. That pileup encourages a mood of constant anxiety about terrorism, ecocatastrophe and war, but it's also a perfect stage for all manner of techno-boosterism: the promise that artificial intelligence or large-scale genetic engineering or even immortality is just around the corner feels that much more compelling when it's showing up in a news alert or embedded video on your sleekly futuristic phone.

But when you look at the data rather than just the impression, there is a strong case that while the speed with which we experience events has quickened, the speed of actual change has not. Or at least not when it comes to the sort of change that really counts: growth and innovation, reform and revolution, aesthetic reinvention or religious ferment. These have not ceased, in developing countries especially: the Middle East's recent convulsions do not fit my definition of decadence, nor does China's explosive post-1980s growth. But in the developed world, they have slowed to a pace that looks more like stagnation the further you get from your iPhone, and the closer to reality.

This claim is counterintuitive, but it is not original. My diagnosis of our condition is a journalist's, and, as such, it owes debts to many more expert thinkers who will be quoted amply in the pages to come. Since the 2008 financial crisis and the Great Recession exposed almost a decade's worth of Western growth as an illusion, a diverse cast of economists and political scientists and other figures on both the left and the right have begun to talk about stagnation and repetition and complacency and sclerosis as defining features of this Western age: Tyler Cowen and Robert Gordon, Thomas Piketty and Francis Fukuyama, David Graeber and Peter Thiel, and many others.

This book is, in part, an attempt to synthesize their various perspectives into a compelling account of our situation. But it also weaves the social sciences together with observations on our intellectual climate, our popular culture, our religious moment, our technological pastimes, in the hopes of painting a fuller portrait of our decadence than you can get just looking at political science papers on institutional decay or an economic analysis of the declining rate of growth. And then it also looks ahead and tries to assess the stability and sustainability of our decadence, what it will mean for our society if it should continue, and how it might ultimately end.

This means that the writing of the book has inevitably been shadowed by the strange phenomenon of Donald Trump, and the larger populist irruptions in Europe and the United States. As a leader for a decadent age, Trump contains multitudes. He is both an embodiment of our society's distinctive vices and a would-be rebel against our torpor and repetition and disappointment; a figure who rose to power by attacking the system for its sclerosis while exploiting that same decadence to the very hilt. "Make America Great Again" is a precisely calibrated statement of what you might call reactionary futurism, a howl against a present that wasn't what was promised, the mixture of nostalgia and ambition that you would expect a decadent era to conjure up.

The question is whether in conjuring him up our politics have also revealed the underlying instability of our decadence; the possibility that rather than being stagnant but sustainable our system could decay much more swiftly into authoritarianism or collapse into simple chaos—or whether Trump is instead fundamentally more farcical than threatening; too decadent himself to be a real threat to the system; an example of Barzun's "futility and the absurd" brought to particularly vivid life.

Likewise with the larger populist moment in the West, the anxieties of the center, and the appeal of the illiberal fringes. Does this represent a real ideological crisis, a genuinely revolutionary moment, or is it just a kind of digital-age playacting in which young people dissatisfied with decadence pretend to be fascists and Marxists on the Internet, reenacting the 1930s and 1960s with fewer street fights and more memes?

A great deal depends upon the answer. No decadent period lasts forever; no decadent society leaves decadence behind in exactly the same way. But if we are to escape our own form without catastrophe, to have a renaissance without an intervening dark age, we need clarity about our basic situation; an end to both optimistic pretense and hysteria.

The truth of America and the West in the first decades of the twenty-first century, a truth that helped give us the Trump presidency but will still be an important truth when he is gone, is that we have not been hurtling anywhere—except maybe in a circle. Instead, we are aging, comfortable and stuck, cut off from the past and no longer optimistic about the future, spurning both memory and ambition while we await some saving innovation or revelation, burrowing into cocoons from which no chrysalis is likely to emerge, growing old unhappily together in the glowing light of tiny screens.

"What fascinates and terrifies us about the Roman Empire is not that it finally went smash," wrote W. H. Auden of the last world empire in its endless autumn, but rather that "it managed to last for four centuries without creativity, warmth, or hope."

"There was nothing left that could conquer Rome," G. K. Chesterton wrote on the same theme, "but there was also nothing left that could improve it.... It was the end of the world, and the worst of it was that it need never end."

Whether we are waiting for Christians or barbarians, a renaissance or the Singularity, the dilemma that Auden and Chesterton described is now not Rome's but ours. <>

THE BROKEN HEART OF AMERICA: ST. LOUIS AND THE VIOLENT HISTORY OF THE UNITED STATES by Walter Johnson [Basic Books, 9780465064267]

A searing portrait of the racial dynamics that lie inescapably at the heart of our nation, told through the turbulent history of the city of St. Louis.

From Lewis and Clark's 1804 expedition to the 2014 uprising in Ferguson, American history has been made in St. Louis. And as Walter Johnson shows in this searing book, the city exemplifies how imperialism, racism, and capitalism have persistently entwined to corrupt the nation's past.

St. Louis was a staging post for Indian removal and imperial expansion, and its wealth grew on the backs of its poor black residents, from slavery through redlining and urban renewal. But it was once also America's most radical city, home to anti-capitalist immigrants, the Civil War's first general emancipation, and the nation's first general strike -- a legacy of resistance that endures.

A blistering history of a city's rise and decline, **THE BROKEN HEART OF AMERICA** will forever change how we think about the United States.

Review

"When it comes to the history of racism and exclusion in the United States, St. Louis wasn't unique...what it was, Johnson says, was more extreme.... Johnson is a spirited and skillful rhetorician, juggling a slew of historical facts while never allowing the flame of his anger to dim.... As he ably shows, so much exploitation lies in the details."—**New York Times**

"*The Broken Heart of America* is an outraged dissection of a malignant pattern Johnson discerns in the way white St. Louis treated Native Americans and then Blacks.... Comprehensive and convincing in its particulars."—**Boston Globe**

"This book is a magisterial history of the emergence and development of racial capitalism and the rise and decline of American empire examined through the lens of St. Louis. The complex dynamics of eviction, extraction, and exploitation as well as resilience and resistance are laid bare from the indigenous city of Cahokia in the eleventh century (larger than then London) to St. Louis, a frontier post and later metropolis of the US western empire. From ruling class elites Thomas Hart Benton and Harland Bartholomew and oppositional artists Kate Chopin and Tef Poe to black and socialist insurgents, **THE BROKEN HEART OF AMERICA** tells the best story of America that we have in the spirit of W.E.B. Du Bois. Walter Johnson is one of our very few great US historians!"—**Cornel West**

"When it comes to understanding the power dynamics that sparked the Ferguson Uprising in St. Louis, this is absolutely the most important book you'll read. Walter Johnson has a Baldwin-esque ability to describe the raw emotions of Black life in the city. With stories heartbreaking yet riveting -- told by

someone brave enough to share them -- he exposes the history of white supremacy and capitalism, class struggle and race, and Black rebellions both before and after Ferguson. In the era of fake news and mock revolutions, this book is the truth."—**Tef Poe, musician, activist, and cofounder of Hands Up United**

"Walter Johnson's latest is a masterpiece that both haunts and inspires: at once a personal reckoning; a sweeping 200-year history of removal, racism, exclusion, and extraction; and a story that powerfully lifts up the human beings who, in 2014, stood together in Ferguson to demand accountability for the layered injustices that have so scarred not just one city -- but America itself."—**Heather Ann Thompson, Pulitzer Prize-winning author of Blood in the Water: The Attica Prison Uprising of 1971 and its Legacy**

"Walter Johnson has written a magisterial book. Using the sordid history of St. Louis, he weaves a tale of violence and betrayal -- a story of the removal of peoples and the taking of land by force and by zoning - - that helps the reader understand the glaring contradictions that define the United States today. Even the killing of Michael Brown in 2014 must be understood against the backdrop of the long history of greed, extraction, and racism that shaped the city of St. Louis and this country. **THE BROKEN HEART OF AMERICA** isn't a dispassionate treatment of historical facts: Johnson has written a searing history that matters deeply to him, a native son, and it should matter to all of us."—

Eddie S. Glaude, author of Begin Again: James Baldwin's America and Its Urgent Lessons for Our Own

"The thread that runs through this entire book is the historical relationship between US imperialism, Indian removal, and anti-Black racism. Although also a granular history of the city of St. Louis, **THE BROKEN HEART OF AMERICA** is a deep history of the United States' continental empire with St. Louis at the center of economic and military operations. This may be the most important book on US history you will read in your lifetime."—**Roxanne Dunbar-Ortiz, author of An Indigenous Peoples' History of the United States**

"Readers of **THE BROKEN HEART OF AMERICA** will never view the history of the region the same way again."—**St. Louis Post-Dispatch**

"An impressive mix of scholarly detail and anecdotal liveliness...Enlightening."—**American History**

CONTENTS

PROLOGUE: MAPPING THE LOSS

1 WILLIAM CLARK'S MAP

2 WAR TO THE ROPE

3 NO RIGHTS THE WHITE MAN IS BOUND TO RESPECT

4 EMPIRE AND THE LIMITS OF REVOLUTION

5 BLACK RECONSTRUCTION AND THE COUNTERREVOLUTION OF PROPERTY

6 THE BABYLON OF THE NEW WORLD
 7 THE SHAPE OF FEAR
 8 NOT POOR, JUST BROKE
 9 "BLACK REMOVAL BY WHITE APPROVAL"
 10 DEFENSIBLE SPACE
 11 HOW LONG?
 EPILOGUE: THE RIGHT PLACE FOR ALL THE WRONG REASONS
 ACKNOWLEDGMENTS
 NOTES
 INDEX

Excerpt: From the Lewis and Clark expedition to the police killing of Michael Brown in 2014 and the launching of Black Lives Matter, many of the events that we consider central to the history of the United States occurred in St. Louis. Much of this history is so well known that its midwestern origins have often seemed to historians to be beside the point. The Missouri Compromise, the Dred Scott case, and the western Indian wars; the East St. Louis Massacre in 1917, the Supreme Court decisions in the landmark civil rights cases *Shelley v. Kraemer* and *Jones v. Mayer* (housing), *Gaines v. Canada* (education), and *McDonnell-Douglas Corp. v. Green* (employment); the symbiosis of urban "redevelopment" by bulldozer, the sequestration of poor Black people in housing projects (Pruitt-Igoe was the nation's most notorious), and white-flight suburbanization in the postwar period; the 1960s synthesis of anticommunism, COINTELPRO, and white nationalism into the Nixonian New Right and the militarization of policing: all of these events, and many others that are treated in this book, are aspects of the history of the United States that cannot be truly understood apart from their St. Louis roots.

Looking behind the curve of the received history, one finds the often forgotten radical history of St. Louis. The history of the city turns out to be less a matter of timeless midwestern conservatism than of reaction: to the consequential efforts of conquered, stigmatized, poor, and radical people to transform their lives and their society into the image of a fuller humanity. The first general emancipation of the Civil War occurred in St. Louis, where Joseph Weydemeyer, confidant and publisher of Karl Marx, was in charge of organizing the city's defense. The first general strike in the history of the United States, which briefly united Black and white workers in what historians have termed "the St. Louis Commune," occurred in the city in 1877. Through the 1930s and well into the Second World War, St. Louis was one of the most radical cities in the United States, and the Communist Party in St. Louis was an important site of radical interracial organizing. Indeed, through both the period of the civil rights movement and after, the Black freedom struggle in St. Louis was distinguished by its focus on economic issues jobs, housing, and a just social wage. From the successful strike at Funsten Nut and sit-ins at city hall in 1933 to one of the nation's first rent strikes in Pruitt-Igoe in 1969, Black women from St. Louis have been at the leading edge of the radical history of the United States. Seen in the light of this history, there is nothing uncanny about the fact that the uprising that touched off the most recent wave of Black radical organizing—the Michael Brown moment in American history—happened in St. Louis.

Historians have traditionally treated St. Louis as a representative city, a city that is, at once, east and west, north and south. The place where the various regional histories of the United States come together. The "gateway" to the West, the "American confluence," a "northern city with a southern exposure," and so on. This book makes a more pointed claim: that St. Louis has been the crucible of American history—that much of American history has unfolded from the juncture of empire and anti-Blackness in the city of St. Louis.

The city of St. Louis rose as the morning star of US imperialism. It was from St. Louis, itself a city built on stolen land, that Meriwether Lewis and William Clark departed on the journey to survey the commercial potential of the vast Louisiana Purchase Territory, the homeland of dozens of nations that had not been party to the bargain. It was from there that Clark later supervised the forcible relocation—the ethnic cleansing—of the tribes of the Upper Midwest. And it was from St. Louis that the genocidal Indian wars of the late nineteenth century were staged and supervised. For most of the period before the Civil War, the US Army's Department of the West was headquartered at Jefferson Barracks; for a time after, the entire Department of War was relocated to St. Louis. By 1870, St. Louis was the fourth-largest city in the United States, and there was talk of moving the nation's capital to the world-making confluence of the Missouri and Mississippi Rivers. Although the US military footprint in St. Louis lightened over the course of the twentieth century, military contracting remained integral to the economy of both city and country through most of that century. It is not possible to tell the story of St. Louis without including the US Cartridge Company, McDonnell-Douglas, Monsanto, and Mallinckrodt. Behind the story of the rise and demise of the city of St. Louis lies a much more complicated history of continental and even global distributions of violence.

The imperium of St. Louis (and thus of the United States) is centrally framed by the history of genocide, removal, and the expropriation and control of land—all justified in the name of white supremacy. In his 1920 essay "The Souls of White Folk," written in the years following his visit to East St. Louis in the immediate aftermath of the 1917 massacre, W.E.B. Du Bois provided the outline that I have followed in this book. Racism, he argued, was as old as humanity: "Ever have men striven to conceive of their victims as different from the victors, endlessly different, in soul and blood, strength and cunning, race and lineage." The exploitation of one group by another, too, was "quite as old as the world." But their combination in the conquest of the Americas and the slave trade was something new, something unprecedented, something world-making. "The imperial width of the thing,—the heaven-defying audacity—makes its modern newness." Using a term I draw from the work of the political philosopher and social theorist Cedric Robinson, I present the history that follows—all the way from the slave trade and the Indian wars down to the murder of Michael Brown and the uprising in Ferguson—as part of the history of "racial capitalism": the intertwined history of white supremacist ideology and the practices of empire, extraction, and exploitation. Dynamic, unstable, everchanging, and world-making.'

At bottom, the history of racial capitalism has been one in which white supremacy justified the terms of imperial dispossession and capitalist exploitation. Thus has it been possible to expropriate Native American lands on the grounds that they were empty—terra nullius. Thus has it been possible to justify slavery in a republic founded under the rubric of equality. Thus has it been possible to maintain a

distinction between the deserving and the undeserving poor; between the victims of economic downturns and those who lack the personal responsibility to keep up; and between the "real Americans" and "our traditions" and the people who don't respect the country, its past, and the flag. And importantly, thus has it been possible to make poor and working-class white people believe that their interests lie in making common cause with their political leaders and economic betters. Common cause in whiteness: the idea that they might eventually share in the spoils, and the understanding that the discomforts and anxieties of their own precarious lives were due to—are due to—those below them rather than those above them. As the historian Robin D. G. Kelley suggests, guns and tanks and tear gas are sufficient to control the Black people (or, for that matter, the Indians and immigrants); white supremacy is necessary to control the white people.

Critical analysis of capitalism often centers on the ways in which profits are generated, distributed, and concentrated in the form of intergenerational wealth. But can the same be said for this analysis's understanding of "spoils," which must also be generated, but far more widely distributed in order to socially and politically maintain the system? An important strand of the argument in this book traces the promises made to poor and working-class white people—some kept, some broken—in order to keep them committed to social order, that is, to history in the service of empire and capital: to war in the name of white homesteads; to low wages subsidized by segregation; and to social isolation and cultural monotony understood as suburban exclusivity.

Beyond even the function of white supremacy in underwriting expropriation and exploitation, however, the notion of racism and capitalism as organically related but not identical helps us understand the excessive pleasures of white supremacy: the joyful mob in East St. Louis in 1917 (it was "like Mardi Gras," one observer remembered); the dumb grins on the faces of the lynch mobs, mugging for the camera in front of the body of the lynched man; the rage of the five thousand St. Louis whites who rioted after some Black kids jumped into the pool on the first day of the summer season in Fairgrounds Park in 1949; the masculine fellowship of the St. Louis police in the 1960s as they traded stories about beating up Sonny Liston, the onetime heavyweight champion of the world; and all the torture and violation by which white people have historically drawn pleasure from the suffering of Blacks.

On the other hand, analysis through the lens of racial capitalism helps us understand that the disciplinary tools and predatory takings originally justified by imperial and racial entitlement come eventually to be deployed against the working class as a whole; the insistent generalization of the tools of empire and anti-Blackness, what Achille Mbembe calls the paradoxical "Negrofication" of the white world. Tracing the United States' centuries-long history of imperial dispossession and relating it to the foreclosure crisis of our own times, the legal historian and theorist K Sue Park suggests that the forms of military, social, and financial control pioneered in empire and slavery (and justified by racialization) were eventually adapted and absorbed, in race-neutral form, into general practice.

"Labor cannot emancipate itself in the white skin where in the Black it is branded," Karl Marx wrote in *Capital*. Beneath their skin privilege, poor and working-class whites have often found (although not always recognized) that the very tools the wealthy rely upon to ensure class rule—the police, the

prison, the reduction of the social wage, and the derogation of public education—come eventually to foreshorten dreams of everyone, not just the radicalized, the marginalized, and the imperialized. In the fall of 1966, following the previous year's fury in the Black neighborhoods in St. Louis over the police murder of Melvin Cravens, a seventeen-year-old boy shot to death while handcuffed in a police station, the Black activists Macler Shepard and Ivory Perry organized a march in solidarity with Southside whites mourning the death of Timothy Walsh, a young white shot in the back while in police custody. The license to kill, they were saying, has been issued in our neighborhood, but it can be carried into yours. The cover of whiteness, it turns out, offers incomplete protection from the violence unleashed in its own name.

THE BROKEN HEART OF AMERICA: ST. LOUIS AND THE VIOLENT HISTORY OF THE UNITED STATES traces the history of empire and racial capitalism through a series of stages, beginning with the fur trade in the early nineteenth century and following all the way down to payday lending, tax abatement, for-profit policing, and mass incarceration in our own times. These stages should not be understood as pure forms, nor as having unfolded according to a strict sequential historical logic. These improvised solutions to imperial problems and commercial imperatives have been mixed up with one another and with other ideas about identity and economy. They each have characteristic spatial and environmental aspects. And the stages of empire and racial capitalism were repeatedly interrupted and confronted, and occasionally even overthrown, by the people whom they so insistently dispossessed, ravaged, and repurposed in the service of empire, whiteness, and wealth.

And yet, beneath all the change, an insistent racial capitalist cleansing—forced migrations and racial removal, reservations and segregated neighborhoods, genocidal wars, police violence, and mass incarceration—is evident in the history of the city at the heart of American history. Viewed from St. Louis, the history of capitalism in the United States seems to have as much to do with eviction and extraction as with exploitation and production. History in St. Louis unfolded at the juncture of racism and real estate, of the violent management of population and the speculative valuation of property. The first to be forced out were Native Americans, who were pushed west and killed off by settlers and the US military. But in St. Louis the practices of removal and containment that developed out of the history of empire in the West were generalized into mechanisms for the dispossession and management of Black people within the city limits. And because removal is fundamentally about controlling the future, about determining what sorts of people will be allowed to live in what sorts of places, it is always concerned with the control of gender, sexuality, and reproduction; often women and children are singled out for particular sanction and targeted violence."

From the time of the Missouri Compromise through the decision in the Dred Scott case, whites in St. Louis used Indian removal as much as slavery as the model for dealing with their Black neighbors. And from that time on, Black St. Louisans have been repeatedly driven out: from East St. Louis in 1917; from the riverfront, Deep Morgan, Chestnut Valley, and Mill Creek Valley in the middle years of the century; from Pruitt-Igoe in 1972; and from whatever neighborhoods were wanted for "economic development" down to the present day. To be sure, eviction (like extraction and even exploitation) has meant different things at various historical moments. And yet the continuity between St. Louis's role as the gateway to

empire and the twenty-first-century project of enclosing Black communities in the hope of a final round of extraction only underscores the point that in St. Louis empire, slavery, and segregation have been distinct aspects of a single common history. The red thread that runs through this entire book is the historical relationship between imperialism and anti-Blackness.

In the aftermath of the murder of Michael Brown on August 9, 2014, and the uprising that followed, the term "structural racism" gained renewed currency as a way to understand the depth of the history that was exploding into plain view across the nation. Part of the work of this book is to try to lend meaning to that phrase—to take us beyond using it to mean simply really bad or really persistent racism and begin to understand the ways in which racism has been built into the material fabric of daily life in the United States—into our roads and neighborhoods and schools and universities. The point of identifying racism as structural is not to just say it is really bad (or still less to say that it is so bad that we can't really do anything about it anyway and so should just go on doing whatever we're doing). The point is to search out the material history of white supremacy and the alibis in which it has been cloaked in order to understand something about structural racism that isn't otherwise visible: the way the racial character of our everyday lives has become inexorable, even as its origins have been insistently obscured. Any program intending to address economic inequality in our society—whether revolutionary or reformist—that fails to grapple with the racialized character of our material lives will likely intensify rather than ameliorating it.

For the sake of example, one might point to various sorts of racism evident in the social postmortem that followed the uprising in Ferguson in the fall of 2014. Most telling for many was the discovery of the persistent attitudinal racism of the white police and court clerks in Ferguson, who were shown to have had a particular fondness for hackneyed racial humor. That attitudinal racism shaded imperceptibly into the institutional racism of the police department as a whole, manifested in the disproportionate targeting of Black motorists and street level harassment of Black pedestrians; shoddy record-keeping and routinely ignored training protocols; and the systematic levy, through excessive tickets and exorbitant fines, whereby the subsistence of the government of Ferguson was extracted from its mostly Black population by its almost entirely white police force. All of this was amply documented in the US Department of Justice's report on the Ferguson Police Department."

What the report passed over, however, was the structural aspect of the racism: Why was the police department revenue-farming poor Black motorists when there was a Fortune 500 company, doing \$25 billion of business a year, headquartered just a quarter-mile to the south of the spot where Officer Darren Wilson shot Michael Brown? And how could that seem so natural that the corporate headquarters of Emerson Electric on West Florissant Avenue, right there where the demonstrators first sat down in the street and the militarized police rioted through the month of August, would go almost unremarked upon in the thousands of pages and millions of words written in the aftermath?

The twelve shots fired by Officer Wilson on Canfield Drive ended the life of an eighteen-year-old child and touched off a new period in the history of the United States—the era of Black Lives Matter. This

book explores the two-hundred-year history of removal, racism, and resistance that flowed through the two minutes of confrontation on August 9, 2014.

I began writing this book in the months after that event. In the days after the shooting, activists in St. Louis took to the streets of Ferguson demanding that Officer Wilson (whose name was initially withheld) be held accountable. Police in St. Louis County and then the Missouri Highway Patrol and eventually the Missouri National Guard responded on a scale and with a ferocity that many observers found wildly disproportionate. Armored personnel carriers patrolled the streets of Ferguson. Police armed with automatic weapons occupied the city. Peaceful protesters were repeatedly dispersed with tear gas--a chemical weapon banned under the Geneva Convention. By the end of November, when the now-notorious prosecutor Robert McCulloch announced his decision not to bring charges against Officer Wilson, the protests exploded into violence and "Ferguson" had become a byword for both police violence and the origins of what would come to be called the Black Lives Matter movement.

Having grown up just two hours to the west, I had been to St. Louis countless times to visit family, to go to the universities or the museums, even to do historical research for other books I have written. I came to this book less as a professional historian than as a citizen taking the measure of a history that I had lived through but not yet fully understood. This is a history that I have resisted, but also a history from which I have benefited, as a white man and a Missourian. I offer the result, not in the spirit of academics' too-common conceit that injustice is everywhere but in their own biographical backyards, but rather in the hope that we may all seek to do better—to walk humbly, to act justly, to love mercy.

<>

THE BETRAYAL OF THE DUCHESS: THE SCANDAL THAT UNMADE THE BOURBON MONARCHY AND MADE FRANCE MODERN by Maurice Samuels [Basic Books, 9781541645455]

Fighting to reclaim the French crown for the Bourbons, the duchesse de Berry faces betrayal at the hands of one of her closest advisors in this dramatic history of power and revolution.

The year was 1832 and the French royal family was in exile, driven out by yet another revolution. From a drafty Scottish castle, the duchesse de Berry -- the mother of the eleven-year-old heir to the throne -- hatched a plot to restore the Bourbon dynasty. For months, she commanded a guerilla army and evaded capture by disguising herself as a man. But soon she was betrayed by her trusted advisor, Simon Deutz, the son of France's Chief Rabbi. The betrayal became a cause célèbre for Bourbon loyalists and ignited a firestorm of hate against France's Jews. By blaming an entire people for the actions of a single man, the duchess's supporters set the terms for the century of antisemitism that followed.

Brimming with intrigue and lush detail, **THE BETRAYAL OF THE DUCHESS** is the riveting story of a

high-spirited woman, the charming but volatile young man who double-crossed her, and the birth of one of the modern world's most deadly forms of hatred.

Review

"The Duchess of Berry's story is enthralling, and Mr. Samuels tells it well. His epigraph is taken from the Memoirs of the *Comtesse de Boigne*: 'A new Walter Scott will have a difficult time finding a more poetic subject than the expedition of Madame la duchesse de Berry.' Absolutely."—**Wall Street Journal**

"Maurice Samuels's account of the improbable and riveting story of the duchesse de Berry is both deeply researched and elegantly written. But this triumphant work provides much more than a narrative of civil war and treachery; it also interweaves dazzling insight into deeply relevant issues including the genesis of French (and European) antisemitism."—**Andrew S. Curran, author of *Diderot and the Art of Thinking Freely***

"The duchesse de Berry raises an army to restore the Bourbon monarchy. Her advisor, a charming Jewish convert named Simon Deutz, sells her out to the government, and her plot fails. A flood of literature follows -- from Hugo, Chateaubriand, Dumas. And then, mysteriously, the Deutz affair disappears from modern memory. It took someone with Maurice Samuels's psychological and political insights, his astonishing research, and his gift for story telling, to bring to life the true origin story of modern anti-Semitism, sixty years before the Dreyfus affair. A thriller, a non-fiction novel of palace intrigue, full of outrageous characters and theatrical scenes, Samuels's *The Betrayal of the Duchess* speaks of passions and prejudices uncannily suited to our own times."—**Alice Kaplan, author of *Looking for The Stranger and Dreaming in French and the John M. Musser Professor of French, Yale University***

"This timely history -- impeccably researched and engagingly told -- relates the failed royalist coup of the Bourbon princess Caroline, duchesse de Berry. Highlighting the involvement of her Jewish-turned-Catholic co-conspirator, Simon Deutz, Maurice Samuels shows how this episode crystallized an ideology of antisemitism that has pervaded French society, with disastrous results, ever since."—**Caroline Weber, author of *Proust's Duchess and Queen of Fashion***

"With a knack for narration and deep knowledge of the times, Maurice Samuels excavates a scandal of lost causes and the new hatreds that grow in their place. It is at once a gripping account of individuals, a portrait of an age, and a history that speaks to us, hauntingly, in our own troubled present."—**Darrin M. McMahon, author *Divine Fury and Mary Brinsmead Wheelock Professor of History, Dartmouth College***

"A colorful history of the duchesse de Berry's failed attempt to restore the Bourbon dynasty to the French throne... Samuels delivers a spirited and comprehensive account of this lesser-known drama and draws insightful parallels to anti-Semitism within modern-day reactionary movements. Armchair

historians will be delighted."—***Publishers Weekly***

"Treachery, disguise, capture, and imprisonment—the scandal surrounding an ill-fated 19th-century French insurrection—is all the more captivating in this factual retelling... Recommended for readers of Victor Hugo, Alexandre Dumas, and 19th-century French history and literature."—***Library Journal***

- Contents
- Bourbon Family Tree
- Map of the Vendée
- Introduction
- PART ONE: THE DUCHESS
- Chapter 1 The Volcano's Edge
- Chapter 2 A Parisian Education
- PART TWO: THE CONVERT
- Chapter 3 A Modern Jew
- Chapter 4 Apostasy
- PART THREE: THE CAMPAIGN
- Chapter 5 Exile
- Chapter 6 The Meeting
- Chapter 7 The Tightrope Walker
- Chapter 8 Civil War
- PART FOUR: THE ARREST
- Chapter 9 Hiding
- Chapter 10 The Search
- Chapter 11 Into the Fire
- PART FIVE: THE SCANDAL
- Chapter 12 Surrender
- Chapter 13 The Illustrious Captive
- Chapter 14 A Second Judas
- Chapter 15 Aftershocks
- Coda Memory
- Acknowledgments
- Image Credits
- A Note on Sources
- Notes
- Index

Excerpt: At half past five on the evening of November 6, 1832, police raided a house in a quiet residential enclave of Nantes, the largest city in France's western region. Shoving past frightened servants, they moved methodically from room to room, overturning beds and rifling through wardrobes as twelve hundred soldiers—two entire army regiments—filed into the dark cobblestone streets below to make sure that nobody could escape out the back. They were searching for the duchesse de Berry, the most wanted woman in France.

The mother of the heir to the throne, she had been forced into exile with the rest of the Bourbon royal family after the Revolution of 1830, only to return two years later to launch a bloody civil war. Her dream was to reconquer the kingdom for her eleven-year-old son. All through the spring she had commanded a guerrilla army in a series of battles against the government, but by the early summer she was on the run. And now, after six months of evading capture, the luck of the four-foot-seven duchess was coming to an end.

The police had been tipped off by the duchess's confidant, a seductive yet volatile man named Simon Deutz. He had pledged undying loyalty to her cause, then turned against her once it appeared that her campaign would fail. For a large cash reward, he had agreed to lead the police to her hiding place in Nantes. But when the agents forced their way into the house, the duchess was nowhere to be found.

Just minutes before, she had slipped into a secret closet behind the fireplace in the attic. Created during the Reign of Terror to save priests from the guillotine, the closet was so small that the duchess and her three accomplices could barely stand up straight and there was not an inch of space between them. Praying for a miracle, she tried not to move while the agents sounded the walls and knocked holes in the roof. She could hear the police commissioner cursing on the other side of the thin partition as he ordered his men to reduce the house to rubble in their efforts to find her.

After sixteen hours, the agents were about to give up the search when one of the soldiers standing guard in the room decided to light a fire. As the secret compartment filled with smoke and the walls glowed red with heat, the duchess did her best to endure the torment. Eventually, though, the trapdoor to the fireplace opened, and out crawled the tiny, soot-covered rebel. Straightening her scorched dress and shielding her eyes from the light, she declared in the most regal manner she could summon: "I am the duchesse de Berry. You are French soldiers. I entrust myself to your honor!"

Though largely forgotten today, the betrayal of the duchess shocked the world at the time. It made international headlines and engrossed the public for months, all the more so when it emerged that the arrested duchess was pregnant, despite not having had a husband for over a decade. The case fascinated the leading writers of the day: François-René de Chateaubriand and Victor Hugo both wrote significant works about it, while Alexandre Dumas père, the author of *The Three Musketeers*, returned to the events surrounding the betrayal in a novel, a historical chronicle, his own memoirs, and a memoir that he ghostwrote for the general charged with suppressing the duchess's revolt.

Beyond its many obvious attractions—a glamorous heroine, a quixotic military campaign, an illicit romance, and a dramatic doublecross—the scandal had major repercussions for French history. It ended the hopes for another Bourbon restoration and helped stabilize the monarchy of Louis-Philippe, who had claimed the throne in 1830 but whose grip on it was still tenuous. But the case also had another, and perhaps even more far-reaching, effect: Simon Deutz had been born a Jew, and his betrayal of the duchess provoked modern France's first major outpouring of antisemitic hatred.

Historians often date the rise of modern antisemitism in France to the decade leading up to the Dreyfus Affair of the 1890s. This notorious case, in which a Jewish army officer was falsely accused of treason, is

considered a turning point in world history, the moment at which Theodor Herzl, the founder of the Zionist movement, claimed to have concluded that antisemitism made the dream of Jewish integration in Europe impossible. Yet the first real warning bell—the first signal that modernity would not necessarily be good for the Jews—had sounded some sixty years earlier, following the betrayal of the duchesse de Berry.

In 1832 the modern era was just beginning. Charles Darwin's HMS Beagle arrived in South America that year on the trip that would lay the foundation for his theory of evolution. A young lawyer named Abraham Lincoln was about to enter Illinois politics, and the start of Queen Victoria's long reign was a mere five years in the future. Recent innovations such as the telegraph were shrinking the world while also speeding it up. Railroads would soon carry passengers between distant cities faster than anyone thought possible.

The changes associated with the birth of modernity gave rise to a great deal of social and political strife, and nowhere more so than in France. By 1832, the country had been fighting over the legacy of the French Revolution for fifty years. France was also in the throes of an industrial revolution that was no less momentous. The period's unrest was perhaps most vividly captured by Victor Hugo in his epic novel *Les Misérables*. Set largely in 1832, the novel's plot unfolds against the backdrop of a failed political uprising, as idealistic young students and starving workers fight to create a republic but are brutally repressed by the soldiers of King Louis-Philippe. What Hugo barely mentions is that at the same moment leftist firebrands were dying on the barricades, the French government was also attempting to suppress the right-wing revolt of the duchesse de Berry.

Louis-Philippe—from the Bourbons' rival dynasty, the Orléans—had claimed the throne from the duchess's son during the Revolution of 1830, and she wanted it back. She believed in the Bourbons' divine right to rule, but she also believed that only France's traditional monarchs—and their ally the Catholic Church—could restore stability to a country fractured by revolutionary upheaval. By fighting to bring about yet another Bourbon restoration, the duchess seemed to promise a return to a simpler, better world—a world of religious duties and feudal privileges in which everyone knew their place. This was the key to the force she exerted on those who were engaged in the century-long battle against the French Revolution and the political and economic modernization that it unleashed. Like her idol Joan of Arc, the duchess proposed her own heroic persona as an antidote to the troubles of her time.

Her betrayal by Simon Deutz turned her into a martyr instead. In the aftermath of her arrest a legend took shape among the duchess's supporters in which the betrayal became a symbol for the evils that had been ushered in by the French Revolution. This legend was powerful because it told a simple story: a Jew had betrayed the mother of France's rightful king. The story transformed resistance to modernity into a passion play with the Jew as villain and, in so doing, helped make antisemitism a key feature of right-wing ideology in France. Hatred of Jews, of course, predates modernity. Antisemites have always attempted to define who they were by turning the Jew into the embodiment of what they were not. The biblical figure of Judas, the betrayer of Christ, reflects the way that ancient Christians already saw the Jew as corrupt and treacherous. But by the time of the Dreyfus Affair at the end of the nineteenth

century, antisemitism had come to mean much more. The Right had turned the Jew into a symbol of everything they were fighting against, from industrialization to cosmopolitanism, secularism to revolution. The betrayal of the duchesse de Berry marks a key stage in this transition, the moment at which modern stereotypes of the Jew crystallized in the popular imagination. Simon Deutz represents a bridge between old and new forms of antisemitism. He is the missing link between Judas and Dreyfus.

This book is rooted in history, anchored in a specific time and place. But it also has contemporary relevance. With deindustrialization now taking place in much of the West and globalization concentrating wealth ever more intensely, our own moment is experiencing a transformation similar in scale to that of France in the 1830s. And some of those who feel displaced by changes still blame the disruption on Jews and other minorities.

That certain protesters—in France, the United States, and around the world—have turned antisemitic should come as no surprise. Opponents of modernity have projected their fears and anxieties about change onto Jews since the beginning of the nineteenth century. Nor should the antisemitism of radical Islamist movements startle us: they too are at war with modernity, much like the conservative Catholics in the duchess's time. The specifics have changed, but many of the fundamental features that govern how antisemitic hatred operates have not. People still tell stories about Jewish treachery. They still consume paranoid plots to assuage their fears and explain their failures. The discourse of modern antisemitism still performs much the same function for reactionaries and populists today as it did in the 1830s. Resurrecting the forgotten story of Simon Deutz's betrayal of the duchesse de Berry sheds light on this discourse by revealing how it first took shape.

But why does it need resurrecting? If it had such a profound effect on the formation of right-wing ideology and on the development of antisemitism, why has the betrayal of the duchess faded from memory? Historians have perhaps been reluctant to examine the betrayal in recent years because of its unsettling nature. Unlike Dreyfus, who was a model victim, or at least a blameless one, Deutz was actually guilty of betrayal. Even more disturbingly, the duchess's uncommon heroism and alluring wit risk eliciting sympathy for her reactionary politics. The story lacks the clear moral guideposts that make the Dreyfus Affair such a satisfying tale of justice triumphing over prejudice. It offers no "J'Accuse!" moment, no cause for righteous indignation. But this moral ambiguity should not deter us from studying the case; on the contrary, the betrayal of the duchess merits attention precisely because of its ambiguity. It is in the gray areas, the shadows, that history has the most to teach us. <>

AMERICAN PROPHETS: THE RELIGIOUS ROOTS OF PROGRESSIVE POLITICS AND THE ONGOING FIGHT FOR THE SOUL OF THE COUNTRY by Jack Jenkins [HarperOne, 9780062935984]

From one of the country's most respected religion reporters, a paradigm-shifting discussion of how the Religious Left is actually the moral compass that has long steered America's political debates, including today.

Since the ascendancy of the Religious Right in the 1970s, common wisdom holds that it is a coalition of fundamentalist powerbrokers who are the "moral majority," setting the standard for conservative Christian values and working to preserve the status quo.

But, as national religion reporter Jack Jenkins contends, the country is also driven by a vibrant, long-standing moral force from the left. Constituting an amorphous group of interfaith activists that goes by many names and takes many forms, this coalition has operated since America's founding — praying, protesting, and marching for common goals that have moved society forward. Throughout our history, the Religious Left has embodied and championed the progressive values at the heart of American democracy—abolition, labor reform, civil rights, environmental preservation.

Drawing on his years of reporting, Jenkins examines the re-emergence of progressive faith-based activism, detailing its origins and contrasting its goals with those of the Religious Right. Today's rapidly expanding interfaith coalition—which includes Christians, Jews, Muslims, Buddhists, and other faiths—has become a force within the larger "resistance" movement. Jenkins profiles Washington political insiders—including former White House staffers and faith outreach directors for the campaigns of Barack Obama, John Kerry, and Hillary Clinton—as well as a new generation of progressive faith leaders at the forefront today, including:

- Rev. William Barber II, leader of North Carolina's Moral Mondays and co-chair of the nationwide Poor People's campaign
- Linda Sarsour, co-chair of the Women's March
- Rev. Traci Blackmon, a pastor near Ferguson, Missouri who works to lift up black liberation efforts across the country
- Sister Simone Campbell, head of the Catholic social justice lobby and the "Nuns on the Bus" tour organizer
- Native American "water protectors" who demonstrated against the Dakota Access Pipeline in Standing Rock
- Bishop Gene Robinson, the first openly gay Episcopal bishop

An exciting reevaluation of America's moral center and an inspiring portrait of progressive faith-in-action, *American Prophets* will change the way we think about the intersection of politics and religion.

Review

"Jenkins is my go-to source when I want a snapshot of what's happening in the American religious landscape... demonstrating how a vibrant and undeterred Religious Left has filled the moral vacuum with an unapologetically progressive agenda promoting peace, pluralism, and human dignity for all." (**Reza Aslan, author of *Zealot: The Life and Times of Jesus of Nazareth***)

"A master storyteller." (**Brian D McLaren, author of *The Great Spiritual Migration and A New Kind of Christianity***)

"Illuminating . . . [A] thoroughly reported and . . . revelatory history about the intersection of progressive politics and religion in America." (**Publishers Weekly**)

"Delves deeply into the origins, activities, and leadership of the Religious Left . . . highlighting the widespread—though not always widely recognized—role that progressive faith communities have long held in political and social causes. . . . A well-researched and timely work of journalism." (**Kirkus Reviews**)

"American Prophets offers a fresh viewpoint that would not likely be noticed without the careful attention and study Jenkins put into his research, and it offers hope to those who may be experiencing dismay at the current political scene in this country." (**New York Journal of Books**)

"Jenkins proves an able and engaging guide through all of these progressive movements. He approaches his subject through the personal stories of those intimately involved in the efforts he explores, and readers will see in his telling the human dimension of these broader justice campaigns." (**National Catholic Reporter**)

"A contemporary 'Lives of the Saints'—a series of profiles of admirable leftist activists whose politics are motivated by their faith. . . . The problem isn't that there has not yet been a potent religious left; it's that the 'religious' part is too often left out." (**The New Yorker**)

"For those who find the Religious Right suffocating, American Prophets will be balm to the soul. Jenkins describes a prophetic voice that encompasses a pro-life view for all humanity and family values for all sorts of families." (**Spectrum Magazine**)

"Jenkins helps us see the other part of that story: the faith-driven struggle by Jews, Muslims, Christians, Buddhists, Earth-centered religionists, and "nones" as well, to write a new and more hopeful chapter in our communal life." (**The Progressive**)

Contents
Introduction
ONE Faith in Public Life
TWO The Personal Is Political—and Spiritual
THREE When God Chooses a Leader

FOUR Revolutionary Love
FIVE Keepers of the Story
SIX Welcoming the Stranger
SEVEN Creation Care
EIGHT Prophets over Profits
NINE The Hard Work of Transformation
TEN Troubled Waters
ELEVEN The New God Gap
TWELVE The Future of Faith
Epilogue
Acknowledgments
Notes

Excerpt: I fiddled with my camera as I emerged from the Park Street T station in downtown Boston, ignoring the bluster of wind that swept across my face. I adjusted and readjusted the lens before turning the DSLR over, crossing the street as I flipped through an endless litany of settings crammed into its minuscule screen. I tinkered aimlessly while walking southeast from Boston Common toward the city's financial district, barely looking up as I sped past fellow pedestrians, clogged shopping centers, and the offices of Bank of America.

I was nervous.

My neurotic state was one well known to many reporters. It was 2011, and I was working on my first freelance assignment for Religion News Service, tasked with chasing down a religion angle in the Occupy Wall Street movement. As a native southerner, I never fully adjusted to the infamously frigid winters in Boston, where I was attending divinity school at the time. The ice and snow hadn't arrived yet, but I forgot my gloves that day, which was a problem: I was worried that any religious presence I found would be fleeting, and that I probably wouldn't be nimble enough to set up my camera in a crucial moment with my clumsy, frozen digits.

I was still anxious when I arrived at Dewey Square, home to Occupy Boston, the local branch of the rapidly expanding Occupy movement. I paused across the street from the encampment to take in the sight and catch my breath, bouncing on my toes and hugging myself to keep blood flowing. Feeling slightly warmer, I raised my camera to snap a photo of the sea of multicolored tents sprawled across a patch of green in the shadow of a nearby office building. Through my viewfinder I could see a hastily constructed protest camp bustling with activity: men and women, most of whom looked to be in their twenties, meandered a tangled web of walkways that snaked through the tent city. Some of them wore shirts or gripped signs of protest that championed "The 99%," a phrase I had heard chanted over and over at Occupy demonstrations across the country.

But as I lined up my shot, I didn't hear chants.

I heard hymns.

Dumbstruck, I shoved my camera back into its new case and wandered across the street and into the expanse of temporary structures, following the music until I found its source: a makeshift A-frame tent fashioned from wrinkly, weather-beaten blue tarps patched over with duct tape. Inside, a group of worshippers sat in a tight circle, belting out the last notes of an impassioned spiritual. I made moves to join them, but one looked up at me, pointed at my muddy feet, and gestured toward a list of rules scrawled in barely legible marker on a cardboard sign: Sacred Space Guidelines, it read. And below it: Rule No. 2: Remove shoes.

I stared at the sign, which appeared to have led a very active past life as a FedEx box. My mind reeled; removing shoes is a common practice in many religious communities, but usually only when entering a venerated place of worship. In some traditions, the command to do so occurs when God asks an important religious figure to approach holy ground. Even then, it is a request most often reserved for one very specific group of people: prophets.

I looked back at the group, which had already launched into the next song. I was in the presence of prophets.

Not that many of the interfaith activists in that tent would have used that phrase to describe themselves, of course. Prophet means different things in different faith traditions, and some don't have a concept of it at all. But it was one of my early introductions to what many activists call the prophetic tradition of social justice activism, a spiritual lineage that comprises a myriad of movements and an even greater number of faiths. It's a phenomenon I would later come to associate with the Religious Left, an amorphous, ever-changing group of progressive, faith-based advocates, strategists, and political operatives. I was surprised to find representatives of this movement at Occupy, but I shouldn't have been—and not just because I was tipped off that the tent existed before I got there. As I would learn over the next several years of reporting on the Religious Left for ThinkProgress and Religion News Service, these activists and others like them have been a core component of progressive social movements throughout American history, often rising to meet moral crises in times of need. Far from being a historical relic, the Religious Left I have come to know exerts growing influence on modern Democratic politics—be it by staging massive protests, leading legislative fights, training future candidates, or pressuring political leaders. The Religious Left is the beating heart of modern progressivism; although rarely acknowledged by members of either major political party, it is one of the Left's most secret of weapons and has the potential to impact US politics for years to come.

This book is an attempt to unearth some pieces of that secret. Such a task requires digging into the history, theology, and strategy used by Religious Left leaders to exert influence on their fellow progressives. My intention is not to tell an exhaustive history of this coalition of coalitions and its historical progenitors. (For those seeking such a history, see historian Albert J. Raboteau's similarly named *American Prophets: Seven Religious Radicals and Their Struggle for Social and Political Justice*). Rather, my aim is to home in on the iterations that are having the greatest impact in modern politics—and explain where they came from. The result (I hope) is the story of a movement that is fundamentally

different from the similarly named Religious Right, one that makes sense only when examined through the overlapping lenses of protest, policy, and politics.

But first, a quick note about terms. I use the phrase Religious Left a lot in this book, but many people who may fall under that category—including leaders I profile in these pages—actively reject the term. A running joke I've had with editors for years is that one of the hallmarks of a Religious Left leader is vehement opposition to the phrase Religious Left. (Look: I'm a journalist, not a comedian.)

Still, readers should not assume—unless otherwise noted—that people who fall into that category necessarily embrace the term. When appropriate, I do my best to list most of their objections to the epithet. Some see it as too limiting, and others don't like the association with the Religious Right, whose tactics and approach to politicized faith they hold in contempt. Still others quibble over the finer definitions of the words themselves—a political moderate's left is often not the same as a democratic socialist's or, for that matter, a hard-charging conservative's. Political scientists also spar over the exact borders of these ideological camps, some of which have morphed in profound ways in just the past three years.

Nevertheless, I use liberal, progressive, and left relatively interchangeably in this book when referring to those who mostly (but not always) fall in and around the Democratic Party, if for no other reason than that is how the terms are used in popular political discourse—the water in which these activists and operatives swim.

Moreover, as any number of scholars have made clear to me in classrooms and over the course of my career, the category of religion is hotly contested. Different thinkers use different criteria to classify what is or isn't a faith community, and many reject the idea that such a thing can ever be fully defined in the first place. I have my own thoughts on this matter, but I strive to rely on the terms that faith communities use to describe themselves (thus, Native American spirituality instead of religion), acknowledging that preferences can differ even among individual believers within the same tradition.

And as this is a larger-than-average journalistic work about religion and politics, some deeper-than-average disclosures are in order. While I have voted for both Republicans and Democrats in my life, I worked for Democratic campaigns in general and Barack Obama's 2008 presidential campaign in particular (primarily by doing field work, such as the glamorous act of trudging through the snow to knock on doors) prior to becoming a full-time journalist. In addition, my transition to working as the religion reporter at ThinkProgress occurred only after the Center for American Progress (CAP) hired me as a writer for its Faith and Progressive Policy Initiative. Although that job was already legally forbidden from engaging in electoral-style political advocacy (CAP is beholden to traditional nonprofit regulations), I still preferred a more journalistic approach and freelanced for ThinkProgress (which operated under the CAP Action Fund) until the politics-savvy site invited me to become its first and only full-time religion reporter. I consider my prereporter time in these circles to be an enhancement to my dedication to journalistic fairness when covering the Religious Left, not a detriment. All reporters must extend themselves beyond personal biases, but I have the added benefit of being able to call on my

experiences while doing so—in fact, it is through these experiences that I was able to track down many of the stories in this book.

More to the point, I do not consider this book to be an advertisement for the Religious Left. If I am an advocate, it is only because I engage in the kind of advocacy that virtually all reporters practice daily: I believe the subjects of my stories are important and worth your time. Whether those subjects constitute something "good," "bad," or anything in-between is entirely up to you.

With these parameters in mind, this book seeks to understand the Religious Left through one of its favorite mediums—namely, through storytelling. These stories often recount specific times, places, and movements, but if you pay close attention, you'll notice a recurring cast of characters.

We begin with a series of chapters that delve into the more overtly political elements of the Religious Left. First is the fight over the Affordable Care Act, which focuses on how a small band of Washington, DC-based advocates worked to create a temporary bridge between inside-the-Beltway politicians and faith-based activists to pass one of the most important pieces of liberal legislation in a century. Then we provide context for this legislative victory by explaining why Barack Obama had such a vested interest in faith groups in the first place—and why Religious Left activists consider him one of their own. And since no discussion of the Religious Left is complete without a treatment of its political opposite, we move on to highlight how an unexpected transformation within the Religious Right—namely, the rise of Christian nationalism and the influence of Donald Trump—triggered a dramatic spike in progressive faith activism.

With that broader political context in mind, we then crisscross the country, tracing the development of some of the most influential progressive faith leaders and grassroots movements of the past twenty years. Beginning with the sizable impact of Rev. William Barber and the Moral Monday movement in North Carolina, we examine the complicated relationship between the Religious Left activists and racial justice movements—from Ferguson to Charlottesville. We travel to the border to learn how a small Tucson, Arizona, church helped make the New Sanctuary movement a central pillar of the #Resistance to Donald Trump, and make stops in Hawaii and North Dakota to better understand the influence of Indigenous spirituality on the global campaign for climate justice. We march through the streets of New York to observe the intersection of spirituality and socialism, process through the echoing halls of the Washington National Cathedral to trace the development of the faith-based LGBTQ rights struggle, double back to Manhattan to unpack the importance of the interfaith movement, and return to the conference rooms of the capital city to see how Democrats did—or, in many cases, did not—capitalize on these movements during the 2016 election.

We end our journey with a trip to another camp, this time in the rural hinterlands of western North Carolina, to see how this swirling torrent of activists—and the prophetic leaders who guide them—will influence the future of faith itself.

Even with all those stories, it should be acknowledged that this book, by its very nature, is incomplete. Attempting to sum up the collective histories and happenings of progressive faith activism in the United States is a laughably impossible task, which is why this book does not seek to achieve that goal. Rather,

this book tackles a more targeted, though still challenging task. My hope is to lift up the untold (or simply ignored) stories of how various progressive faith communities shape modern American politics in this historical moment and look ahead at what that might mean.

I freely admit that there is simply not enough room in a chapter (or several chapters) to include all the voices necessary to expose the full truth of these efforts. Wiser writers than I have argued the media's perception of the Religious Left is often disproportionately Christian-centric, and while this book is more concerned with tracing the influence of the Religious Left than painting a complete picture of its boundaries, it's worth acknowledging the importance of such critiques.' What's more, my hope is that this book will be seen as a beginning to a much longer process of storytelling—one in which I am by no means the primary storyteller—that will explain, add to, or even correct the narratives I've uncovered in this book. Virtually every group, leader, or movement mentioned in these pages could constitute a tome (or two, or twelve) unto itself, and I leave the daunting challenge of offering a proper, full treatment of their efforts to others.

Put another way: If you read this book and think there are more stories to tell, good. Tell them. Write them. Preach them. But in the meantime sit back, take off your shoes, and listen to what these heirs to the prophetic tradition have to say. <>

LOSS OF INDIGENOUS EDEN AND THE FALL OF SPIRITUALITY by Blair A Stonechild [University of Regina Press, 9780889777019]

Highlights the commonalities between Indigenous nations, while calling for global recognition and respect of their rights and spirituality.

As a follow-up to his award-winning *The Knowledge Seeker: Embracing Indigenous Spirituality*, Blair Stonechild continues his exploration of the Indigenous spiritual teachings passed down to him by Elders, and then moves his study further afield. He identifies the rise of what he terms a dominant wetigo worldview, marked by an all-consuming and destructive appetite that is antithetical to the relational philosophy of Indigenous thinking whereby all things are interrelated and in need of care and respect.

Based on Stonechild's work with Indigenous peoples around the world, from Inuit communities in northern Canada, to the Mapuche in Chile, the Dalits in India and the Uighurs in the Xinjiang Autonomous Region of China, **THE LOSS OF INDIGENOUS EDEN AND THE FALL OF SPIRITUALITY** brings together and highlights the fundamental commonalities that connect all Indigenous nations, while calling for global recognition and respect of their rights and spirituality.

CONTENTS

Acknowledgements

Preface

CHAPTER 1: Enchanted World

- CHAPTER 2: Indigenous Garden of Eden
- CHAPTER 3: Betraying Indigenous Eden
- CHAPTER 4: Final Conquest of Eden
- CHAPTER 5: Religion Overtakes the World
- CHAPTER 6: Knowledge, Sacred and Profane
- CHAPTER 7: The Big Rush
- CHAPTER 8: Harming Our Relatives
- CHAPTER 9: Searching for Healing
- CHAPTER 10: Need for Reconciliation
- APPENDIX 1:
Comparing Ecolizations and Civilizations
- APPENDIX 2:
United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples
- Glossary
- Notes
- Bibliography
- Index

An Ideological Conflict

As a survivor of the Qu'Appelle Indian Residential School, I experienced firsthand the effort to eradicate Indigenous culture and spirituality. The extensive scope of this destructive agenda saw thousands of survivors emerge from residential schools unable to speak their language and detached from their culture and practices of spirituality. As an academic and historian who has worked with Elders for many years, I have had multiple opportunities to reflect on the history of contact with Europeans. What becomes quickly clear is that, over this history, conflicting positions about culture and worldview have long existed. This conflict of ideology—whether it be perception that one belief system is more valuable than another, or whether one culture has the right to declare another inferior and, therefore, justify colonization of its people and their land—stretches back much further in time than contact with Europeans in the late 1400s. I conclude that this problem's roots originate in the very rise of "civilization." Understanding the reasons for this dynamic has become a life-long pursuit.

Indigenous Knowledge: An Ancient System

Indigenous cultures existed in what is now North and South America for millennia prior to European contact. What was the focus of their ideology and way of living? Was it significantly different from that of other parts of the world? Anthropologists have noted the central focus on spirituality and intense preoccupation of Indigenous cultures with spirits and ceremonies. It is evident that nothing else was more important in these early societies than their relationship with the transcendent. It is part of the objective of this book to describe, from the perspective of current Elders, what the traditional spiritual values of these societies were and how those values contributed to viable and successful ways of life.

To that end I wrote *The Knowledge Seeker: Embracing Indigenous Spirituality* in 2016. The purpose of the book was not so much to focus on my story as it was to highlight spiritual teachings shared with me by Indigenous Elders. In particular, I learned much from revered *Saulteaux Knowledge Keeper Danny*

Musqua. The book received positive reception from the Social Science Federation of Canada, which featured my work in its "Big Thinking" lecture series. I was invited by many church congregations to expand on my ideas. But it also received derision from other quarters, one professor labelling *The Knowledge Seeker* as a form of academic dishonesty that amounted to "educational malpractice" that deserved no place in university. It is for those, both supportive and critical, that I felt I had to delve deeper to explain why Indigenous spirituality is important to the world today.

Loss of Indigenous Eden and the Fall of Spirituality posits that the Indigenous world preceded that of modern civilization, that it contained values vital to human survival, and that the significance of ancient beliefs needs to be re-explained for today's world. I discussed many of the ideas contained in this book with my mentor Elder Danny Musqua, and he encouraged me, saying, "You are on the right track." I hope that the concepts put forward in this book will challenge readers and stimulate further discussion.

There are only a few books that seriously examine Indigenous metaphysics. Vine Deloria Jr.'s *The World We Used to Live In* argues that the 'powers of gifts of Indigenous Medicine Persons need to be taken more seriously. William Lyon's *Spirit Talkers* makes a similar case but is based upon forty years of research with Elders and historical documents. Finally, Jack Forbes's *Columbus and the Cannibals* questions modern conceptions of good and evil by contrasting Euro-American and Indigenous spiritual values.

Decolonizing Indigenous Heritage

I have been privileged to know many Elders such as Ernest Benedict, Mike Pinay, Noel Starblanket, and Danny Musqua over the past four decades. I am impressed by how each conversation with them always seems to produce new insights. I owe Elders all credit for what I have been able to rediscover about Indigenous spirituality. Elders encouraged me to use my academic training and knowledge to further articulate their teachings. I have been uniquely blessed and positioned through over four decades of working at First Nations University of Canada to be able to broach a subject as foundational yet challenging as this one.

Over my career I have been fortunate to travel to Indigenous communities across the globe, including to far north Inuit communities, south to Mapuche lands in Chile, east to India to learn about Dalits, and as far west as the Xinjiang Autonomous Region of China where Uighurs are the Indigenous national minority. During these travels, hospitality was always offered—a commonality of Indigenous culture. Listening to Native students from around the globe who come to First Nations University of Canada further confirms that we all share incredibly strong beliefs about the transcendent, and that the fundamentals of spirituality are consistent across the globe. Another shared experience is how this worldview has been suppressed wherever contact has occurred with colonizers. A large part of the reason for penning this book is recognition of the need to decolonize and revitalize Indigenous heritage. It is a vital world legacy that humanity cannot afford to lose.

Truth and Reconciliation

Indigenous spirituality has been historically repressed and ridiculed. Reconciliation is long overdue. *Loss of Indigenous Eden* is a response to the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada, which was established in 2009 to examine the impacts of Indian residential schools on over 150,000 First Nations pupils. The commission heard from over 6,000 individuals in what was one of the most extensive public consultations ever held in the nation. The commission found that the schools' program amounted to "cultural genocide." Outcomes included the devastating breakdown of relationships between student and cultural identity, child and parent, and individuals and their communities. Cultural knowledge, including language and spiritual beliefs, were replaced with alien systems. In *Call to Action #48*, the commission urgently calls for programs to revitalize Native heritage, including the creation of a new curriculum "for Indigenous peoples' right to self-determination, including the right to practice, develop, and teach their own spiritual and religious traditions, customs, and ceremonies." It is in that spirit that I approach this work. My objective is not to offend or to divide, but to promote greater understanding in a respectful manner.

In order to fully understand the ideological differences that led to residential schools, I found it necessary to examine the widest scope of history possible. What has resulted is an effort to understand how human populations have come to view the world in different ways. The book contends that an ancient knowledge system existed that continues in the form of Indigenous knowledge. Historians tend not to treat the period prior to the "rise of civilization" with much seriousness. In the detailed study of the "trees" of history, an accurate picture of what "happened to the forest" has been lost. The voices of Elders speak to a vision of the world based upon intuition and reflection of their spiritual and cultural knowledge, not the content of books. *Indigenous Eden and the Fall of Spirituality* revisits and reinterprets the history of world civilization. The extent of the subject matter is immense, so I do not claim to be expert in all areas such as religion and philosophy. The book is intended to encourage the reader to reflect and take another look at the nature of the "forest" rather than agonize over the details of each tree.

In a study that covers such a vast range of circumstances and eras, it is impossible to know or cover everything when discussing spirituality and religion. It would take time and resources beyond my means to exhaustively prove every point made. Thus, I beg tolerance for inadequacies that might occur. The main effort has been to assemble sufficient evidence to demonstrate how Indigenous heritage and spirituality have come to be underappreciated. The implications of Indigenous metaphysics continue to remain undervalued in many areas of contemporary Indigenous research. The following is the manner in which I approach the subject matter.

Chapter 1—It is essential to begin with foundational ideas. "Enchanted Creation" explores the philosophy and worldview of Indigenous peoples, mainly among Canada's First Nations, and notes that these apply to cultures in other parts of the world. Fundamental principles include that all created things have spirit, that those essences have to be respected, and that human beings have a responsibility to act as stewards.

Chapter 2—It is necessary to appreciate that a different, and in many ways richer, world once existed. "Indigenous Garden of Eden" describes the type of society that results when harmonious relationships between humans and the rest of Creation are respected—abundance, health, happiness, and a sense of purpose and personal worth.

Chapter 3—The significance of the vast amount of time of human existence prior to the rise of civilization has been dismissed and ignored. "Betraying Indigenous Eden" makes the point that, in comparison to at least 200,000 years of existence of modern man, modern civilization began emerging only about 6,000 years ago—a tiny fraction of the overall time. This was a period of human harmony that reflected living in accordance with Indigenous values. It examines the emergence of ideas of civilization and religion in Middle Eastern and European philosophy. I argue that by defining itself as the central purpose of Creation, human civilization amounted to a rejection of primeval philosophy.

Chapter 4—Something dramatic and traumatic occurred in history that greatly altered human destiny. "Final Conquest of Eden" examines the grand collision between European civilization and the original peoples of the Americas that was the last untouched bastion of Indigenous Eden. I coin the term "ecolization" to describe the Indigenous alternative to civilization.

Chapter 5—Elders maintain that there is a fundamental difference in the way the transcendent was approached compared to today. "Religion Overtakes the World" looks at the differences in characteristics between Indigenous spirituality and modern institutionalized religions, in particular the two largest Abrahamic religions—Christianity and Islam, which have come to dominate the world.

Chapter 6—A fundamental change in attitudes towards relationship with spirit is also reflected in the way thinking about the world has been altered. "Knowledge: Sacred and Profane" examines developments in philosophy, science, and technology that have created modern civilization. It argues that the shift in thinking and living has accelerated the decline of spirituality in general.

Chapter 7—Over recent time, humankind has become frenetic in its obsession over its place and activities in the world. "The Big Rush" examines how modern "civilized" culture is driven by the immediacy of the quests for power and wealth. Greed and exploitation are compared to the concept of the "Wetiko," the force of selfishness that Indigenous societies realized would lead to the destruction of their values and well-being if not combated.

Chapter 8—Human actions are not without consequence. "Harming Our Relatives" looks at the consequences of current policies of resource exploitation and how this has caused damage to our plant and animal relatives in the natural world. It examines how species extinction and climate change could ultimately bring about the undoing of humankind.

Chapter 9—People continue to search for meaning and a better quality of life. "Searching for Healing" asserts that non-Indigenous peoples can be allies in restoring understanding of and respect for the transcendent. It looks at scientific and empirical research that supports Indigenous Peoples' position that there is something vital that extends beyond the physical.

Chapter 10—The historical relationship between Indigenous and non-Indigenous peoples can conceivably be repaired. However, this will require a major refocus and recognition by the dominant culture about Indigenous Peoples, their culture and spirituality. "Need for Global Reconciliation" returns to the Indigenous concept that all events occur in cycles and utilizes the Medicine Circle to make a diagnosis of humanity's sojourn on Earth to this point. It contemplates what the future might hold and concludes that a global reconciliation with Indigenous Peoples and their spirituality is critical for the survival of humanity. <>

DEFEND THE SACRED: NATIVE AMERICAN RELIGIOUS FREEDOM BEYOND THE FIRST AMENDMENT BY Michael D. McNally [Princeton University Press, 9780691190891]

The remarkable story of the innovative legal strategies Native Americans have used to protect their religious rights

From North Dakota's Standing Rock encampments to Arizona's San Francisco Peaks, Native Americans have repeatedly asserted legal rights to religious freedom to protect their sacred places, practices, objects, knowledge, and ancestral remains. But these claims have met with little success in court because Native American communal traditions don't fit easily into modern Western definitions of religion. In **DEFEND THE SACRED**, Michael McNally explores how, in response to this situation, Native peoples have creatively turned to other legal means to safeguard what matters to them.

To articulate their claims, Native peoples have resourcefully used the languages of cultural resources under environmental and historic preservation law; of sovereignty under treaty-based federal Indian law; and, increasingly, of Indigenous rights under international human rights law. Along the way, Native nations still draw on the rhetorical power of religious freedom to gain legislative and regulatory successes beyond the First Amendment.

The story of Native American advocates and their struggle to protect their liberties, **DEFEND THE SACRED** casts new light on discussions of religious freedom, cultural resource management, and the vitality of Indigenous religions today.

Review

"This book tells the story of Native Peoples' urgent and complex struggle for religious and cultural freedoms. Michael McNally stands witness to our urgency about protecting sacred places, defending ancestors, and continuing traditional ways, especially those in danger of desecration and harm. He traces and makes understandable the complex legal barriers that impede our free exercise of traditional religions and the maze of laws we stitch together for current protections and future possibilities. I urge activists, advocates, allies, policymakers, judges, lawyers, and traditional practitioners to read this book."—**Suzan Shown Harjo (Cheyenne & Hodulgee Muscogee), President, The Morning Star Institute**

Contents	
List of Illustrations	
Abbreviations	
Preface and Acknowledgments	
1	Introduction
	Religion as Weapon: The Civilization Regulations, 1883-1934
2	Religion as Spirituality: Native Religions in Prison
3	Religion as Spirituality: Sacred Lands
4	Religion as Cultural Resource: Environmental and Historic Preservation Law
5	Religion as Collective Right: Legislating toward Native American Religious Freedom
6	Religion as Collective Right: Repatriation and Access to Eagle Feathers
7	Religion as Peoplehood: Sovereignty and Treaties in Federal Indian Law
8	Religion as Peoplehood: Indigenous Rights in International Law
9	Conclusion
Notes	
Bibliography	
Index	

The Shape of the Book and Major Findings

In the service of sustaining attention to the problem of religion and religious freedom as engaged by Native peoples, I have organized the chapters not overtly in terms of the issues involved—sacred lands, repatriation of sacred items in museum collections, religious exercise in prison, and such—but in terms of the legal languages in which Native peoples make their sacred claims. These include religion as religion (or spirituality as the case may be) in religious freedom law; religion as cultural resource in environmental and historic preservation law; religion as collective right in statutory federal Indian law; and religion as peoplehood in domestic treaty law and in international law. Still, I cover most bases in terms of the range of religious practices to which Native peoples make those legal claims. I discuss prison religion in chapter 2; sacred lands in chapters 3 and 4; the Peyote Road in chapters; repatriation and ceremonial access to eagle feathers in chapter 6; and customary lifeway practices, like whaling and fishing, in chapter 7. And although I organize the book in terms of available legal languages for Native sacred claims, I strive to ensure each chapter is not beholden to judicial renderings of the Native concerns, a trap into which much of the legal studies literature falls, rooted as it is in readings of case law opinions. Still, some parts of the book are necessarily quite technical, and readers who need less technical detail are invited to make good use of introductory and concluding sections of each chapter, and to skim sections about the detailed processes, such as those under NEPA and NHPA, in order to be fresh to other moments in the book that speak to them.

The initial chapter, "Religion as Weapon," not only offers crucial historical context; it also shows just how freighted the category of religion can be for Native peoples. Religion, or its absence, served as a key instrument in the legalization of the dispossession of North America, first through the legal Doctrine of Christian Discovery, which continues to inform federal Indian law, and second through the criminalization of traditional religions under the federal Indian Bureau's Civilization Regulations from

1883 to 1934. As devastating as the regulations and their assemblage of civilization with a thinly veiled Protestant Christianity were, affected Native people strategically engaged religious freedom discourse to protect those threatened practices that they increasingly argued were their "religions" and protected under religious liberty. A desire to heal from historical trauma is what brought Peyotists in the 1910s to incorporate as the Native American Church; it is also how many spoke of in: no-DAPL protest/ceremony. Even as the government and missionary sought to curb Native religious practices thought to retard civilization, Euro-Americans began in earnest to fantasize about a Native spirituality that they could collect, admire, and inhabit. But while this awakened Euro-American appreciation for Native cultures served to help lift the formal confines of the Civilization Regulations in the 1930s, it has continued to beset Native efforts to protect collective traditions.

Chapters 2 and 3 form a couplet of sorts as they treat straightforward claims under religious freedom law. But arguments about distinctive Native religions are shown to be haunted by the power of Euro-American desire for Native spirituality. This manner of putative respect for Native cultures has served in important cases to erode rather than sharpen an appreciation for the religiousness of Native claims to religion, and so I have titled these chapters "Religion as Spirituality" Chapter 2 considers the relative success of court decisions accommodating certain individual Native American inmates in their religious exercise in prisons, especially the sweat lodge. These cases reveal a pattern of what officials refer to as "Native American Spirituality:" Especially insofar as the cases largely involve a triad of intertribal practices: sweat lodges, pipe ceremonies, and access to medicinal tobacco, sage, cedar, and sweetgrass.

Chapter 3 traces the failure, by contrast, of efforts by Native nations to secure sacred places on public lands under the First Amendment and the Religious Freedom Restoration Act. In the tracing, I query what has been so problematic about legal definitions of religion, since courts have consistently misrecognized collective claims to sacred lands as those of individuals cultivating interior spirituality. Read as a couplet, the chapters relate the legal success in prison cases and the legal failure in the sacred lands cases by the common thread coursing through both outcomes: claims to protect Native religions as religions are seen by the courts through the powerful lens of spirituality. Individual, voluntary, interiorized spirituality that makes few claims on the public gain entry to legal protections for Native American religious freedom. But where religion extends beyond the self, making claims on sacred lands, and on an American project based on theft of that land, spirituality alone doesn't pass legal muster. Where the redress sought concerns of collective, obligatory, and material claims, those claims fail to pass the "substantial burden" threshold, viewed simply as diminished spiritual fulfillment.

Chapter 4 considers the protections sought for "Religion as Cultural Resource," especially under environmental and historic preservation law and the complex world of cultural resource management, and considers the fine grain of the litigation in the Standing Rock case. Recognizing the importance of procedural protections under the National Environmental Policy Act and the National Historic Preservation Act, my case studies show the legal limitations of rendering the sacred in this managerial discourse of cultural resource. Culture proves to be as indeterminate as religion, frustrating efforts for legal protection, but without religion's status as a power word in the Constitution.

Chapters 5 and 6 consider what Native peoples have done with the indeterminacy of religion, how they have stretched it to argue for "Religion as Collective Right." Chapter 5 considers efforts to legislate Native American religious freedom in the American Indian Religious Freedom Act (AIRFA, 1978). If the legal force of "religious freedom" discourse has been only dimly effective for Native sacred claims in courts, this chapter is the one that most pointedly shows how Native peoples drew on the rhetorical power of the sacred and religious freedom to win significant legislative protections specific to Native peoples. Interviews with Suzan Shown Harjo show how the remarkable legislative accomplishment of AIRFA and, later, the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (1990), carry the rhetorical force of religious freedom into the legal shape of federal Indian law, with its recognition of treaty-based collective rights and the United States' nation-to-nation relationship with Native peoples.

Chapter 6 follows this inquiry in the context of repatriation law and a cluster of legal cases involving possession of ceremonial eagle feathers, where courts have consistently affirmed the collective contours of Native religions. Courts have upheld an exemption to the criminal penalties for feather possession tailored to members of federally recognized tribes against legal challenges by individual practitioners of Native religions who are not members of those tribes. These cases illustrate well the difficulties and the possibilities of religion as a category encompassing collective Native traditions.

Chapters 7 and 8 together explore the argument for "Religion as Peoplehood," for folding claims to what is arguably religious into broader claims of tribal sovereignty under federal Indian law and Indigenous rights under international law. Chapter 7 explores landmark court cases where treaty rights are asserted for the protection of traditional places and practices. The cases involve salmon fishing and whale hunting in the Pacific Northwest, and off reservation fishing and gathering rights in Wisconsin and Minnesota.

Chapter 8 extends this discussion of "Religion as Peoplehood" beyond the very real limits of federal Indian law, exploring the possibilities and drawbacks of increasing appeals to Indigenous rights under international human rights law. As rich as the possibilities are of the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples and its implementation apparatus for protecting Native religions under Indigenous rights and thus without having to define them as such, the approach is slow to grow domestic legal teeth in the United States. Its incremental development as authoritative law can, I think, be strengthened by making clearer associations with US religious freedom law.

My aim in these chapters is not to pick the proper register in which to articulate claims. The question is what is lost and what is gained by thus articulating claims in each register, in different legal and political environments? Unlike academic scholars of religious studies, jurists are pragmatically driven, even obligated, to layer arguments in different registers: religious freedom, cultural resource law, federal Indian law, treaty rights, and international law.

The book concludes with a nod in the direction of successful negotiated settlements and other agreements that grab fewer headlines and leave fewer public traces because they can avoid the courts altogether and proceed in the context of the nation-to-nation relationship. For an example, I will turn to

the newly created and recently embattled Bears Ears National Monument, a collaboratively managed preserve of sacred lands, cultural landscapes, and traditional knowledge in southern Utah. Since the quiet goal for most Native people is to protect what is sacred to them without calling attention to themselves, the best outcomes for Native American religious freedom are so far beyond the First Amendment and its legal counterparts they can remain entirely off line, and so it shall be fitting to end there. <>

A CLIMATE POLICY REVOLUTION: WHAT THE SCIENCE OF COMPLEXITY REVEALS ABOUT SAVING OUR PLANET by Roland Kupers [Harvard University Press, 9780674972124]

Humanity's best hope for confronting the looming climate crisis rests with the new science of complexity.

The sheer complexity of climate change stops most solutions in their tracks. How do we give up fossil fuels when energy is connected to everything, from great-power contests to the value of your pension? Global economic growth depends on consumption, but that also produces the garbage now choking the oceans. To give up cars, coal, or meat would upend industries and entire ways of life. Faced with seemingly impossible tradeoffs, politicians dither and economists offer solutions at the margins, all while we flirt with the sixth extinction.

That's why humanity's last best hope is the young science of complex systems. Quitting coal, making autonomous cars ubiquitous, ending the middle-class addiction to consumption: all necessary to head off climate catastrophe, all deemed fantasies by pundits and policymakers, and all plausible in a complex systems view.

Roland Kupers shows how we have already broken the interwoven path dependencies that make fundamental change so daunting. Consider the mid-2000s, when, against all predictions, the United States rapidly switched from a reliance on coal primarily to natural gas. The change required targeted regulations, a few lone investors, independent researchers, and generous technology subsidies. But in a stunningly short period of time, shale oil nudged out coal, and carbon dioxide emissions dropped by 10 percent. Kupers shows how to replicate such patterns in order to improve transit, reduce plastics consumption, and temper the environmental impact of middle-class diets. Whether dissecting China's Ecological Civilization or the United States' Green New Deal, Kupers describes what's folly, what's possible, and which solutions just might work.

Review

"A CLIMATE POLICY REVOLUTION not only shows convincingly that we cannot solve our problems with the same thinking we used when we created them, but also discusses realistic ways forward. Kupers successfully uses deep concepts of complexity science to point out the weaknesses in our thinking and policy measures when getting a grip on the causal networks that lead to our current

environmental and climate challenges. This is a timely and important book; read it and act accordingly!”—**Peter M. A. Sloot, Scientific Director of the Institute for Advanced Study, Amsterdam, and Director of the Complexity Institute, Singapore**

“**A CLIMATE POLICY REVOLUTION** delivers on the promise of its title: it offers a framework for how to think about the kinds of changes that we need to make to meet the climate crisis that is genuinely different and disruptive. Kupers’s focus—on disequilibrium rather than equilibrium, on closing off current paths as much as opening new ones, and on letting go as much as steering—is refreshing and compelling. It’s a book that should interest public problem-solvers of every stripe.”—**Anne-Marie Slaughter, author of *The Chessboard and the Web: Strategies of Connection in a Networked World***

“With insight and clarity, **A CLIMATE POLICY REVOLUTION** reveals the shortcomings of our current reductionist attempts to addressing climate change. Kupers instead offers an evolutionary approach that identifies what will be required to stabilize the climate.”—**Steven Hamburg, Chief Scientist, Environmental Defense Fund**

“Whether dissecting China’s Ecological Civilization or the United States’ Green New Deal, Kupers describes what’s folly, what’s possible, and which solutions just might work.”—**E: *The Environmental Magazine***

CONTENTS

Time’s Up

PART I: COMPLEXITY IDEAS

Getting Unstuck

Network Literacy

Non-equilibrium Is the Source of Order

Top-Down and Bottom-Up Order

PART II: REVOLUTION POLICIES

Kicking the Coal Habit

Wrong for the Right Reason?

Norms Policy

Kicking the Consumption Habit

Beyond Incumbent Industry

Who Pays for Learning?

Autonomous Cars as a Climate Policy

Conclusion: Beyond a Blueprint for the Climate Revolution

Epilogue

Notes

References

Acknowledgments

Index

Excerpt: Social change can be slow, at least to those wanting to see it happen. Civil servants or leaders of nongovernmental organizations who are in the business of changing society can only dream of a sudden sweeping change. Much of the time, things stubbornly refuse to budge. Reducing traffic accidents, corruption, or greenhouse-gas emissions is fiendishly hard. There is typically not a single silver bullet. It is often more akin to a silver buckshot and seeing what sticks.

The science of system-wide change is, in fact, often more art than science. That leads to two fundamental reactions. Some say that large systemic changes are inherently hard to predict, so why even try? Others say that not keeping systemic change in perspective misses critical opportunities.

Complexity—The Science of Interconnected Systems

Enter what, over the past thirty-odd years, has come to be known as "complexity" or "systems science." Catalyzed by the Santa Fe Institute, the science of complex systems is starting to shed new light on the different evolutions of a system as a whole, whether that implies incremental or revolutionary change. The very word "complex" stems from the Latin plexus, for braided or interconnected; so complexity is derived from something that is "with braids." It is, quite simply, the science of interconnected systems. Now other aspects become important. Complex systems, by definition, are highly interconnected and constantly changing; networks and interactions are central to the thinking.

How do complexity and economics relate? For one, complexity provides some models that start getting to grips with sudden system-wide change, and economics doesn't. But pitting the two disciplines against each other isn't exactly fair. Most classical economists—those in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries—were very comfortable with complexity. Adam Smith strived to distill human desires and the workings of economics and society down to the most important drivers, while also putting complexity issues such as moral sentiments front and center. Many other economics thinkers, from Joseph Schumpeter to Thomas Schelling to contemporaries like Daron Acemoglu, have followed in this tradition.

The differences between economics and complexity science can be overstated. It is true that many economists see complexity scientists as having good critiques and little else. It is also true that some complexity scientists have the view that much of economics is lost in streamlined math based on erroneous—or at least severely limiting—assumptions. But beyond the polemics, and because the two approaches share much more than mutual disdain, an understanding of complexity is imperative to trigger policy revolutions—in particular to deal with climate crisis.

A Complexity Lens

The traditional economic framing of a policy area such as the climate crisis holds the danger that an approach is chosen that does not fit the underlying complexity of the system. As a consequence the policy may be inefficient or simply ineffective. This is a lesson that also holds for other policy areas. There are many examples of failure in development projects that assume an oversimplified system and take a top-down intervention approach. Shipping food aid into a famine area threatens to destroy the remaining food businesses by outcompeting them. When considering the energy transition to a low-

carbon system, the energy system itself is treated as a relatively simple system, one that can be framed in terms of fairly linear dynamics. Taking a reductionist perspective, the behavior of the system is the sum of the behavior of its various components. Direct causality applies. That in turn means that the outcome of a particular intervention can be predicted and understood.

A complexity lens on the energy system would consider its deep and manifold interconnections with other societal systems: promised pension payments are critically dependent on the superior returns of fossil fuel companies; the attachment to coal production in Appalachia, the Ruhr, or Poland is as much cultural as it is economic; risk models in the financial sector tend to overestimate the vagaries of new technologies; people resist government's intervention to make their homes smaller energy guzzlers. We could go on. The energy system maybe at the heart of dealing with the climate crisis, but it is not isolated. Like a ball of badly cooked spaghetti, it sticks to its surroundings: it is part of a complex system.

This Book

In Part I we'll explore some complexity ideas. Just like people, systems carry their past with them and are bound by historic ties. Such path dependencies must be recognized and sometimes purposefully tweaked. We look at the growing knowledge of networks and how different types of networks lead to profoundly different outcomes. We've briefly alluded to the assumption of equilibrium in economics; exploring the consequences of systems being either in or far from equilibrium opens up a rich vein of thought and insight. And finally we return to the ideas of top-down versus bottom-up change. Bottom-up dynamics are at the heart of what makes successful societal systems work.

In Part II we turn to a few examples of revolution policies. We don't have the magical formula for fixing the climate instantly, but these examples illustrate how different the perspective is from the bottom up, and how it just might unleash a revolution. Coal is the hardest nut to crack and appears to yield only to flanking maneuvers. A climate-friendly future cannot happen with the social norms we have today. If billions more join the middle class as it is defined today, we are quite literally toast. The very idea of the middle class must morph. The good news is that social norms don't exist in isolation and that they change through context. We'll explore how. In matters of climate, business is in turn maligned or hailed as the savior. We cut through the confusion and describe the contribution and the limitations of business to come up with new approaches. One particular aspect of innovation concerns widespread misunderstanding about its origin and how it is paid for. We look at autonomous vehicles, not as transport solutions, but as climate catalysts.

Finally we attempt to provide some recipes for the kind of revolution policy that is required to face down the climate crisis. <>

NATURE'S BROKEN CLOCKS: REIMAGINING TIME IN THE FACE OF THE ENVIRONMENTAL CRISIS by Paul Huebener [University of Regina Press, 9780889777149]

Examines how cultural narratives of time are intimately connected to the challenges and disruptions of ecological time

The environmental crisis is, in many ways, a crisis of time. From the distress cries of birds that no longer know when to migrate, to the rapid dying of coral reefs, to the quickening pace of extreme weather events, the patterns and timekeeping of the natural world are falling apart. We have broken nature's clocks.

Lying hidden at the root of this problem are the cultural narratives that shape our actions and horizons of thought, but as Paul Huebener shows, we can bring about change by developing a critical literacy of time. Moving from circadian rhythms and the revival of ancient frozen bacteria to camping advertisements and the politics of oil pipelines, *Nature's Broken Clocks* turns to works of fiction and poetry, examining how cultural narratives of time are connected to the problems of ecological collapse and what we might do to fix them.

"Urgent and profound, **NATURE'S BROKEN CLOCKS** is essential reading for anyone interested in time and the environment." --Nicholas Bradley, author of *Rain Shadow*

"**NATURE'S BROKEN CLOCKS** will inspire readers to reflect deeply on our manipulations of time, and on the impact of our shifting temporal imaginations and practices on the ecosphere." --Sarah Wylie Krotz, Assistant Professor, Department of English and Film Studies, University of Alberta

Review

"Urgent and profound, **NATURE'S BROKEN CLOCKS** is essential reading for anyone interested in time and the environment."

—Nicholas Bradley, author of *Rain Shadow*

Paul Huebener's book is wise and winsome company in ecological times that feel threatened and short."
—Daniel Coleman, author of *Yardwork*

"**NATURE'S BROKEN CLOCKS** will inspire readers to reflect deeply on our manipulations of time, and on the impact of our shifting temporal imaginations and practices on the ecosphere."
—Sarah Wylie Krotz, an associate professor in the Department of English and Film Studies, University of Alberta

"An intriguing, enjoyable, and accessible read, original in concept, mixing history and science to deconstruct various understandings and aspects of time, and using literature to explain, illuminate, or build on the resulting ideas."

—Sharon Butala, author of *Season of Fury and Wonder*

“Are we capable as a species of adequately revising our understanding of time and human purpose in the face of the urgent climate crisis forcing itself into our common view? And what would that take?

Huebener worries at these questions with anxious critical attention, gathering together a compendium of contemporary literary and scientific approaches that may or may not answer to this greatest of earthly challenges we face together now. A grief song, a funeral song above all else. A place to begin.”

—Di Brandt, author of *Walking to Mojácar and Glitter & Fall*

“In the vein of Amitav Ghosh’s *The Great Derangement: Climate Change and the Unthinkable*, Paul Huebener addresses ecological emergency. In this paradigm-shifting book, he draws on sources as wide-ranging as literature, turtles, corals, and hybrid grizzly-polar bears that tell time differently from the restless 24/7 of insomniac global extractivism. One of the leading figures in the field of ecocritical time studies, Huebener illuminates multi-temporal power and the way stories and pipelines alike are ‘gadgets’ for measuring time.”

—Pamela Banting, Associate Professor, Department of English, University of Calgary

CONTENTS

List of Figures

Acknowledgements

INTRODUCTION: Nature's Broken Clocks

CLOCK ONE: The Earth

CLOCK TWO: The Grolar

CLOCK THREE: The Skeleton Watch

CLOCK FOUR: The Recreational Vehicle

CLOCK FIVE: The Arctic Alligator Swamp

CONCLUSION: The Clock's Wound Up

Notes

Sources and Permissions Bibliography

Index

The Clock's Wound Up

When a crisis of time is unfolding before our eyes, any discussion of time is always political. And every discussion, in a sense, is a discussion of time. Every narrative, every object, every living thing is a clock, each one crucial and incomplete, beautiful and broken in its own way. Telling the time is no longer as simple as glancing at the clock on the wall, if it ever was that simple. To tell the time is to stake out a position, to declare an investment in the values reflected by one clock over another, an act that shapes the future in all its inequities and promise.

All of this is perhaps an exhausting prospect. We need only think back to the coral reef, that delicate ecosystem that is counting down toward its own collapse, and to the people who live alongside it. Ed Yong, a writer for *The Atlantic*, has observed that the prolonged sight of dying reefs is devastating for the mental health of coral reef biologists, recovery experts, and the millions of people whose way of life

depends on coral. "How do you get up and go to work every day," he writes, "when every day brings fresh news of loss? When everything you are working to save is collapsing, how do you stop yourself from collapsing, too?" How do we move on from here? What is our next step?

Earlier in this book, I considered depression and creativity as two possible responses to the ecological crisis of time. Ultimately, our response will not be a choice between these two poles. We can, and probably must, choose both. Either one on its own would be too certain, too blind to the evidence, too incomplete. The limitations of creativity can bring about despair, yet the process of engaging with despair creates a way forward. As Ashlee Cunsolo and Karen Landman observe, "mourning can unite, and grief over a shared loss or something integral to one's self can be a powerful political motivator and unifier." Literature and other imaginative responses can help us engage with the reality and the urgency of both depression and creativity. The skills of careful reading can open our eyes to the politics of time, a vision filled with terrors and possibilities.

One last metaphor can illuminate this point. Don McKay's poem "Waiting for Shay" takes place in the wilderness of British Columbia's coastal forest, and it contemplates the sudden arrival of the Shay locomotive, a train engine that was used widely on Vancouver Island in the first half of the twentieth century to haul timber out of the forest.' For McKay, the arrival of the engine as it floats up to the shore on its barge is the arrival of modern progressive time within

the wilderness. The presence of the engine transforms its surroundings, replacing the temporality of leaves, moss, and bears with the Western framework of linear progress, rapid development, and the countdown toward extinction.

Shay is a marvellous invention. "Engine, ingenuity," McKay writes: "how could we not love it?" But Shay is also a terrible, violent machine, a mechanical ambassador for modernity's most destructive values, and it converts the forest into a collection of living resources to be killed and harvested. The poem ends with these lines:

When the barge arrives the sleeping shape
will wake and start to breathe and
build a head of steam, accumulating wrath
like a hell-fire preacher. Then,
in a series of sharp
expostulations—work work work—crank itself ashore. And then
the clock's wound up.

The temporality of the forest thus completes its transition to modern time. The wound-up clock is both the mechanical 'clockwork' of the Shay engine and the countdown to the destruction of the forest through logging; the measured pace of time and the condition of mortality have begun to tick for the forest along with the "work work work" of the machine. Shay becomes the engine of death, and we, along with the forest, await the enactment of its (and our) inevitable task. Importantly, we become implicated in these events not only generally as members of modernity but specifically as readers of the poem. To read these lines is to participate, at least conceptually, in the creative process by which the

deadly clock winds up. In this way, the poem confirms our status as temporal colonizers who are simultaneously in love with, blind to, and horrified by our own cultural ideologies of time.

And yet, the final image of the poem, the wound-up clock, implies not only doom but also potential. A clock with a tightened spring is poised, anxious to expend energy, aching to bring a particular form of temporality into the world. The wound-up clock is the countdown toward extinction, but it is also the confirmation that the end has not yet occurred and that there is still opportunity to act, to intervene, to deploy time in creative ways. It is an image of urgency and readiness. Like the wound-up clock of the earth, the clock in the poem is both depression and creativity, despair and hope.

A good poem can help us experience the world as though for the first time, allowing us to see beyond the time socialization stories we live by. Nevertheless, poetry remains just one of many kinds of texts that have something to teach us. Commenting on the complex possibilities of many different forms of representation, Daniel Coleman suggests that "we need to read texts that are smarter or wiser than we are on our own" and that doing so requires attention to variety and detail rather than the assertion of rigid literary boundaries. Indeed, the distinction between representations that prop up dangerous assumptions about time and those that question such assumptions is often not clear-cut. Energy policies, news articles, advertisements, and novels all circulate within the deep and roiling ocean of ideologies of time. In enabling us to read, evaluate, and reshape the visions of time embedded within all forms of cultural and literary narratives, ecocritical time studies plays an important role in the projects, now inevitably intertwined, of cultural analysis and ecological survival. As we encounter the diverse stories that surround us, we must recognize those moments when a text has something to teach us about natural and cultural time, and we must also embrace those moments when we need to become the teachers. A critical eye that moves freely back and forth between one form of representation and another is well positioned to embrace the complexity of these seemingly routine encounters. This is what it means to have an everyday literacy of the temporal imagination.

Narratives, like clocks, are political and malleable, artisanal and ordinary. They can govern our lives without us really noticing. The essence of narrative is that it structures time, and if we are going to think critically about time, we need to think critically about narratives. As the world groans and crumbles, as new life and creative energies spring forth, one thing remains constant: every story is a time socialization story. Every narrative has something to say about our encounters with time, and the process of thoughtful reading can discern which forms of time might hold together in a diverse and fragile world. Every story is a clock, and we must tell the time every day.

In his much-anthologized essay "Why We Crave Horror Movies," Stephen King tells us that we seek the dark pleasures of cinematic terror and blood because they satisfy the most depraved impulses that lie, always in wait, alongside the more admirable strands of our emotional muscles. King sees horror movies "as lifting a trap door in the civilized forebrain and throwing a basket of raw meat to the hungr-y alligators swimming around in that subterranean river beneath" Keeping the alligators fed, he advises, stops them from getting out. In the era of global heating, King's alligators of our secret craving for blood

have now been joined by the alligators of the Arctic swamps, ghosts that lurk within the future we have begun to conjure, haunting the mind as we go about our lives.

If we do not want the alligators of the Arctic swamp to escape, to wreak their havoc on the actual earth, we have to keep them fed, as it were. Unlike King, who cages the alligators of his mind by giving them horror movies, we have been failing to feed the Arctic alligators and all the other ghosts of the Anthropocene. We have buried them in the dark recesses of our civilizational mind, and because of this we risk letting them fester and escape. To keep them fed, to keep them in that dark, imaginative realm where they cannot unleash their most terrible harms, perhaps we need to find the ecological equivalent of watching a horror movie. Only by contemplating the story of civilization that would lead us straight to the alligators can we then choose a story that leads somewhere else. Unfortunately, we have not done this. The real world is starting to turn into an ecological horror show, and the slope into the alligator pit has now become very slippery indeed. Would Stephen King still advise us to watch horror movies if they were documentaries, or if the terrors they foretold were all but inevitable?

If the narratives of the Anthropocene are making their way into the nonfiction section, then we have all the more reason to read them carefully. Our best hope is that seeing the early stages of collapse with our own eyes will inspire us to prevent the later stages; this is also our biggest challenge, because when it comes to climate change and ecosystems, the narrative path between action and consequence is characterized by long lag times and sudden spasms. The destructive human influence on the ecosphere may never be erased altogether, but the way we imagine and enact the forms of time that distinguish our era remains pliable. If the Anthropocene is made of cement, then thoughtful narratives are the weeds that crack the sidewalk, an initiative both hopeful and hopeless that fights resilience with resilience. The stories of the Anthropocene, and the forms of time emerging from them, will shift from earnest to ironic, haunted to haunting, and back again. <>

A WILD LOVE FOR THE WORLD: JOANNA MACY AND THE WORK OF OUR TIME by Joanna Macy edited by Stephanie Kaza [Shambhala, 9781611807950]

Joanna Macy is a scholar of Buddhism, systems thinking, and deep ecology whose decades of writing, teaching, and activism have inspired people around the world. In this collection of writings, leading spiritual teachers, deep ecologists, and diverse writers and activists explore the major facets of Macy's lifework. Combined with eleven pieces from Macy herself, the result is a rich chorus of wisdom and compassion to support the work of our time.

“Being fully present to fear, to gratitude, to all that is—this is the practice of mutual belonging. As living members of the living body of Earth, we are grounded in that kind of belonging. Even when faced with cataclysmic changes, nothing can ever separate us from Earth. We are already home.”—Joanna Macy

To learn more, visit www.joannamacy.net.

Review

“The conversation I had with Joanna Macy early in our tender, tumultuous century has shaped me ever after. I first discovered Joanna through her gorgeous translations of the poet Rilke, a voice of the last century’s turnings that she has brought to accompany us in ours. I marvel at her many callings and adventures. She attended to the human trauma as Rilke’s central European world disappeared in the aftermath of World War II—and in the exile from Tibet of a young Dalai Lama. She was an environmentalist before that term was on every tongue. And she became a great Buddhist teacher before anyone understood how this tradition would meet twenty-first-century people and potentialities. Through all of this, Joanna has come to embody a singular clarity of vision about the totality of what it means to be human—at this moment in time. Her wild love for the world is a beacon to us all—and an exuberant invitation—to join our passion to hers, whatever the lives we lead. This book is a precious offering toward life-giving possibility.”—Krista Tippett, host of *On Being*

“Joanna Macy is one of the planet’s treasures, not least for the remarkable cadre of people who have learned from and been inspired by her rooted and unstinting life. This fine book combines her insights and those who have learned from her, and it will be a joy to anyone who approaches it with an open heart.”—Bill McKibben, author of *Falter: Has the Human Game Begun to Play Itself Out?*

“We can’t save our world, we can only love our larger body, this living earth, and take the next healing step. To guide us, we have Joanna Macy, who embodies this active loving in her brilliant teachings, ‘The Work That Reconnects,’ and through her decades of serving our planet. This new book captures the great depth and breadth of Joanna’s wisdom through her own stories, as well as through the richly shared stories of her colleagues—activists, thinkers, and teachers. Throughout, Joanna’s understandings, group practices, and passionate heart offer us an urgently needed pathway of hope for this precious world.”—Tara Brach, author of *Radical Acceptance* and *Radical Compassion*

“I am wildly in love with *A Wild Love for the World*. I can truly say that the stories in this book, and its life-transforming ideas and their practical applications, have changed me. The personal stories and focus on positive collaborative engagement offer a breath of energizing fresh air as we move forward. Joanna Macy’s life, celebrated here in an engaging, inspiring, and practical compendium of approaches catalyzed by her ‘Work That Reconnects,’ offers each of us a light to cultivate resilience and illuminate the path ahead. Thank you to Stephanie Kaza and all the contributors, and to Joanna, for the love and brilliance that shine so brightly in this life’s work of heart.”—Daniel Siegel, author of *Aware* and *Mind*

“How do we live in solidarity on this warming planet? This book captures a lifetime of grappling with this most important of questions—and invites readers into a thriving community of people who, like me, have been transformed by Joanna Macy’s thought and practice.”—Naomi Klein, author of *On Fire: The Burning Case For a Green New Deal*

“If the ecological crisis is the greatest challenge that humanity is facing today, then Joanna Macy is the

most important teacher of our time. For those who don't yet know her work, this anthology is an excellent place to start. For those of us who have already benefited from it, it provides an overview of an extraordinary woman and her remarkable career."—David Loy, author of *Ecodharma: Buddhist Teachings for the Ecological Crisis*

"Serendipitous that this volume by and about one of our most far-seeing, exuberant, and empathic radiators of necessary wisdom is emerging in the midst of a worldwide pandemic. The book will be a talisman for many, a seed bundle, a way through the calamity."—David Abram, author of *The Spell of the Sensuous*

Contents

Foreword by David Abram

Editor's Preface by Stephanie Kaza

Introducing Joanna Stories by Kaye Jones

PART ONE: OUR PLANET, OUR SELF

Trust in Life by Joanna Macy

No Separate Self by Joanna Macy

Gaia Consciousness in the Great Turning by Stephan Harding

Sarvodaya Means Everybody Wakes Up by A. T. Ariyaratne

Developing a Socially Engaged Buddhism by Donald Rothberg

Widening the Circle by Philip Novak

The Work Takes Root in the UK by Pat Fleming

The Rainforest Protecting Itself: Australia Rising by Bobbi Allan

Houseguest by Catherine Johnson

PART TWO: SUSTAINING THE GAZE

Thunderclap by Joanna Macy

The First Truth Mandala by Joanna Macy

To Behold Worlds Ending by Susanne Moser

The Thrumming Relationality of All Things by Andy Fisher

Grieving My Way into Loving the Planet by DahrJamil

We Almost Didn't Make It by Beverly Naidus

"You, Darkness"—Meeting the Other in Rilke by Anita Barrows

Breaking the Silence in Germany by Gunter and Barbara Hamburger

Ecological and Social Justice Healing by Jeanine Canty

Re-Connectando in the Wounded Land of Colombia by Helena ter Ellen

PART THREE: THE INTERPLAY OF REALITY

The Blessing by Joanna Macy

The Carp in the Castle Moat by Joanna Macy

Everything Leans: The Creativity of Dependent Arising by Elizabeth Mattis Namgyel

The Dharma of Natural Systems by Christopher Queen

Decomposing the Ego by Wendy Johnson

rites of passage by brontë velez

Canticle Farm—Emerging Like a River by Anne Symens-Bucher

Power and Privilege in Indra's Net by Tova Green
Transform Yourself, Transform the World by Sherry Ellms
PART FOUR: DEEP TIME
Pilgrimage to Greenham Common by Joanna Macy
The Presence of the Future Beings by Joanna Macy
Being Time and Deep Time by Taigen Dan Leighton
Liberating the Spirit of the Ancestors in Africa by Liz Hosken
Deep Ecology Courage in Nuclear Russia by Oleg Bodrov and Ludmilla Zhrina
Citizen Ambassador by Linda Seeley
The Journey of a Nuclear Guardian by Kathleen Sullivan
Finding Our Way Forward after Fukushima by Tuka Saito and Hide Enomoto
Nothing Is Impossible by Daniel Ellsberg
PART FIVE: ON THE MOVE TOGETHER
Outcome Uncertain by Joanna Macy
Mother of All Buddhas by Joanna Macy
For Love of Gaia by Sean Kelly
Healing Our Broken World: Pathways to Peacebuilding by Paula Green
The Eagle, Condor, and Quetzal by Adrian Villaseñor Galarza
On the Road for the Great Turning by Sarah Vekasi
A Pilgrim Returns to China by Zilong Wang
Notes from a Zen Monastery by Susan Moon
Our Compassionate Nature by Matthew Fox
Afterword by Joanna Macy
Joanna Macy Biography
Bibliography of Works by and about Joanna Macy
About the Contributors

Excerpt: Every book has a story, and this book started with a simple question: "Is anyone working on a collective tribute to honor Joanna Macy as she approaches her ninetieth birthday?" It seemed like an obvious thing to do for such a well-known and much beloved teacher. I asked because I wanted to contribute, to show my appreciation and gratitude for her tremendous gifts and influence on my life. As it turned out, I was far from alone in that desire.

Finding none in process, Kaye Jones and I approached Joanna with the idea of such a book. At first she hesitated. Already she had given the creative efforts of her life to any and all who wanted to use them for good works. What could one more book add to that generosity? Still, the stories began to emerge as we spoke out there by the grand sycamore tree on Kaye's homestead farm in Trout Lake, Washington. Before long, a list of names had materialized on the easel pad. Might there be something here? It was August 2018, when wildfires had blackened the western skies and breathing the smoky air was not so easy for any of us, especially Joanna.

I hesitated, too, humbled by the daunting scope of the project. I had known Joanna since my first systems theory class with her at Starr King School for the Ministry in 1988. I had taken her big ideas and creative exercises to the University of Vermont, where I taught impassioned students in environmental

studies for twenty-four years. I had developed my own ideas in Buddhist environmental thought in books, articles, talks, and courses...

In the dark times
Will there also be singing?
Yes, there will be singing.
About the dark times.
—BERTOLT BRECHT

Across the year of this book's preparation, projections of widespread climate impacts now extend to the possibility of widespread societal collapse. I have been following closely the UN reports on climate change and biodiversity as well as the bold leadership of Greta Thunberg and the global school strikes she inspires. Uppermost in my mind is Jem Bendell's work on deep adaptation, which offers new ways to consider openly the prospect of collapse. These hard visions, which are not new to the *Work That Reconnects*, are central now to my talks and teaching as we look at what our future holds.

Shortly after reading the most recent Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) report, I was on retreat at Spirit Rock Meditation Center, engaged in walking meditation. At one point my mind was stuck on an old memory, some minor embarrassment, and no mindful "noting" could loosen its grip. "Wait a minute," I thought, "I should know how to handle this." At that very moment, a strong voice came to me and thundered, "Just fall in love with what is!" As I heard these words, I saw two curtains closing. One was the IPCC report with its urgent orders to shrink our greenhouse gas emissions. The other was the election in Brazil, with the promised razing of the Amazon rainforest, dooming all hopes of carbon reductions. I stood immobilized, as if turned to stone, my whole body deadened by the eclipse of a livable future. And yet the message came, just fall in love with what is--a clear call for acceptance.

Carl Jung once said that at the core of each life's journey is one question that we are born to pursue. For me, that question has been How can I be fully present to my world present enough to rejoice and be useful—when we as a species are destroying it? The question came in the middle of my life, with the 1977 Cousteau Society symposium. It lurked inside me for fifteen months of silent grief until it broke me open at Notre Dame. The query was clearly my life koan. I learned then, in a circle of colleagues, that expressing our pain for the world can uncover a wellspring of solidarity and creativity.

Ever since, this question keeps surfacing in my heart-mind, and the responses keep coming. The most resounding have come through the four decades of group work. I remember saying to my husband, Fran, in the early 1980s, "Nothing in my life has prepared me for what I experience now: the sheer size of the human heart—it's so big I could walk into it." I continue to be stunned by the strength of community that springs up when people, through their anguish and their tears, open to the immensity of their caring. Courage flowers, and a team spirit so spunky that hilarity flowers too. I began to sense in this adventure the loosening of the hyper-individualism that for centuries—like some foot-binding of the spirit—has cramped our natural abilities and isolated the separate self to the point that it seeks release in mob mentality.

In the 1990s a name emerged for the purposeful and Earth-based solidarity we were experiencing and for the promise it carried—the Great Turning. The term soon came to signify the transition underway to a life-sustaining society—a transition as real and pervasive as the unraveling caused by the industrial growth society. While the Great Turning does take form in specific actions and achievements, it essentially lives within us as vision and commitment. In that sense, it reminds me of the Buddhist notion of bodhicitta, dedication to the welfare of all, often portrayed as a flame in the heart.

I think many of us assumed that we could achieve a life sustaining society without the collapse of the global economy. But given the depth and breadth of destruction, breakdown now seems inevitable and may also be necessary for the emergence of a life-sustaining society. The Great Turning will be more important to us than ever, not only as a light at the end of the tunnel but as compass and map, as well as a supply house of skills and tools for nourishing our spirit, ingenuity, and determination.

We can start right away, while we can still easily communicate and work together. What we do now in our immediate communities as well as in wider "rough weather networks" strengthens our capacities, which will be ever more valuable as the consumer society falters and fails. Everything we learn from the self-organizing nature of Gaia will serve to guide and steady us. And to help us grasp the beauty and relevance of Gaia's laws, it is our great good fortune that we are beginning to listen to indigenous voices as they share, despite genocide and betrayal, their millennia-old Earth wisdom traditions.

The solidarity we grow in our work together will help us meet and move through the bardo of the breakdown of our globalized political economy. Bardo states are phases of transition from one form of existence to another, often described as changes in consciousness. In the Tibetan tradition, Akshobhya is the first Buddha you meet in the bardo. He is known for his mirror wisdom, which reflects everything just as it is. This is the bardo invitation: to not look away, to not turn aside, but to be fully present to what confronts us. The mirror wisdom is a radical teaching, calling for total attention, for depth of acceptance, a call to "just fall in love with what is."

This leads me to a state of utter gratitude. It is so great a privilege to be here in Earth at this time. I have the good fortune to drink from three great streams of thought—the Buddha Dharma, systems thinking, and deep ecology. Each gives me another way to know Gaia and to know myself. Each helps me be less afraid of my fears. I have had the joy of helping others experience this too, of seeing them take the Work That Reconnects further, building our collective capacities and our trust in reciprocity.

And who would not want to be here at this time? I would hate to miss out on this! I sometimes imagine Buddha-fields out there in the universe with long lines of people applying to be born on Earth now to take part in this evolutionary moment.

Being fully present to fear, to gratitude, to all that is—this is the practice of mutual belonging. As living members of the living body of Earth, we are grounded in that kind of belonging. We will find more ways to remember, celebrate, and affirm this deep knowing: we belong to each other, we belong to Earth. Even when faced with cataclysmic changes, nothing can ever separate us from her. We are already

home. The practice of mutual belonging is the medicine for the sickness of the small self and can accompany us through the bardo, through the hard times ahead.

Our belonging is rooted in the living body of Earth, woven of the flows of time and relationship that form our bodies, our communities, our climate. The poet Rainer Maria Rilke expressed this sense of belonging in the closing lines of his "Ninth Duino Elegy":

Earth, isn't this what you want? To arise in us, invisible?
Is it not your dream, to enter us so wholly
there's nothing left outside us to see?
What, if not transformation,
is your deepest purpose? Earth, my love,
I want that too. Believe me,
no more of your springtimes are needed
to win me over—even one flower
is more than enough. Before I was named
I belonged to you. I seek no other law
but yours, and know I can trust
the death you will bring.
See, I live. On what?
Childhood and future are equally present.
Sheer abundance of being
floods my heart.

(Anita Barrows and Joanna Macy, trans., In Praise of Mortality: Selections from Rainer Maria Rilke's "Duino Elegies" and "Sonnets to Orpheus" (Brattleboro, VT: Echo Point Books, 2016)

When we turn and open our heart-mind to Earth, she is always there. This is the great reciprocity at the heart of the universe.

My gratitude to all, may we experience "sheer abundance of being" and know that we truly belong here.
<>

LIVING LANDSCAPES: MEDITATIONS ON THE FIVE ELEMENTS IN HINDU, BUDDHIST, AND JAIN YOGAS by Christopher Key Chapple, Foreword by John Grim and Mary Evelyn Tucker [SUNY Press, 9781438477930]

Explores the role of meditation on the five elements in the practice of Yoga.

In **LIVING LANDSCAPES**, Christopher Key Chapple looks at the world of ritual as enacted in three faiths of India. He begins with an exploration of the relationship between the body and the world as found in the cosmological cartography of Sāṃkhya philosophy, which highlights the interplay between consciousness (*puruṣa*) and activity (*prakṛti*), a process that gives rise to earth, water, fire, air, and space.

He then turns to the progressive explication of these five great elements in Buddhism, Jainism, Advaita, Tantra, and Haṭha Yoga, and includes translations from the Vedas and the Purāṇas of Hinduism, the Buddhist and Jain Sūtras, and select animal fables from early Hinduism, Buddhism, and Jainism. Chapple also describes his own pilgrimages to the Great Stupa at Shambhala Mountain Center in Colorado, the five elemental temples (*pañcamahābhūta mandir*) in south India, and the Jaina cosmology complex in Hastinapur. An appendix with practical instructions that integrate Yoga postures with meditative reflections on the five elements is included.

“Chapple has brought together material that informs and educates others into the depth and profundity of what Yoga is and its relevance today. It is a timely work in our recognition of the need for greater reflection, contemplation, awakening, and action for the benefit of all life.” — Ian Whicher, coeditor of *Yoga: The Indian Tradition*

Contents

Illustrations

Acknowledgments

Foreword

John Grim and Mary Evelyn Tucker

Introduction: Yoga and Landscapes

The Inner World as Precondition for Experience

Earth: Loving the Land

Water: Life-giver and Purifier

Fire: Locus of Desire

Air: Wind and Breath

Animal Stories from the Upanisads, the Jātaka Tales, the Pancatantra, Jaina Narratives, and the

Yogavāsistha

The Yoga of Space

Appendix: Constructing the Mandala through Yoga Sādhana

Notes

Bibliography

Index

Excerpt: This book explores the practice of Yoga in regard to a systematic technique of performing concentration on the five elements. It examines some ideas that also concerned the pre-Socratic philosophers of Greece. Just as Thales mused about water and Heraclitus extolled the power of fire, Indian thinkers, theologians, and liturgists reflected on how the elements interweave with one another and within the human body to create the raw material for the experience of life. In a real and metaphorical sense, according to Indian thought, we live in landscapes and landscapes live in us.

For more than 3,500 years, India has identified earth, water, fire, air, and space as the foundational building blocks of external reality. Starting with literary praise of these elements in the Vedas, by the time of the Buddha, the Upanisads, and early Jainism, this acknowledgment had grown into a systematic reflection. This book examines both the descriptions of the elements and the very technical training

tools that emerged so that human beings might develop regard and consideration for them. Hindus, Buddhists, and Jain Yogis explore the human-earth relationship each in their own way. For Hindus, nature emerges as a theme in the Vedas, the Upanisads, the Yoga literature, the epics, and the Purānas. The Yogis develop a mental discipline of sustained interiorization, known as *panca mahābhūta dhāranā* (concentration on the five great elements) and as *bhūta suddhi* (purification of the elements). The Buddha himself also taught a sequential meditation on the five elements. The Jains developed their own unique reflections on nature, finding life in particles of earth, water, fire, and air. They also developed their own form of sequential elemental meditations.

Indian culture recognizes the elements and the senses in myriad ways, encoding them into the rhythms and rituals of daily life. Rituals begin with the kindling of a small flame, the lighting of incense, the sprinkling of water, the preparation of offerings of flowers and food. Such practices acknowledge human embeddedness in and indebtedness to nature. They also express an underlying grammar for ritual writ large. Personal rituals and large public rituals incorporate the honoring of earth, water, fire, air, and space.

The book begins with an exploration of the celebration of the five elements in Indian literature chronologically, starting with Vedic texts and extending into Buddhist, Jain, and later Hindu literature. It also includes an exploration of select descriptions of contemporary field encounters with element-based rituals in India and in North America. In addition to a systematic look at how the fundamentals of physical constituents help enfold the human person into a sense of connectedness with inner and outer landscape, this book also explores some aspects of other beings in this landscape, animals that are other than human. Animals reflect possibilities of human consciousness, speaking to human connectivity with an unknowable past. Hindu, Buddhist, and Jain literature abounds with animal fables and instructive past life animal narratives. Concern for animals throughout Indian history can be seen in Asokan proclamations requiring the protection and feeding of animals, cow shelters, and in current animal welfare activism. Various campaigns seek to save the tiger, the elephant, the Himalayan antelope, and even the feral urban dog. Humans and animals live in a web of interconnectedness. This book seeks to provide some appreciation for what is possible in both the inner and outer realms of the living landscape, within the elements of human and animal physiology as expressed through and within the wider world.

Yoga as explored in this book goes far beyond the familiar physical practices of poses and breathing exercises. The word *yoga* originally referred to the yoking of horses to a chariot, and a plow to oxen. It eventually gained association with yoking the mind and exerting control over the outflow of the senses. By time of the middle Upanisads the word *Yoga* came to refer to specific spiritual disciplines and eventually became a catchall phrase in Hindu, Buddhist, and Jain literature for religious practice. *Yoga* as a path of spirituality appears in the *Mahābhārata*, the *Bhagavad Gitā*, the *Yoga Upanisads*, the texts of *Mahāyāna Buddhism*, handbooks for the practice of *Jainism*, and, by the middle of the current millennium, in manuals for *Hatha Yoga*.

The emergence of Yoga as a cultural phenomenon within America and Europe can be traced to the lecture tours of Swami Vivekananda in the 1890s. This was preceded in New England with the Transcendentalist fascination with the Bhagavad Gītā as well as with the notion that the yogi somehow dwells outside societal confines. As has been well documented by historians of modern Yoga, Paramahansa Yogananda was among the first of many immigrants from India who introduced and adapted Yoga-focused practice for Western consumption. During the 1960s, counterculture poets and philosophers expanded the reach of Yoga and meditation among the young people seeking alternative lifestyles. Many Yoga-focused communities took root in the 1970s, such as Yogaville (Swami Satchidananda), the Himalayan Institute (Swami Rama), various Yoga Vedanta Centers (Swami Vishnudevananda), the Sri Chinmoy meditation network, the International Society for Krishna Consciousness (A. C. Bhaktivedanta Swami Prabhupāda), and several others. After a lull during the 1980s, partly due to various scandals that plagued some organizations, a resurgence of interest occurred in the 1990s with the emergence of younger, female teachers, most notably Swami Chidvilasananda (a disciple of Swami Muktananda) and Mātā Amrtānandamayī Devi (Ammachi).

At the same time, a new physicality was injected into the practice of Yoga. Disciples in the lineage of Krishnamacharya opened studios worldwide dedicated to the perfection of Yoga Asana. These included Yoga Works, established in Santa Monica, California, by Chuck Miller and the late Maty Ezraty and now franchised worldwide, the B. K. S. Iyengar network of studios, and the Hot Yoga popularized by Bikram Choudhury. More than 35 million Americans are now estimated to practice Yoga regularly.

Along with this increase in popularity, scholarly interest in the study of Yoga flourished. Mircea Eliade (1907-1986) published the first comprehensive study in the West of Yoga traditions based on his doctoral dissertation at the University of Paris (1933), which was later adapted and translated into English as the book *Yoga, Immortality, and Freedom* (1958). This book surveys the far reach of Yoga. It documents the intersection of Yoga with various religious and philosophical traditions, including Buddhism and Jainism. Students of Eliade at the University of Chicago conducted research for decades that advanced knowledge of Yoga, theoretical and applied.

Several Yoga worlds now run in parallel. One world of Yoga promulgates physical practice in studios, meditation centers, and increasingly in clinics, schools, colleges, universities, and even churches and synagogues throughout North America. Various professional organizations have emerged to manage aspects of this public Yoga, including Yoga Alliance and the International Association of Yoga Therapists.

Another world of Yoga can be found in more religious or devotional settings, including the many Hindu and Jaina centers that have been built by members of the Indian immigrant community since the 1980s, as well as the Vedanta centers that date from the nineteenth century, and the meditation centers that were built in the early twentieth century, primarily by Paramahansa Yogananda.

Academic study comprises a third world of Yoga discourse. In India, fifty-four colleges and universities have received authorization to offer a Diploma as well as Bachelor, Master, and Doctoral Degrees in Yoga. Graduate degree programs in Yoga are offered at the School of Oriental and African Studies in

London, the Ca' Foscari University, Venice in Italy, and Loyola Marymount University in Los Angeles. Scholars have both celebrated and critiqued the Yoga movement. In earlier publications, I have surveyed various modern studies and many translations of the Yoga Sūtra, including the analysis of modern Yoga in India by Joseph Alter which explores scientific studies of Yoga in India and suggests that Yoga evades politicization; the discussions by Sjöman taken up later by Mark Singleton that attest to hybrid influences at the Mysore Palace that combine European body culture with Yoga practices;⁵ and Elizabeth De Michelin's assessment of Yoga as a form of public esotericism that brings "solace, physical, psychological or spiritual in a world where solace and reassurance are sometimes elusive." I have also edited a book on the relationship between Yoga discourse and the post-modern issue of ecology.

More recent scholarly analyses have pointed to the multivalency of Yoga throughout history. David Gordon White's edited volume *Yoga in Practice* presents original texts of Yoga from the various schools of Hinduism as well as Buddhism, Jainism, Islam, and Sikhism. Geoffrey Samuel's *Origins of Yoga and Tantra* similarly examines classical sources in regard to Yoga, as does the volume *Roots of Yoga* co-edited and co-translated by Mark Singleton and James Mallinson. Each of these works continues a tradition established by scholars of the nineteenth century seeking to find textual affirmation of Yoga theory and practice.

Alongside these decidedly Indological studies, several theoretical critiques of Yoga have examined modern Yoga and its expression in India and throughout the globe. Andrea Jain has analyzed the commercialization of Yoga suggesting that the "selling" of Yoga often results in compromises in regard to its original intent, but that sincere expressions of Yoga can be found in India as well as abroad.' Farah Godrej explores the paradoxical quest for authenticity within modern Yoga, pointing out that in some ways its contemporary practice serves to reinforce "neoliberal subjectivity" while in other ways it provides a counternarrative to conformity, a way of resisting cultural hegemony in any form. Christopher Miller has published a study of the annual Yoga Day movement initiated by the Government of India in 2015 and ratified by the United Nations. Yoga Day envisions a Yoga that will create more productive workers.

This is perhaps somewhat at odds with the original intent of Yoga, which in its meditative forms is used more as a respite from the world than as a tool to improve GDP. Miller notes that "Modi's domestic brand of therapeutic yoga does in fact serve as an instrument of biopower as it primarily focuses on the production of an efficient, healthy, docile, and stress-free labor force." Many of these studies suggest that a subverting of Yoga has taken place. As the title of Andrea Jain's book asserts, what was once subversive and countercultural, both in India and throughout the world, has been transformed into a mainstream commodity.

The methodology employed in this study of Yoga in relationship to elemental concentrations does not fit into a strictly Indological category, though it includes textual analysis and translation. Nor does this book offer a sociological descriptive approach or analysis of the practice of Yoga, though it does describe Yoga practices and many field experiences. Rather, in keeping with my own disciplinary training and prior research projects, this book is a work of constructive theology. It seeks to explore how

various Yoga texts and practices and social realities regard the intersection between the human being and nature as expressed through the five elements and animals.

One task of the theologian is to find and offer inspiration to help redress or even redeem the all-too-obvious difficulties that surround and sometimes overwhelm the human condition. The impetus for writing this book came from a concern for what has now been named "nature deficit disorder." As noted by Richard Louv, a deep disconnect from nature has imperiled a sense of well-being for many persons. This was not the case in my own life, which from childhood has been deeply rooted in a sense of nature connection. A sustained connection with the natural world has provided solace in times of trouble and a strong foundation for a happy life. For this I am abidingly grateful. This research has been undertaken to honor my teachers and family who have consistently valued and fostered a close relationship with the natural world.

Some may find this work to be fanciful or even incorrect, protesting that Yoga and meditation and the religions of India are designed to release a person from nature, not to embrace nature. However, as scholar George James, a student of environmental activist Sunderlal Bahuguna, has noted, the world to be negated is "not the world of nature" but "the world of ... politicians [and] technicians," those who seek to instrumentalize and abuse nature rather than understanding or appreciating nature. James's book-length study of the Chipko and related environmental movements in India can be paraphrased as follows: "Nature is not the problem; human industrialization and the manipulation of nature are the problem."

This book examines Yoga literature from multiple religions on the topic of the elements and animals. From this literature, a sense can be gleaned not of a disdain for the elements in Hinduism, Buddhism, and Jainism, but a concern to develop intimacy, to perform rituals that reinforce a connection with the most foundational aspects of reality.

It is not the intent of this book to create a Romantic vision of the Indian subcontinent. The environmental problems of India are immense. New Delhi, the capital of India, suffers from the worst air quality in the world. Garbage lines the highways and byways of India. Untreated industrial and human waste foul India's rivers. The deleterious effects of overpopulation can be seen as cities fail to cope with basic housing needs and villagers by the millions move to the cities. However, it would be oversimplistic to blame the religions of India for its current predicament. Ecological degradation in India can be more readily traced to the aftereffects of European colonization and the slowness of governments and individuals to respond to the throwaway ethos of globalized consumerist economies.

Writing this book has become an occasion to reflect back on a five decade career as a theologian. The task of the theologian, in addition to knowing history and languages and philosophy, requires that we observe and interpret culture. We also participate in a feedback loop of our own experience as the ground for our hermeneutical endeavors. In my twenties, a time of uncertainty and growth, my research focused on the issue of human agency and will, resulting in the book *Karma and Creativity*. Ethics, personal and global, as well as child-rearing, occupied my thoughts and concerns during my thirties,

during which I published *Nonviolence to Animals, Earth, and Self in Asian Traditions*. Comparative religious thought and grappling with philosophical pluralism guided the work of my forties and the appearance of *Reconciling Yogas: Haribhadra's Collection of Views on Yoga with a New Translation of Haribhadra's Yogadrstisamuccaya*. The fifties presented an opportunity to honor my teachers and professors, many of whom passed in the early years of the new millennium, through an-in depth study into the philosophy and practice of Yoga, the mainstay and wellspring for my own well-being; hence the publication of *Yoga and the Luminous: Patanjali's Spiritual Path to Freedom*. And now, in my sixties, reflections on the ritual and liturgical aspects of religious practice have brought forward the current work.

This book places Yoga ethics within a global context. Yoga, as we have seen, means connection. Despite colonialist insistence that Yoga implies hatred for the world,' the evidence from the texts and from the material presence of temples and ongoing practices within daily life tells a different story. Yoga, regardless of tradition, seeks to honor the five great elements. It also encourages discovering kinship with animals. Though far more suggestive than comprehensive, this book seeks to provide some appreciation for what is possible through Yoga in both the inner and outer realms of the living landscape. <>

TRANSFORMING INDUSTRIAL POLICY FOR THE DIGITAL AGE: PRODUCTION, TERRITORIES AND STRUCTURAL CHANGE edited by Patrizio Bianchi, Clemente Ruiz Durán, Sandrine Labory [Edward Elgar Publishing, 9781788976145]

TRANSFORMING INDUSTRIAL POLICY FOR THE DIGITAL AGE: PRODUCTION, TERRITORIES AND STRUCTURAL CHANGE argues that digital globalization is inducing deep and productive transformations, making industrial policy necessary in order to reorientate development towards inclusive and more sustainable growth. It demonstrates that industrialization remains an important development process for emerging economies.

Featuring contributions by leading scholars, this timely book unpacks the dynamics of 'Industry 4.0', including computer-based algorithms, integration with cloud computing, and the Internet of Things. As existing global value chains take advantage of the new technologies to reorganize production, the contributors explore the implications of new industrial policies, and to what extent they have promoted structural changes that maintain sustainability. This book reflects on the lessons that can be drawn from the history of national industrial policies from across the globe, covering the successes and failures of national policy in promoting industry in response to productive transformations in industrial organization.

Insightful and nuanced, this book will benefit scholars of both economics and industrial public policy. International experts and policy-makers will also appreciate this book's critical insight into the transformative shifts in global industrial organization and policies.

Contents

List of contributors

Introduction

Patrizio Bianchi, Sandrine Labory and Clemente Ruiz Durán

PART I IMPACT OF INDUSTRY 4.0 ON MANUFACTURING

1 The role of manufacturing versus services in economic development by Jostein Hauge and Ha-Joon Chang

2 The "lightness" of Industry 4.0 lead firms: implications for global value chains by Lukas Brun, Gary Gereffi and James Zhan

3 The National Innovation System (NIS) and readiness for the fourth industrial revolution: South Korea compared with four European countries by Keun Lee and Jongho Lee

PART II LESSONS FROM PAST INDUSTRIAL POLICY

4 Industry and government in the long run: on the true story of the American model by Marco R. Di Tommaso, Mattia Tassinari and Andrea Ferrannini

5 Chinese industrialization, planning and policies: local growth and global equilibria by Marco R. Di Tommaso, Chiara Pollio, Elisa Barbieri and Lairetta Rubini

6 Long-term challenges of industrial development in Latin America and the Caribbean by Jorge Máttar

7 The future of industrial policies in the world: towards a new manufacturing narrative by Clemente Ruiz Durán

PART III UNEVEN DEVELOPMENT IN TIMES OF INDUSTRIAL REVOLUTION AND NEED FOR TERRITORIAL INDUSTRIAL POLICY

8 Industry 4.0+ challenges to local productive systems and place-based integrated industrial policies by Marco Bellandi, Lisa De Propriis and Enrica Santini

9 Economic policy in the time of reactionary populism by Michael J. Piore and David W Skinner

Index

Excerpt: Structural changes arising in specific industries might have effects on other industries (due to complementarities) and on the whole economic system. Industrial policy must therefore be based on an analysis of productive processes, but also on analyses of the interactions between different productive processes. Favouring structural changes in one sector may have positive or negative impacts on other sectors; it may also impact upon the labour market, changing the skill required in the labour force, as well as wages. The analysis of trajectories of structural change must therefore be performed to choose specific trajectories and a mix of measures to favour the evolution of the economy towards these trajectories. Industrial policy has always been implemented in times of important structural changes for industries. Governments at various levels are concerned that the industries in the territory will be able to adapt, as well as develop in new ways.

So many questions are raised: can some trends be outlined in productive transformations? Are services more important than manufacturing? How should action be articulated at national and regional, but also supranational levels?

This book originates from a conference organized by the Emilia Romagna Region of Italy in October 2017, aiming at reflecting on these crucial matters by creating a network of academics, economists from international organization, institutional and business stakeholders, as well as representatives of the civil society.

The book is not aimed at a review of industrial policy. The literature is now wide and there is consensus that it is useful and that it aims at favouring structural changes in industries. The above-mentioned changes are structural and require industrial policy: the institutional framework has to adapt (think, for instance, of the new regulation needed for artificial intelligence, particularly for traffic with self-driving cars, but also for new medical treatments based on nanorobots introduced into the body to directly cure infected cells), and innovation, education and social policies respectively have to provide appropriate infrastructure and favour the development of adequate capabilities.

Bianchi and Labory analyse what industrial policy is needed today. They argue that in order to favour structural changes one has to look at the mechanisms of productive transformation. Structural changes imply developing new productive capabilities, which are necessary to reshape global value chains and favour the emergence of new ones. For this purpose, coordinated action is needed in the multilevel governance process: actions at regional, national and supranational levels must be coordinated and coherently implemented. They also argue that action at regional level is particularly important in order to prepare for the industrial revolution.

In this context, this book aims at realising a reflection on market trends, structural changes, and how much industrial policy currently implemented in countries really promotes structural changes and orientates industrial development towards specific and preferred paths.

The conference was intended as the first in a series of reflections on these very complex issues. It started from an analysis of the state of the art, hence industrial policies at national level, highlighting the different approaches and implemented actions. An analysis of current market trends — namely, globalisation and the disruptive impact of the fourth industrial revolution — was performed to outline the new issues that are raised in terms of industrial policy in this context. Finally, the conference concluded by outlining the role of territories. Briefly, territories have a role to play in mobilising tangible and intangible resources to build the capabilities necessary to make them hubs in the digital and globalised world. There are many examples of effective regional industrial policies, implemented coherently in a multi-level governance framework, which have contributed to making the regional territory attractive to businesses and oriented towards favourable industrial development paths. The Emilia-Romagna region is one case illustrated in Bianchi and Labory. Innovation and high-tech is important, but industrial development concerns all sectors, so that even lagging regions can define and implement industrial policy that are appropriate to their local conditions. This is very important to

induce a balanced industrial development and growth, which should be a primary aim of policy, as shown by current events such as Brexit and the rise of populism in many areas, as outlined by Michael Piore and David Skinner in the concluding Chapter 9 of this book. The chapter regards the United States of America (US), but its analysis applies to any place.

The book is organised as follows. In Chapter 1, Jostein Hauge and Ha-Joon Chang discuss the importance of manufacturing in economic development. They examine the various arguments that have been put forward for and against, and they show that it is indeed essential, and industrialisation remains a necessary phase of development. More precisely, the authors conclude that while both the potential for contribution to productivity growth and the tradability of services have increased, manufacturing remains the backbone of productivity growth and economic development. Economic development has hardly ever happened without industrialisation; manufacturing has a larger multiplier effect in the economy than services; the falling share of the manufacturing sector in gross domestic product (GDP) in many countries is somewhat of an illusion; manufactured goods remain far more tradable than services; and the supposed risk of automation of manufacturing jobs in developing countries is mostly hype without evidence.

Chapter 2 by Lukas Brun, Gary Gereffi and James Zhan analyses recent evolutionary trends in GVCs, with a particular focus on the implications of the adoption of the new technologies of the fourth industrial revolution (Industry 4.0). They argue that recent dynamics in GVCs include: rationalisation, in that lead firms have tended to reduce the number of suppliers; regionalisation, namely a concentration of production in broad regions, mainly North America, Europe and Asia; and resiliency and digitisation, which means the use of advanced data analytical tools and physical technologies to improve the digital connectivity and technological capabilities of supply chains. The authors outline three major effects of Industry 4.0 on GVCs and derive three possible scenarios of future evolution according to whether digital multinational organisations (MNEs) will develop in a complementary manner to existing firms (complementary scenario), will disrupt existing firms (displacement scenario), or whether existing firms will be able to adapt and develop alongside digital MNEs (adaptation scenario).

Chapter 3 by Keun Lee and Jongho Lee examines to what extent are countries prepared for the fourth industrial revolution, by looking at several dimensions of their National Innovation Systems (NISs). The focus is on five countries, namely South Korea, Germany, France, Italy and the United Kingdom (UK). Using patent data in the last decade, the authors compare five indicators: originality, cycle time of technologies, knowledge localisation, technological diversification, and inventor-level concentration of innovation activities. They conclude that the UK and Germany appear to be well prepared for the fourth industrial revolution, France has medium preparation, Italy exhibits low preparation, and the Korean NIS has good indicators but is still low in terms of originality.

These first chapters in Part I provide useful insights on the productive transformations occurring as a result of digital globalisation, namely the fourth industrial revolution, as well as its policy implications. Industrial policy aims at favouring structural changes in industries, so it is the main policy that has to be mobilised in order to favour the transition. As shown by Bianchi and Labory (2018a, 2018b), industrial

policy in times of deep structural transformation such as an industrial revolution has to be designed and implemented jointly and coherently with other policies, particularly education and training, social and labour, infrastructure, trade, antitrust and regulation policies.

Part II of the book therefore looks at the lessons that can be drawn from past experiences of national industrial policies. To begin with, Chapter 4 by Marco Di Tommaso, Mattia Tassinari and Andrea Ferrarinni looks at the US industrial policy in the long run. The authors show that the US government has continuously promoted structural changes in its industries, through various means and actions that are analysed in the chapter.

In Chapter 5, Marco Di Tommaso, Chiara Pollio, Elisa Barbieri and Lauretta Rubini examine and show the essential role of industrial policy in the industrialisation process of China. An interesting focus of the chapter is on the 'specialized towns' programme, which reflects attention of the Chinese government to places, since it has favoured the agglomeration of industrial activities in some Chinese provinces. The programme has been successful in spurring industrial development in these areas; however, it has produced uneven development in the country, since other areas have been left behind.

In fact, Bianchi and Labory outline that the risk of uneven development is generally high in times of industrial revolution. Previous industrial revolutions, from the first to the third, have tended to favour some places or regions at the expense of others. Consequently, unless governments intervened to rebalance development, disparities were created. The evidence of Industry 4.0 is that this risk also exists nowadays, implying a role for regional industrial policy.

Chapter 6 by Jorge Máttar looks at industrial policy in Latin America and the Caribbean. He shows that past industrial policies have not been effective, because they missed actions to prepare industries to structural changes. For instance, many countries based their development on exports of raw materials and encountered problems when their prices fell. Industrial policy favouring upgrading — and particularly, in this case, the transformation of raw materials — could have helped to mitigate the negative effects of price reductions. Jorge Máttar therefore argues that the fourth industrial revolution could be taken as an occasion to adopt appropriate industrial policies, namely policies aimed at preparing the national industrial systems for the deep structural changes taking place and expected to take place in the future. The author delineates some principles and elements that these industrial policies should adopt. He stresses in particular the necessity for participative governance processes, where governments and stakeholders dialogue and interact in order to identify possible development paths and choose actions in favour of the chosen path.

Chapter 7 by Clemente Ruiz Durán shows the complexity of the challenges of today's global society and argues that industrial policy has a role to play in resolving these challenges. One particular issue which is outlined is that current structural changes require institutional adaptation, which is usually a slow process, while technologies and businesses change fast.

These chapters highlight that industrial development is an engine of social and cultural development. Industrial revolutions have profound impacts not only on economic, but also on social and cultural life.

Industrial adaptation and industrial policy therefore have to take these socio-cultural implications into account in order to ensure an even development of the territory. The last two chapters of the book, in Part III, outline the risks of uneven development and the necessity of this comprehensive view in which the design and implementation of industrial policy should be considered.

Marco Bellandi, Lisa de Propriis and Enrica Santini highlight in Chapter 8 that industrial policy has to pay attention to local specificities, and has to be comprehensive in the sense of taking all dimensions of development (not only economic, but also social) into account. This is important especially for the adaptation of small and medium-sized enterprise (SME) systems. They therefore delineate place-based industrial policies at the intersection between technological change and territories.

In Chapter 9, Michael Piore and David Skinner show that the risks of uneven development are reflected in the boom of reactionary populism in the US; due, according to the authors, to the implementation of wrong policies. The chapter argues that past policy paradigms such as the 'Washington consensus' or the 'Silicon Valley consensus' have failed, mainly because the structural adjustment processes vary across territories and countries, with different speeds and different characteristics. Each territory should design coherent policies favouring structural changes in an inclusive manner, starting from a dialogue with stakeholders. In particular, the authors stress the importance of the dialogue between businesses and schools so that appropriate skills are trained in workers.

More generally, they argue that the Keynesian paradigm should be referred to today; not to implement it straight away, but as a reference for a reflection on what type of policies are desirable today. This, they say, 'seems particularly important at the current moment, which in so many ways resembles the inter-war period where public policy was caught by surprise, unprepared and ill-equipped to respond to the political reaction against globalization.

A political economy approach to industry analysis and industrial policy design and implementation thus seems highly relevant in these times of deep structural transformations. There is indeed a real risk of not having the right tools for a full understanding of the changes in social and political relations that structure economic actions. We need to gain an understanding of complex social phenomena, using all the tools of interdisciplinary dialogue at our disposal, in order to avoid the reactions against globalization turning into a wave of anti-democratic closed-mindedness.

This book therefore aims at contributing to this need for a better comprehension of the ongoing structural transformations, by highlighting their structuring elements, namely innovation, territory, people's rights and institutions. The democratic development of our world will depend on how these elements are balanced in the near future. <>

KALILA AND DIMNA by Nasrullah Munshi, Translated from the Persian by Wheeler Thackston [Hackett Publishing Company, Inc., 9781624668098]

Fables and fairy tales featuring dynamic animal characters have captured the imaginations of children and adults around the world for thousands of years. Tales are often handed down from generation to generation because of their compelling story lines and the wisdom they offer. Fables relate to our lives, no matter who we are or where we live. *Kalila wa Dimna* (**KALILA AND DIMNA**) is a collection of animal fables that centers around the jackals **KALILA AND DIMNA**, who are also brothers. The story cycle originated in India more than two thousand years ago and circulated widely in the Near East. It is considered one of the most popular collections of stories ever written. Three of the stories have been adapted in this book; they are tales about resourcefulness, jealousy, and friendship.

Review

"**KALILA AND DIMNA** is an important work of world literature that pertains to several areas of intellectual inquiry: the history of literary translation, cultural exchange, animals and allegory, and mirrors for princes. Thackston's translation of this classical Persian text is elegant and idiomatic, and the multiple prefaces are useful in tracking the movement of this work across cultures. This is **a book that can be enjoyed by students, scholars, and general readers alike.**" —Sunil Sharma, Boston University

"**This masterful translation of one of the most popular books of world literature** makes available to an English readership the animal tales known collectively as **KALILA AND DIMNA**. Named after the two jackals of **PANCATANTRA** fame, this collection of stories is based on a 12th-century Persian translation of an 8th-century original Arabic rendition by Ibn al-Muqaffa'. Set within a frame narrative of counsels given to the Raja of India by his Brahmin minister, the engaging tales about cats and mice, storks and crabs, tortoises and geese, owls and crows, and princes and ascetics, function as cautionary illustrations of human predicaments and all-too-human vices and virtues. Far from being a collection of children's fables, **KALILA AND DIMNA** is a Machiavellian mirror for princes containing advice on how to preserve oneself from one's enemies and get ahead at court and in life. The dialogues that constitute the bulk of the narrative harbor a dramatic immediacy, exerting **a powerful effect even on a modern-day reader.**" —Maria Subtelny, University of Toronto

Contents
 Introduction
 Nasrullah's Preface
 Ibn al-Muqaffa's Preface
 Buzurjmihir Bokhtagan's Preface
 The Testament of Burzoë, Physician of Persia
 Kalita and Dimna
 Chapter One: The Lion and the Bull

The Monkey That Pulled Out the Wedge
The Fox That Tried to Eat a Drum
The Holy Man's Adventures
The Crow That Killed a Snake
The Heron That Schemed against the Crab
The Rabbit That Outwitted the Lion
The Fates of the Three Fish
The Duck That Saw the Reflection of a Star in the Water
The Wolf, the Crow, and the Jackal That Conspired against the Camel
The Plover That Threatened the Spirit of the Sea
The Contentious Turtle and the Ducks
The Bird That Tried to Advise Monkeys
The Two Partners and the Betrayed Trust
The Frog, the Crab, and the Weasel
The Iron-Eating Mice
Chapter Two: The Trial of Dimna
The Lover and His Slave
The Quack Physician
The Scheming Gamekeeper
Chapter Three: The Benefits of True Friendship
The Dove, the Mouse, the Crow, the Turtle, and the Gazelle
The Woman Who Sold Sesame for Sesame
How the Greedy Wolf Died Eating a Bowstring
Chapter Four: The Consequences of Failing to Beware of Enemies
The Owls and the Crows
The Birds That Wanted to Make the Owl Their Prince
The Rabbit That Made Himself a Messenger of the Moon
The Partridge and the Hare Take Their Case to the Cat
Three Charlatans Fool an Ascetic
The Old Merchant and His Young Wife
The Holy Man, the Thief and the Demon
The Unfaithful Wife and Her Foolish Husband
The Mouse That Was Offered the Sun, the Cloud, the Wind, and the Mountain in Marriage
The Snake That Served the Frog
Chapter Five: The Monkey and the Turtle
The Monkey and the Turtle
The Donkey without Ears or Heart
Chapter Six: The Ascetic and the Weasel
The Ascetic and the Weasel
The Hermit Who Spilled the Honey and Oil
Chapter Seven: The Cat and the Mouse The Cat and the Mouse
Chapter Eight: The King and the Bird Finza
The King and the Bird Finza

The Old Woman and Her Daughter

Chapter Nine: The Lion and the Jackal The Lion and the Jackal

The history of the fables known variously as **KALILA AND DIMNA** and the Bidpai Fables is long and involved. It began in India with a collection of animal fables that became known as the Pancatantra 'Five Sections' set in a frame story, some version of which is thought to have been composed around the third century before our era) Over time the Sanskrit **PANCATANTRA** has inspired at least twenty-five recensions and many translations into regional languages in India, but this preface is concerned instead with the westward migration of the tales.

According to the oft-repeated legend, a version of the tales was brought to Iran from India and translated into Middle Persian by a physician named Burzoë at the behest of Chosroës I Anoshirvan, who ruled Persia from AD 531 to 579. The Middle Persian translation and the Sanskrit text from which it was purportedly made have both disappeared without a trace.

Not long after the Middle Persian version was produced it was translated into Syriac. This version is known as the Old Syriac to distinguish it from a later one, and so far as is known, it gave rise to no other versions.

In the middle of the eighth century, an Arabic-writing Persian scholar named Ibn al-Muqaffa` translated the Middle Persian into Arabic. One of the earliest examples of literary narrative prose in Arabic, the translation became a model of elegant writing and achieved such lasting popularity that it is still read in schools all over the Arab world. Translations of it were made into (1) Syriac, (2) Greek, (3) Persian, (4) Hebrew, and (5) Spanish.

A Syriac translation of Ibn al-Muqaffa"s Arabic was made by an unidentified Christian priest in the tenth or eleventh century (the New Syriac version).

A Greek translation was made around 1050 by Simeon, son of Seth, and that was rendered at some point, perhaps as early as the twelfth century, into Old Slavonic and later into Italian.

<https://www.amazon.com/Kalila-Dimna-Nasrullah-Munshi/dp/1624668097/>

The first rendering of **KALILA AND DIMNA** into Persian was made by the poet Rudaki in the mid-tenth century, but only a few scattered lines of his work remain. Around 1120 Abu'l-Ma'ali Nasrullah, a writer employed in the court chancery of the rulers of the Ghaznavid Empire, freely translated Ibn al-Muqaffa"s Arabic into New Persian and dedicated his work to the ruler Bahramshah (r. 1117-1157). It is apparent that Nasrullah found the economy of expression that characterizes Ibn al-Muqaffa's Arabic—not to mention the elegance of diction—difficult to capture in Persian. His version is significantly expanded, and what was expressed in one pithy phrase in Arabic may run to a page of Persian, not counting the lines of epigrammatic poetry, often Arabic, that were inserted in conformity with the approved style of the time. Nasrullah's version is also replete with quotations from the Koran and hadith, "all of which [sound] rather quaint in the mouths of animals in the jungles of India."

At the end of the fifteenth century, Nasrullah's Persian having become hopelessly old-fashioned, Husayn Va`iz Kashifi, a Timurid polymath, composed a new version in the fashionably elegant prose of the period and called it *Anvār-i Suhayli* 'The Lights of Canopus. After lavishing praise on Nasrullah's prose style, Kashifi adds:

However, because he introduces strange words, embellishes his prose with Arabic features, overdoes the use of various metaphors and similes, and is too wordy in obscure locutions and expressions, the mind of the listener fails to enjoy the purpose of the book and to comprehend the contents, and the reader is also unable to connect the beginning of a story to the end. All this inevitably leads to weariness on the part of the reader and listener, especially in this elegant time, when people have reached such a level of subtlety that they can comprehend meanings without their being decked out in verbiage, not to mention the fact that for some words one has to thumb through dictionaries and search to discover the meaning. For all these reasons, such a valuable book was almost abandoned and nearly became obsolete, and the people of the world were on the verge of being deprived of its benefits.

In addition to being completely reworded in a much more fluid Persian, Kashifi's version is considerably expanded from Nasrullah's. While he retains the basic framework and stories of the earlier version, Kashifi added a number of stories, making his version considerably longer than Nasrullah's. A hundred years after Kashifi, it was once again felt that it was time for a stylistic revision. This time the Mughal emperor Akbar's friend and biographer Abu'l-Fazl composed a new version entitled *Iyār-i dānish* 'The Assay of Knowledge' in the Persian style prevalent in India at that time.

Ibn al-Muqaffa's Arabic version also contains these five chapters, but after the first chapter, to accord with Islamic sensibilities, which demanded justice for Dimna's outrageous scheming against the bull, he inserts a chapter on the trial of Dimna. After those six chapters, Ibn al-Muqaffa's version also contains another eight chapters, (7) *Īlādh* (the minister), *Shādrām* (the king), and *Īrākht* (the king's wife); (8) the cat and the mouse; (9) the king and the bird *Finza*; (10) the lion and the fasting jackal; (11) the traveler and the goldsmith, and the monkey, the snake, and the tiger; (12) the king, the nobleman's son, the merchant's son, and the husbandman's son; (13) the archer, the she-wolf, and the jackal; and (14) the ascetic and the guest. The cat and the mouse of chapter eight, the king and the bird of chapter nine, and the lion and the jackal of chapter ten are all found in the *Mahābhārata*. These three stories are found already in the Old Syriac translation, so whatever text the Syriac translator had must have included them.

In Nasrullah's version there are, in addition to Ibn al-Muqaffa's fourteen chapters, four prefaces: (1) Nasrullah's preface outlining the history of the book, (2) a Persian adaptation of Ibn al-Muqaffa's preface, (2) Buzurjmihir's preface to Burzoë's translation, and (4) the testament of the physician Burzoë.

Major themes that are stressed throughout versions of *Kalila and Dimna* in their Islamic guise are *hazm*, a quality that is a combination of resolve, firmness, judiciousness, and prudence, and *muruvvat* 'gallantry.' *Muruvvat* is etymologically connected to the Arabic word for 'man' (*mar*) and would be the equivalent of 'manliness' were not modern notions of manliness at such odds with the medieval ideal. It would also

be the equivalent of 'virtue,' which is derived from the Latin for 'man,' vir, if the modern understanding of virtue were not limited to moral excellence. The ideals of chivalry are not far from those of muruvvat, but chivalry conjures up images of knights in armor and is inappropriate. The best modern word for muruvvat is probably 'gallantry' because it still contains implications of moral excellence, bravery and courage, and good manners, all of which are implied in muruvvat. The Persian equivalent of muruvvat is hunar, and both words are often found on the pages of **KALILA AND DIMNA**.

Another quality that is often mentioned is 'ignorance' (jahl, nādāni). For the Arabic- and Persian-writing authors of **KALILA AND DIMNA**, 'ignorance' is not so much the lack of knowledge as it is the lack of self-control—that is, impetuosity and incautiousness. Anyone who rushes into action not fully prepared and without judicious reflection on the consequences of his actions is guilty of 'ignorance.'

Much advice is given throughout concerning master-servant relationships. Few people these days have servants, and that relationship is a thing of the past, but if employer-employee relationships are substituted, much will be immediately recognizable.

In the various versions, one animal is sometimes substituted for another. For example, the [Pancatantra](#) story that is chapter five in Nasrullah's version is the story of a monkey and a crocodile. In Ibn al-Muqaffa's version, the crocodile is a tortoise (ghaylam) and remains a tortoise or turtle in subsequent versions. While some substitutions may have been made because the animal in question, like the mongoose or the crocodile, was unfamiliar in Arabic- and Persian-speaking environments, usually it makes little or no difference since the animals, while being appropriate to their settings, behave less like animals and more like human beings. In Nasrullah's chapter twelve, the King and the Brahmins, there are no animals at all. The purpose of the chapter was originally to excoriate Brahmins, and it is thought to be thoroughly Buddhist in origin. Ibn al-Muqaffa` and, following him, Nasrullah have expanded this chapter into a long and tedious exchange between the king and his minister Bilar before the resolution of the tale. Kashifi, as usual more interested in good storytelling than in faithfully reproducing an old tale, reduced the exchange to the bare minimum.

Changes in other respects, too, have been made in the various translations. In the Old Syriac version, the various holy men of the Sanskrit are called mgusē 'Magi,' or Zoroastrian priests. In the Islamic versions, they have all become nasik 'ascetics,' since in the Islamic world there was no priestly caste, and there was certainly nothing analogous to the hermits and Brahmins of the Sanskrit.

This translation has been made from Nasrullah's version, but Ibn al-Muqaffa's text has also been taken into account, and Kashifi's interpretations have been relied upon when Nasrullah's text is ambiguous or obscure.

Some liberties have been taken with the translation. Nasrullah uses a heavily Arabicized vocabulary in his Persian, "decked out in verbiage," as Kashifi says. He quite often uses Arabic words in metaphorical senses far removed from the usual meanings of the words—particularly the meanings they normally have in Persian. I have tried to render these in an understandable fashion in modern English. It is impossible, given Nasrullah's style, to fix a specific meaning to a given word and to translate it uniformly throughout

the work. Routinely omitted from translation are the quotations of Arabic poetry with which Nasrullah embellished his text. However apropos they may be to the topic at hand, they rarely sound good in translation and wind up sounding either obtuse or silly. Kashifi omitted the Arabic lines altogether, perhaps because few in his milieu would have understood them, and added a lot of Persian poetry of his own. There are also a few places in the text that are insolubly problematic. They were deleted altogether by Kashifi, a fact that may well indicate that these places in the text were already corrupt in his time. <>

SAINTHOOD AND AUTHORITY IN EARLY ISLAM: AL-HAKĪM AL-TIRMIDHĪ'S THEORY OF WILĀYA AND THE RE-ENVISIONING OF THE SUNNI CALIPHATE by Aiyub Palmer [Studies on Sufism, [Brill](#), 9789004408302]

In **SAINTHOOD AND AUTHORITY IN EARLY ISLAM: AL-HAKĪM AL-TIRMIDHĪ'S THEORY OF WILĀYA AND THE RE-ENVISIONING OF THE SUNNI CALIPHATE** Aiyub Palmer recasts *wilāya* in terms of Islamic authority and traces its development in both political and religious spheres up through the 3rd and 4th Islamic centuries. This book pivots around the ideas of al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, the first Muslim theologian and mystic to write on the topic of *wilāya*.

By looking at its structural roots in Arab and Islamic social organization, Aiyub Palmer has reframed the discussion about sainthood in early Islam to show how it relates more broadly to other forms of authority in Islam. This book not only looks anew at the influential ideas of al-Tirmidhī but also challenges current modes of thought around the nature of authority in Islamicate societies.

- Contents
- Acknowledgments
- List of Abbreviations
- System of Transliteration for Arabic Letters
- I Introduction
- 0.1 The Study of Islamic Sainthood
- 0.2 Wilāya/Walāya in the Qur'ān and Hadīth Literature
- 0.3 The Cult of Saints
- 0.4 Sainthood and Authority in the Age of Sanctification
- 0.5 Methodology
- 0.6 Sources
- 0.7 Thematic Classification of al-Tirmidhī's Works
 - 0.7.1 Wilāya
 - 0.7.2 Disciplining the Lower Self
 - 0.7.3 Esoteric Vocabulary
 - 0.7.4 Esoteric Interpretation

- 0.7.5 Polemical and Theological Works
- 0.7.6 Knowledge and Men of Learning
- 0.7.7 Moral and Ethical Teachings
- 0.7.8 Correspondence
- 0.7.9 Autobiography
- 0.8 Secondary Sources
 - 1. Wilāya/Walāya and the Basis of Authority in Early Islam
 - 1.1 Introduction
 - 1.2 The Language of Authority
 - 1.3 Wilāya/walāya as a Socio-political Construct in Early Islam
 - 1.4 Wala' as a Pattern of Social Relations in the Umayyad Period
 - 1.5 The Abbāsīd Revolution: Wilāya and Walāya in Action
 - 1.6 Legal Authority and the Development of the Schools of Law
 - 1.7 The Hanābila as a Solidarity Group
 - 1.8 Wilāya/Walāya and the Rise of the Sūfiyya
 - 1.9 The Appearance of the Awlyā'
 - 1.10 Al-Hakīm al-Tirmidhi and the Early AwCrliyā'
 - 2 The Historical and Social Context of Al-Tirmidhi's Life and Times
 - 2.1 Introduction
 - 2.2 Al-Tirmidhi's Clash with the Local 'Ulama'
 - 2.3 The Scholarly Class or the 'Ulamā'
 - 2.4 The Shī'is and the Safi Alternative
 - 2.5 Al-Tirmidhi and the Shī i Challenge
 - 2.6 Clientage (walā') as a Social Basis for Understanding Sunni Authority
 - 2.7 The Wilāya-authority Paradigm
 - 3 Wisdom Mediates the Terrestrial and Celestial
 - 3.1 The Importance of Hikma
 - 3.2 Hikma and the Hakim in the Near East
 - 3.3 Hikma and the Hakim in Jewish and Christian Thought (7th- through 10th-centuries CE)
 - 3.4 Hikma and the Hakim in 9th- and 10th-Century CE Khurāsān and Transoxania
 - 3.5 Hikma and the Hakim among the Sufis
 - 3.6 Hikma and the Hakim among the Early Ismā'īlī Shī'is
 - 3.7 Hikma and the Hakim in the Theosophy of al-Hakim al Tirmidhi
 - 3.8 The Usūlī Roots of Hikma
 - 4 The Theological Significance of Wilāya
 - 4.1 Al-Tirmidhi's Scholarly Background
 - 4.2 Major Texts of the Hanafi Theological Tradition
 - 4.3 The Development of Hanafi Theology
 - 4.4 Al-Tirmidhi's Hanafi Credentials
 - 4.5 Al-Tirmidhi's Hanafi Theology I

- 4.6 Al-Tirmidhi's Relationship to Abū Mansūr al-Māturīdī
- 4.7 Al-Tirmidhi and the Later Hanafi Tradition
- 4.8 Mysticism in the Hanafi Tradition
- 4.9 The Effect of Hanafism on al-Tirmidhi's Doctrine of Wilāya
- 4.10 The Awl yā' in early Creedal Texts
- 5 Al-Tirmidhi's Gnoseology of Sainthood
 - 5.1 Introduction
 - 5.2 Sainthood in the Homilies of Isaac of Nineveh
 - 5.3 Sainthood in the 9th-Century CE
 - 5.4 The Light-basis of al-Tirmidhi's Doctrine of Wilāya
 - 5.5 Restricting Sainthood
 - 5.6 The Optimism of al-Tirmidhi's Doctrine of Wilāya
 - 5.7 Wilāya Creates a Third Space
 - 5.8 The Political Ramifications of Hikma
 - 5.9 The Khātim al Awl iylā'
 - 5.10 The "Hierarchy of Saints"
- 6 A Sūfi by Any Other Name: Al-Tirmidhi's Relationship to Islamic Mysticism
 - 6.1 Introduction
 - 6.2 Was al-Tirmidhi a'Sūfi'?
 - 6.3 Sufism and Hellenism
 - 6.4 Early Sufism
 - 6.5 Al-Junayd and al-Tirmidhi Build on the Work of al-Muhāsibī
 - 6.6 Nīshāpūr and the Development of Sufism as a Meta-Identity
 - 6.7 Al-Sarrāj and al-Kalābādihī
 - 6.8 Al-Sulami and al-Qushayri
- Conclusion
- Bibliography
- Index of Terms and Proper Names

Excerpt: Through this work I have sought to reimagine the way we think about wilāya in the early Islamic period, by bringing a new methodological approach, new textual sources to bear, as well as a close reading of al-Tirmidhi's major works. The results have provided significant explanatory potential for numerous social, political and religious movements in early Islam. I did not want to simply write a book about al-Hakim al-Tirmidhi and his ideas. That has already been done by previous authors. My purpose was to reframe the discourse around al-Tirmidhi and his ideas and provide a new and hopefully beneficial approach to the study of Islamic Mysticism that other scholars may be able to reproduce and explore in further detail. After several attempts to apply Weber's paradigm to early Islamic wilāya, it became clear that there was a lack of congruence between the theory and the subject matter. Early on, I had tried to apply Foucault's concept of the episteme, and that too produced mediocre results. It was not until I looked for a structure within early Arab/Islamic social and political history that I began to notice the transactional and socially dynamic manner that authority conveyed within Islamic society. This approach has the possibility of allowing us to rethink not only certain aspects of Islamic Mysticism

but also the way Islamic history is understood generally. I have pointed out some of these insights throughout the book.

Instead of looking at al-Tirmidhī's gnoseology through the prism of saint-hood, I looked at wilāya as it was playing out socially and politically in the two centuries prior to al-Tirmidhī. This required tracing the historical roots of wilāya as it grew out of the early Arab/Islamic conquests and the rule of the Rāshidūn caliphs up to and including the first couple of centuries of the Abbāsids. When looking across numerous Islamic movements during the first three centuries of Islam, it is clear that wilāya occupied a very different socialsemantic universe than sainthood, while overlapping in only a few distinct areas. If wilāya was not the same as sainthood then, based on its various meanings and usages, it must be related to authority or some discourse around the negotiation of power. In fact, we find that wilāya speaks to a range of power relations in pre-Islamic and early Arab/Islamic society that coalesce around the solidarity group. It is the solidarity group that is primary in this model rather than the individual. We find social structures connected to the way solidarity groups form and interact at both the political and social levels. The city-based mercantile classes had developed strong ties of dependence with the nomadic Bedouin ethos that surrounded the urban oases. This Weltanschauung proved to imbue early Arab/Islamic social structures with durable patterns that gave precedence to transactional and diffuse types of authority that varied significantly from the more hierarchical agrarianate models often used in Islamic Studies.

This approach to early Islamic history helps us look at the development of Sufism in a different way. It brings into question Melchert's thesis that Sufism developed out of a transition from asceticism to mysticism in the 3rd/9th century. His thesis does not resolve a number of outstanding anomalies that have plagued the study of Islamic Mysticism for decades. For example, why are 'wearers of wool' always characterized differently in the literature than Sufis? The problem partly lies in the persistence of certain assumptions about Sufis, such as their being primarily mystics, and their vaulted mystical doctrines being the centerpiece of their efforts. Rather, Chapter 1 shows us that the Sufis were more concerned with correcting what they saw as negligence and abuse by the caliphal establishment. When the state persecuted them, the Sufis transformed from being a diffuse subversive movement to following a more stable contractual model founded on the doctrine of al-Junayd. One of the significant points about the Sufis is that, in doing so, they developed a solidarity group that could absorb other solidarity groups and thus become a type of meta-solidarity group. Al-Tirmidhī developed out of the same Basran-based milieu that gave rise to the Sūfiyya. Al-Tirmidhī focused on the wilāya model of the early zuhhād such as Ibrāhīm b. Adham and Fudayl b. `lyād, who were Traditionists representing a contractual authority structure outside of the nascent madhāhib. It is these two types of authority that eventually merge to then be reconstituted in Nīshāpūr in the 9th-century CE.

Chapter 2 explains how al-Tirmidhī thought about wilāya through the prism of clientage (wake). Through a close reading of al-Tirmidhī's works, it is clear how he is not as interested in promoting virtuosi as he is concerned with working out the relationship of the `ulamā' to the common Muslims and

the political rulers. He is focused on reforming the scholarly class and preserving its position of authority in a time of political instability and rapid social change. Clientage (walā') could schematize both the path towards freedom (in a spiritual sense) and a new basis for social dependence and authority that prioritized Islamic norms rather than Arab descent. The beneficiaries of al-Tirmidhi's model are the `ulamā', who become the class from which the awliyā' arise. These are the awliyā' who are worthy to be followed; however, their precise characterization always remains amorphous.

In Chapter 3, we looked at al-Tirmidhi's notion of hikma. The debate has swung back and forth about whether or not al-Tirmidhi was influenced directly by Hellenistic thought. I position myself somewhere in between Radtke and those who say that al-Tirmidhi incorporated Greek learning directly in its Aristotelian and Neoplatonic forms. What is significant, however, about my presentation is that it shows how al-Tirmidhi attempts to encompass and synthesize a foreign knowledge-paradigm within his traditional Islamic scholarly framework. What is more important than the content of this imported knowledge is the way in which al-Tirmidhi interacts with that knowledge. Hikma and the purveyors of hikma, i.e. the hukamā', are not adopted by the later Sufi tradition as authority figures. This is not necessarily because they saw hikma as a foreign implant, but more probably because the authority of the hukamā' was ultimately subversive to the authority of the `ulamā'.

Chapter 4 serves to demonstrate al-Tirmidhi's connection to the normative scholarly tradition as exemplified in the works of early Murji'i/Hanafi creedal texts. Al-Tirmidhi's discourse on the awliyā' was part of a much wider discourse among the `ulamā' that sought to place the awlryā' as the true inheritors of the anbiyā'. By the end of the 3rd/4th century, the awliyā' figure prominently in these creedal texts, and it is assumed among large numbers of Muslims in the Eastern lands of Islamdom that the awliyā' not only exist, but that their miracles (karamāt) are recognized by the normative tradition. Again, this provides a correction to the view that al-Tirmidhi was an outlier or that his views were incompatible with the normative tradition. While al-Tirmidhi's notion of hikma was not adopted by the later Sufi tradition, it does seem to have influenced the Māturīdī theologians of Transoxania as a theoretical basis for their theological discourse. In this sense, the theoretical approach we can call hikma-based was disassociated from its connection to the hukamā' and so also its potential to generate authority. However, hikma for the Māturīdīs seems to function in a similar way to Aristotelian philosophy for the Ash'aris after al-Ghazālī.

In Chapter 5, we looked at how al-Tirmidhi develops a schematization of wilāya that reflects the primary binary structure of diffuse versus contractual modes of authority. He does this through a tripartite approach to authority types focusing on the `ulamā', hukamā' and awlryā' (khulafā'). The `ulamā' and the awliyā' represent the two primary modes of both contractual and diffuse structures, while the hukamā' represent a subversive authority that frames wilāya. Chapter 5 also addresses a number of aspects of al-Tirmidhi's concepts of wilāya and hikma that are important for his overall gnoseology. Examples of these

are the light-based nature of al-Tirmidhī's notion of wilāya as well as the potential ramifications of wilāya and hikma for Islamic social and political history. While hikma does not become important for Islamic authority, it does become important as a conduit for foreign knowledge elements to enter into the Islamic scholarly discourse.

In Chapter 6, I complete the book by showing how the discourse on authority and al-Tirmidhī's notions of wilāya were important building blocks for the Great Mystical Synthesis of the 9th-century CE in Nīshāpūr. Again, I show how al-Tirmidhī was not necessarily the outlier that many characterize him to be, even for the discourse stream of Islamic Mysticism. One of the important lessons of this work is that the solidarity group should be understood as the primary basis of negotiating authority in Islamic societies. Al-Tirmidhī's ideas and his contributions to Sufi discourse are more important than the figure of al-Tirmidhī himself for Islamic society. What is clear is that al-Tirmidhī was actively working through central issues at the center of Islamic social, political and religious thought. For that reason, we should not view al-Tirmidhī as only an Islamic mystic but as one of the important early ideologues of Islamic social, religious and political thought. His approach to new knowledge paradigms is still very relevant today as we see Islamic societies grappling with the challenges of modernity while attempting to ground their claims to authority through Islam. Al-Tirmidhī exemplifies the process of Islamic renewal and a path that leads forward in a time of political and social change.

General editor Tan Richard Netton

SUFISM AND THE PERFECT HUMAN: FROM IBN 'ARABĪ TO AL-JĪLĪ by Fitzroy Morrissey [Routledge Sufi Series, Routledge, 978-0367426729]

Studying the history of the notion of the 'Perfect Human' (al-insān al-kāmil), this book investigates a key idea in the history of Sufism. First discussed by Ibn 'Arabī and later treated in greater depth by al-Jīlī, the idea left its mark on later Islamic mystical, metaphysical, and political thought, from North Africa to Southeast Asia, up until modern times.

The research tells the story of the development of that idea from Ibn 'Arabī to al-Jīlī and beyond. It does so through a thematic study, based on close reading of primary sources in Arabic and Persian, of the key elements of the idea, including the idea that the Perfect Human is a locus of divine manifestation (mazhar), the concept of the 'Pole' (quṭb) and the 'Muhammadan Reality' (al-ḥaqīqah al-Muhammadiyah), and the identity of the Perfect Human. By setting the work of al-Jīlī against the background of earlier Ibn 'Arabī treatments of the idea, it demonstrates that al-Jīlī took the idea of the Perfect Human in several new directions, with major consequences for how the Prophet Muhammad – the archetypal Perfect Human – was viewed in later Islamic thought.

Introducing readers to the key Sufi idea of the Perfect Human (al-insān al-kāmil), this volume will be of interest to scholars and students interested in Sufism, Islam, religion and philosophy.

Contents

Acknowledgements

Introduction

PART I

Al-Jīlī's life and thought

1 Al-Jīlī's life and work

2 Al-Jīlī's Sufi metaphysics

PART II

The Perfect Human

3 A 'synthetic being': the Perfect Human as locus of divine manifestation and a microcosm

4 The Pole

5 The Muhammadan Reality

6 The identity of the Perfect Human

Conclusion: influences and impact

Index

Excerpt: The idea of the 'Perfect Human' (al-insān al-kāmil) is one of the most important ideas in the history of Sufism. Indeed, given the centrality of Sufism within Islamic thought and piety, particularly prior to modern times, it can be deemed a significant idea in the history of Islam as a whole. General works on the history and culture of Islam and the Arabs often make at least passing reference to the idea. Most often, they connect the idea to the names of two medieval Sufi thinkers, namely, the extremely influential — and often controversial — Andalusian Sufi metaphysical thinker Ibn 'Arabī (d. CE 1240), and his later interpreter, 'Abd al-Karīm al-Jīlī (d. 1408). Thus Albert Hourani informs the reader of his popular *History of the Arab Peoples* (1991), "The idea of the 'Perfect Man' (al-insan al-kamil) put forward by Ibn 'Arabi was carried further by one of his followers, al-Jili (d. c. 1428)." A more recent and also influential work, the late Shahab Ahmed's *What is Islam? The Importance of Being Islamic* (2016), similarly describes al-Jili as "the elaborator from Muhyi al-Dīn Ibn 'Arabī (1165-1240), possibly the most influential Sufi in history, of the transfiguring Sufi concept of the 'Perfect Human' (al-insān al-kāmil)".

These scholars are not wrong to draw attention to the idea of the Perfect Human as a significant one in the history of Sufi thought. Nor are they mistaken to suggest that its origins, as a Sufi technical term and concept, lie in the works of Ibn 'Arabī, or that Ibn 'Arabī's treatment of the idea was taken on and developed by al-Jīlī. Nevertheless, while Ibn 'Arabī's idea of the Perfect Human has been treated in several modern studies, little attention has in fact been given to the precise nature and specific qualities of al-Jīlī's treatment of the idea. As such, we have little idea of the history of the idea of the Perfect Human in the two centuries between Ibn 'Arabī and al-Jīlī, or of the exact nature of the latter's 'development' of this Ibn 'Arabian idea. The distinctive elements of al-Jīlī's idea of the Perfect Human, in other words, have largely been overlooked or forgotten, and his thought has instead been blurred into a

common Ibn `Arabian or `Akbarian' tradition.' It is the goal of this book, then, to unravel the distinctive qualities of al-Jīlī's treatment of the idea of the Perfect Human, and of his thought more generally, and in so doing to tell the history of the idea of the Perfect Human.

'Abd al-Karim al-Jili can justifiably be regarded as one of the most important Sufi theorists of the medieval Islamic intellectual tradition. His major work, *al-Insān al-kāmil fi ma`rifat al-awākhir wa-al-awā'il* (The Perfect Human in the Knowledge of the Last and First Things),⁴ is a key text in the Sufi metaphysical tradition associated with Ibn `Arabi, probably the most important Sufi thinker of any age. Written in Yemen at the beginning of the fifteenth century, al-Jīlī's magnum opus has been read by Sufis from West Africa and the Maghreb to Southeast Asia, passing through the Arabic, Persian, and Turkish speaking regions, up to modern times. Yet, despite this historical significance, both al-Jīlī and his key text are little known today, either in the West or the Muslim world. In the case of the latter, this is perhaps due in part to a general waning in the popularity and acceptability of Sufism, particularly of the more theoretical, metaphysical kind represented by al-Insān al-kāmil and Ibn `Arabian works more generally. As for the modern West, our ignorance of al-Jīlī is a consequence both of a general lack of awareness of the medieval Islamic intellectual and religious traditions, and of an absence of translations (particularly into English) and scholarly studies of al-Jīlī's work. Relatively little progress has been made in this regard since R.A. Nicholson's pioneering 1921 descriptive overview of *al-Insān al-kāmil*, and Titus Burckhardt's 1952 French translation of extracts from the first half of the book.'

To attempt to fill this gap, the present book offers the first extended study in English of *al-Insān al-kāmil*; indeed, I believe it is the first monograph treatment of al-Jīlī's thought in any European language. Specifically, this book focuses on al-Jīlī's treatment of the idea for which he became famous and which gives his major work its title: the Perfect Human. According to one of the leading Arab scholars of the Ibn `Arabian intellectual tradition, al-MT is "the specialist (*sahib al-ikhtisās*), in the history of Islamic mysticism, on this topic".⁵ That the idea is indeed the central focus of al-Jīlī's writing is indicated not only by the title of his most important work,⁶ but also by his statement in chapter 60 of that work, which is specifically devoted to the idea of the Perfect Human: "This chapter is the basis (*`umdah*) of the [other] chapters of this book; indeed, the whole book, from beginning to end, is a commentary (*sharh*) on this chapter.'⁷ In light of this, as well as the aforementioned neglect of the distinctive features of al-Jīlī's treatment of the idea, it makes sense to focus this, one of the very first book-length studies of al-Jīlī's thought, on his treatment of the idea of the Perfect Human.

My discussion of al-Jīlī's treatment of the idea of the Perfect Man is thematic, meaning that I break down the idea into its constituent parts, presenting and analysing the key passages from *al-Insān al-kāmil* in which he treats those different elements of the idea. Moreover, I set al-Jīlī's treatment of these different key elements of the idea of the Perfect Human within the context of:

I cite passages from the major texts of this tradition, beginning with Ibn `Arabī's two great works, the massive and encyclopaedic *al-Futūhāt al-makkiyyah* (The Meccan Revelations) and the more concentrated and concise and more purely metaphysical *Fusūs al-hikam* (The Gemstones of Wisdom), and passing through the key works of the Qūnawī tradition, including, to take only the books cited most often here, *al-Qūnawī's* own major works, *Miftālh ghayb al jam ` wa-al-wujūd* (The Key to the Unseen Realm of Synthesis and Existence) and *l'āz al-bayān fi tafsir umm al-Qur'an* (The Inimitability of Expression in the Exegesis of the Mother of the Qur'an), *al-Qunawī's* student Sa`d al-Dīn al-Farghānī's (d. 1300) Ibn `Arabian commentary on Ibn al-Fārid's famous *Tā'iyyah* poem, and the commentaries on the *Fusūs* by 'Abd al-Razzāq al-Qāsh ānī (d. 1329) and his student Dāwūd al-Qaysarī (d. 1350/1351). Since these texts are not very widely known or accessible, I quote directly from them, generally allowing them to speak for themselves.

This contextualisation allows us to build up a picture not only of how al-Jīlī conceived of the idea of the Perfect Human, but also of what makes his conception both similar to and distinct from other treatments of the idea. As we shall see, while al-Jīlī certainly was an adherent of the Ibn `Arabian tradition, there is much that is distinctive about his idea of the Perfect Human. In this way, the book seeks to problematise the tendency to view the idea of the Perfect Human as a perennially fixed idea, and the Ibn `Arabian Sufi metaphysical tradition — and Sufi thought itself — more broadly as a homogeneous and unchanging worldview. This book is therefore written from the standpoint of the history of ideas, rather than from within that Sufi metaphysical tradition or as part of an attempt to uncover perennial truths located in Sufi texts.

The term 'Perfect Human' is an arresting one, and one which raises a number of important questions. In the following pages, for instance, we shall consider what makes the Perfect Human 'perfect'. This will involve considering the Perfect Human's metaphysical status as well as his or her human nature and powers within this world. After introducing al-Jīlī's life and times and his general Sufi metaphysics in Chapters 1 and 2, our focus in Chapter 3 will be on the idea of the Perfect Human as a 'synthetic being', that is, as someone who is both a locus of divine manifestation, on the one hand, and a microcosm of the cosmos, on the other. The implications of these ideas for the Perfect Human's this-worldly nature will also be explored, through a focused discussion of the miracles and sinlessness of the Perfect Human in al-Jīlī's thought. Chapter 4 will explore the important concept, closely related to the idea of the Perfect Human, of the 'Pole' of existence. And following that, in Chapter 5 we will consider another important and closely connected Ibn `Arabian concept, namely, the idea of the 'Muhammadan Reality'. We shall also consider the related question of who this Perfect Human is, or was, from al-Jīlī's and his predecessors' point of view, the subject of Chapter 6. I hope that by structuring the discussion in this way, I will be able to draw out both the key elements of al-Jīlī's treatment of the idea and what is distinctive about his treatment.

To anticipate my conclusions, we shall see that al-Jīlī goes further than his Ibn `Arabian predecessors in laying emphasis on the divine aspect of the Perfect Human; that he was more explicit than his predecessors in identifying the one true Perfect Human with the Prophet Muhammad; and that, much more than the earlier thinkers in the Ibn `Arabian tradition, he put the idea of the Perfect Human at the very centre of his Sufi metaphysics. In the conclusion, finally, I shall briefly consider both the possible reasons for these distinctive elements of al-Jīlī's treatment of the idea of the Perfect Human, and the impact that his conception had on later Sufi thought. The present book therefore serves not only as a comprehensive introduction to the Ibn `Arabian idea of the Perfect Human, but also makes a contribution to our understanding of the historical development of this key idea, from Ibn `Arabī to al-Jīlī and beyond. In this way, it seeks to make a novel contribution to the study of Ibn `Arabian Sufism and the history of Islamic thought more generally. <>

ON THE SULTAN'S SERVICE HALID ZIYA USAKLIĞIL'S MEMOIR OF THE OTTOMAN PALACE, 1909-1912 by Douglas Scott Brookes [Indiana University Press, 9780253045508]

"When at last we were approaching the Harem, the Sultan, surely quite alarmed, said to me in a low voice (was that so the eunuch walking in front of us wouldn't hear, or because in this lonely and dark passageway he was frightened of his own voice?), Ne olacak? 'What is to become of things?'"

Translated into English for the first time, this memoir provides fascinating first-hand insight into the personalities, intrigues, and inner workings of the Ottoman palace in its final decades. Written by Halid Ziya Uşaklıgil, who was First Secretary to Sultan Mehmed V and would go on to be one of Turkey's most famous novelists, **ON THE SULTAN'S SERVICE HALID ZIYA USAKLIĞIL'S MEMOIR OF THE OTTOMAN PALACE, 1909-1912** makes available to English readers the remarkable account of life and work in the Ottoman palace chancery—the public, "business" side of the palace—in its final incarnation. We learn of the court's new role under this second-to-last Sultan in post-Revolution Turkey. No longer exercising political power, the palace negotiated the minefields between political factions, sought ways to unite the empire in the face of sharpening nationalist aspirations, and faced with a kind of shocked despondency the opening salvos of the wars that were to overwhelm the country. Uşaklıgil includes interviews with the Imperial family and descriptions of royal nuptials, the palaces and its visitors, and the crises that shook the court. He delivers an insightful and moving portrait of Mehmed V, the elderly gentleman who reigned over the Ottoman Empire through both Balkan Wars and World War I.

Contents
Foreword
Introduction

Maps
 Timeline of Late Ottoman History
 Family Tree
 A New Court for a New Monarch
 Redoing the Palaces
 On Show
 The Imperial Household
 The Imperial Family
 Wedding Vows and Dueling Heirs
 Papers, Papers
 Mysterious Yildiz, Daunting Topkapi
 Coming to Call
 Royal Guests
 On Holiday
 Maneuvering, Touring
 No End to Crises
 Caught in the Vise
 Bringing Down the Curtain
 The Man Who Would Be Sultan
 Epilogue
 Glossary of Names
 Glossary of Terms and Places
 Bibliography
 Index

Excerpt: As the throngs of sightseers make their way through Istanbul's magnificent Dolmabahçe Palace, typically they marvel at the famed crystal staircases, the opulent mirrors and carpets and drapes entirely at home in a Victorian villa, and the soaring heights of the State Hall, arguably the most spectacular room in any palace anywhere. Few will stop to think that this sumptuous seat of royalty, designed to dazzle and delight with the splendor of the Ottoman monarchy, was also an office.

That office was the Court Chancery, the southern wing of Dolmabahçe Palace as one views it from the Bosphorus. This book tells the chancery's story. Or more precisely, and more interestingly, it tells the story of the men who staffed the Ottoman Imperial Chancery during three tumultuous years of its six-hundred-year history.

Palace of the Filled Garden

Commissioned in the 1840s by Sultan Abdülmecid, Dolmabahçe ("Filled-in Garden," from its having been built on landfill along the Bosphorus) satisfied the need for a modern edifice to replace old-fashioned Topkapi Palace as the primary seat of the Ottoman monarchy. Far and away the most famous work of Garabed Balian, the prolific Armenian architect in service to the Ottoman court in the nineteenth century, the building not only gave the sultan the new home he wanted, in its break with Topkapi it also symbolically declared the monarchy's wholehearted embrace of the modernizing reforms introduced since the 1820s.

Mr. Balian's new building comprises three sections—chancery, State Hall, and harem—that met the threefold needs of the palace for offices, state rooms, and living quarters. The chancery wing was, and still is, Dolmabahçe's front door, as everyone approaching the palace on state business would need the chancery, because it oversaw palace operations. The location of this wing, midway between the private world of the harem and the world at large outside the palace, gave it its Turkish name, mabeyin, from the Arabic term that means "what lies in between." In this translation, mabeyin and its English equivalent, chancery, are used interchangeably.

In the middle of the building, the spectacular State Hall occupies the intermediary zone between the palace's public spaces (mabeyin) on one side and private spaces (harem) on the other. Conceived as an opulent stage for grand occasions, well-nigh overwhelming the visitor with crystal, marble, and one of the world's largest chandeliers, it too is a public space, although just for those invited to the ceremonies it hosted. Its Turkish name of Muayede Salonu, "Holiday Greetings Hall," reflects its use for the grandest annual event in the royal calendar, the reception for high dignitaries on the holidays that follow the holy month of Ramadan.

Adjoining the State Hall to the north, but separated from it by locking iron doors, the L-shaped Imperial Harem wing is double the size of the mabeyin and includes its own secluded garden behind towering walls. Here were the private apartments of the sultan, his mother if she were still alive (the mother of Sultan Resad, monarch during the palace tenure of our memoirist, Halid Ziya, was not), his four consorts, his concubines, and his unmarried children, if any. As Halid Ziya tells us, the monarch lived in the harem but made his way over to the mabeyin each day to work in his office.

Completed in 1856, then virtually abandoned between 1878 and 1909 while Sultan Abdülhamid II resided at Yıldız Palace, and last used as a royal residence in 1924, the year the Imperial Family was exiled, altogether Dolmabahçe Palace operated as the seat of the Ottoman monarchy for only some thirty-six years. It has already been a museum far longer than that.

Famed Novelist, First Secretary

Halid Ziya Usakgil (1865-1945) served as first secretary of the chancery from 1909 to 1912. Supported by two assistant secretaries, he oversaw the paperwork that flowed into and out of the palace. The other half of the chancery, the chamberlain's office, oversaw maintenance of the palace and matters of protocol, although at times the duties overlapped and the first secretary and first chamberlain could find themselves filling in for each other. But bureaucratic paperwork was just Halid Ziya's day job. His real love was literature.

Scion of the distinguished line of judges and professors of the Ussakizade family (turkified into (Usakligil when Turkey adopted surnames in 1934), Halid Ziya was born in Istanbul but grew up in the Aegean port city of Izmir, where his education included mastering French language and literature. He began writing stories and poems, publishing in literary periodicals in the 1880s and 1890s, moving to Istanbul and making something of a name for himself among literati, but his breakthrough came with his period novel *Mai ve Siyah* (Blue and Black) in 1897, followed three years later by *Ask-i Memnu* (Forbidden

Love). In style and theme, both broke new ground in Turkish letters and justifiably made his name among Turkish readers. Arguably he can still be called the greatest classical Turkish novelist.

Interested in politics, the author/bureaucrat (before his job at the palace, Halid Ziya was senior secretary at the Tobacco Monopoly) supported the 1908 coup by the Committee of Union and Progress—"the CUP" or simply "the party," but better known in the world at large as the Young Turks—the hitherto clandestine association of army officers and others who aimed to replace the autocracy of Abdülhamid II with parliamentary democracy. Halid Ziya's sympathy with the CUP's goals, along with his fame as a man of letters, earned him appointment to the palace in April 1909, when he was forty-four.

A bit more than three years later, in July 1912, Halid Ziya's palace career ended abruptly when the CUP fell from power. He had previously taught Western literature at the University in Istanbul, and now he resumed teaching and writing, further earning his keep by returning to the Tobacco Monopoly and serving on commissions. The following decades proved fertile for his writing as he published stories, novels, memoirs, and two plays. The suicide of his son in 1937 shook him deeply, leading him to pen as one of his last works his reminiscence *Bir Act Hikâye* (A Bitter Tale). Suffering from grief and depression, he died in Istanbul in 1945 at the age of eighty.

Monarch for the Times

When Halid Ziya took up his appointment at the palace, the times were turbulent, to say the least. The thirty-three-year reign of Sultan Abdülhamid II had just come to a sudden end, forcibly. Fearful by nature (not helped by the fact that his uncle and elder brother had both been deposed), Abdülhamid had ruled autocratically since dismissing Parliament in 1878, ignoring for thirty years the Constitution he had accepted at the start of his reign. And so joy swept the country the summer of 1908, when following a massive army revolt Abdülhamid quickly reconvened Parliament, thereby launching what became known in Ottoman history as the Second Constitutional Era. The impact on the Palace Chancery was dramatic.

Down the centuries, the Palace Chancery functioned quite independently of the grand vizier, the "prime minister" appointed by the sultan to conduct state affairs from his offices at the famed "Sublime Porte" near Topkapi Palace. And yet, as one would expect in an autocracy, despite the existence of this chief bureaucrat, the palace still ran the country, most certainly in Abdülhamid's era. Until the 1908 army revolt, that is. The difference thereafter, as Halid Ziya points out repeatedly, was that with the return of parliamentary democracy the Palace Chancery was no longer to play an active role in governing the country—that was now up to the grand vizier and Parliament.

Technically speaking, then, the first constitutional monarch in Ottoman history was Abdülhamid II. But the Countercoup that broke out in April 1909 led the CUP to rid itself of the problematic Abdülhamid (although he did not instigate the Countercoup), exile him to Salonica, and bring to the throne his younger half brother, Prince Resad.

Born in 1844 as the third son of Sultan Abdülmecid, Resad was blond and blue-eyed, a manifestation, one presumes, of his descent from Circassian concubines. His mother, the lady Gülcemal, died of

tuberculosis when he was seven, and so he and his two full sisters were raised by the lady Servetseza, Abdülmecid's childless senior consort. As a youth Read studied piano and calligraphy, and as an adult he practiced Sufism. When his older half brother, Abdülhamid, became sultan in 1876, Read in turn became heir apparent, the position he held throughout his brother's long reign. During these years the fearful Abdülhamid rather cruelly confined Read to two locations: the heir's apartments within Dolmabahçe Palace and Resad's villa at Zincirlikuyu, not far uphill from the palace. One result of this enforced seclusion was to make Read an unknown quantity when he unexpectedly came to the throne.

The era of Sultan Read (as he is better known to his compatriots than Sultan Mehmed V, the regnal name he adopted at his accession; his given name was Mehmed Resad) lasted only nine years, ending with his death in July 1918 from, most probably, diabetes. Ironically for this peaceful and courteous gentleman, crises wracked his reign, beginning with Italy's humiliating seizure of the Ottoman province of Libya in 1911, worsening with the traumatic Balkan Wars of 1912 and 1913, and culminating in the catastrophes of World War I. Through it all, as Halid Ziya tells us, despite his uninspiring appearance and contrary to the skeptical gossip, Read proved himself a thoroughly constitutional monarch who readily adapted himself to the times in which the Ottoman monarchy found itself.

When Halid Ziya opens his memoir, the CUP has just brought Prince Read to the throne—at sixty-four the oldest-ever Ottoman sultan at his accession. The new sovereign has decided to reside at Dolmabahçe Palace, as his father had done, rather than his brother's Yıldız Palace. This means bringing Dolmabahçe back to life after its long years of virtual abandonment under Abdülhamid. Outside the palace walls, the decades of Abdülhamid's despotism have ended through the army's intervention, but the instability at the top has left things in turmoil, nationalist aspirations of the minorities are clearly on the rise, and foreign powers cannot be trusted. Surely the thinking person wonders, do better times indeed lie ahead? Is the overweight, pigeon-toed new sultan really the one to lead the country forward? Or even capable of reigning at all? And most immediately, as the center of power has shifted abruptly from the palace to Parliament, will the country—in particular the court of the new monarch—navigate the transition from autocracy to democracy?

The Memoir

In the last decade of his life, Halid Ziya assembled this memoir of his years as first secretary at the palace, apparently drawing from notes he had made during his tenure (so one concludes from the wealth of detail he provides) and publishing it in Istanbul from 1940 to 1942 under the title *Saray ve Ötesi, The Palace and Beyond*. The famed novelist's writing skills carried over into this work of nonfiction just as one would expect from this master of Ottoman prose: richly convoluted sentences, intricately crafted with delightfully drawn-out subordinate clauses; internal rhyme and alliteration that dress up a sentence just as subtle jewels might a lady's gown; plays on words; multiple meanings of a word within the same sentence; light puns; and even the occasional invented word. Witty and urbane, compassionate and poignant, the ornate and beautiful prose charms the reader with the brilliance and emotional depth of the author. No dry recitation of history here: the master novelist weaves his audience into his colorful characters and scenes, guiding us through the palace as though talking to an old friend.

Of course, the first secretary's vocabulary is that of an educated gentleman of the nineteenth century, at home in the Ottoman Turkish of the elite who ruled the empire. Here was a tongue delightfully laden with vast numbers of Arabic and Persian loan words that transformed the simpler Turkish of the Ottomans' steppe ancestors into one of the world's richest languages. Since his day so many of these words have been purged from the language that a young Turk reading him now would need a dictionary for nearly every sentence.

So the memoir is witty and elegant. How might we appraise its value, especially for readers not especially familiar with Ottoman history?

Most strikingly, Halid Ziya provides us colorful firsthand descriptions of the men who held the reins of power in this era: Sultan Mehmed V Resad (a figure comparatively overlooked in Ottoman history), four grand viziers, the military and civilian leaders who launched the 1908 Revolution, and the visiting King Ferdinand of Bulgaria, whose extraordinary career took him from Ottoman vassal to enemy to ally. Perhaps most unexpected is his portrait of Talat Pasha, minister of the interior who later ordered what we know today as the Armenian Genocide ("this exceptional man, with his lucid face, his eyes that sparkled with the simplicity in his soul, his genuine emotions that lay beneath the teasing and warmed people to him"). Rare too are Halid Ziya's candid portraits of Ottoman princes and princesses, their feuds and woes, while his interview with ex-sultan Abdülhamid II is one of the very few firsthand accounts we have of the monarch in exile.

Still more valuable because no other known source does so, Halid Ziya portrays the belowstairs staff at the palace, including the black eunuchs in this era when their chief had just lost his centuries-old dominance at court. He lays out for us the daily operation of the palace: his system of tackling the paperwork flowing to and from the sultan, but also the way he and his friend First Chamberlain Lutfi Simavi revamped the royal court to suit its reduced role in this constitutional era. Then there were the state dinners (for which staff must be trained). The parades (he dreaded them). The contrast between the grand court and dilapidated Istanbul. Anxiety for the army and the country. Money problems. And boredom—the role of courtier did not sit altogether easily on the eminent novelist, although the fields of observation it offered him proved rich indeed.

It is nearly always in the nature of memoirs to put a positive spin on things or leave details out we wish were included. Halid Ziya is no exception. When he writes, "The acts of jealousy and malice that always shook us, always abused us, came from other quarters;" we wonder what enemies he made at court, but he is silent because his way, as we see time and again, was to look for the best in people. Sultan Resad loved to tell "memories of his youth, his brothers, or more often his father, and stories of the curious things his harem ladies did;" but what those were, Halid Ziya does not record.

What overall feelings does the book bequeath the reader? Warm wistfulness at what seems the briefest of golden ages, before horrors befell the Ottoman Empire. That excitement and hope wove themselves into the times, tempered by pit-of-the-stomach fears of catastrophe around the corner. That Sultan Mehmed V was a kindly old gentleman who made the perfect boss because he was fair and gracious

(significantly, four of his courtiers were buried at his tomb: Chief Barber Mehmed Bey, Superintendent of Palace Furnishings Haci Akif Bey, Court Physician Hayri Bey, and Chief Eunuch Fahreddin Aga). That, far from his subsequent image as a kind of hapless nonentity (if he is known at all), his adaptability made him the ideal constitutional monarch.

Clearly, the Ottoman Court Chancery was a man's world. This is not surprising for the era in any country, certainly Ottoman Turkey. Halid Ziya only rarely entered the harem apartments, at the opposite end of the palace. When he did so, he was always accompanied by a eunuch and no ladies were present. He never met the sultan's wives or concubines and was not sure how many ladies the sultan had, despite the fact that they resided in the same palace where he worked; in elite Ottoman culture a harem was strictly private, a world only for relatives and female friends of its residents, which is why Halid Ziya never mentions the sultan's ladies by name (we should mention that Halid Ziya himself, like the vast majority of his compatriots, had but one wife). Princesses, on the other hand—the daughters of sultans and princes of the Imperial Family—were more public figures, after a fashion, and so he does mention them by name and paid official calls on them. Because of their rank, they were not secluded inmates of a harem, an elite status further indicated by the fact that the man selected to marry an Ottoman princess was not allowed other wives or concubines.

Another impression is that even Halid Ziya found palace culture at times perplexing, charming, amusing, or just plain strange. And so the reactions of this Ottoman gentleman to the world of the Ottoman palace may not be so different from the reactions of much later readers. Nor was he blind to the foibles of the monarchy and its representatives, although he clearly treasured the monarchy and was especially devoted to the sovereign he served.

Finally, our author is noticeably hard on Prince Vandeddin, who came to the throne as the last Ottoman sultan six years after Halid Ziya left palace service. Surely this stemmed from Vandeddin's firm opposition to the CUP, whereas Halid Ziya of course supported it in his palace years. Furthermore, Halid Ziya was writing in the early decades of the Republic, which in its quest to legitimize the abolition of the monarchy cast Vandeddin as a kind of traitor. Perhaps most of all, one suspects that unlike Resad's gentle kindness, Vandeddin's tightly wound personality was probably not one to inspire devotion. <>

THE EARLY MUSLIM CONQUEST OF SYRIA: AN ENGLISH TRANSLATION OF AL-AZDĪ'S FUTŪH AL-SHAM translated and annotated by Hamada Hassanein and Jens Scheiner [Culture and Civilization in the Middle East, Routledge, 9780367230258]

This book narrates the battles, conquests and diplomatic activities of the early Muslim fighters in Syria and Iraq vis-à-vis their Byzantine and Sasansian counterparts. It is the first English translation of one of

the earliest Arabic sources on the early Muslim expansion entitled **FUTŪḤ AL-SHĀM (THE CONQUESTS OF SYRIA)**.

The translation is based on the Arabic original composed by a Muslim author, Muḥammad al-Azdī, who died in the late 8th or early 9th century C.E. A scientific introduction to al-Azdī's work is also included, covering the life of the author, the textual tradition of the work as well as a short summary of the text's train of thought. The source narrates the major historical events during the early Muslim conquests in a region that covers today's Lebanon, Israel, Palestinian Territories, Jordan, Syria, Turkey and Iraq in the 7th century C.E. Among these events are the major battles against the Byzantines, such as the Battles of Ajnādayn and al-Yarmūk, the conquests of important cities, including Damascus, Jerusalem and Caesarea, and the diplomatic initiatives between the Byzantines and the early Muslims. The narrative abounds with history and Islamic theological content.

As the first translation into a European language, this volume will be of interest to a wide range of readership, including (Muslim and Christian) theologians, historians, Islamicists, Byzantinists, Syrologists and (Arabic) linguists.

Contents

List of manuscript notes

Acknowledgements

Introduction

- 1 Summary of al-Azdī's Futūḥ al-Sham
- 2 The compiler-author and his work
 - The compiler-author
 - The title
 - The audience
 - The manuscripts
 - The chains of transmission (riwāyas)
 - The editions
 - Studies of al-Azdī's Futūḥ al-Shim
- 3 Policies of translation
- 4 Translation
 - [Section I: Abū Bakr al-Siddīq's preparation for attacking the Byzantines in Syria]
 - [Abū Bakr al-Siddīq's appointment of the first commander]
 - Abu Bakr al-Siddīq's (r.) letter to the people of Yemen
 - The report (khabar) [about the reaction] of the people of Yemen
 - Naming those whom Abu Bakr appointed (ʿaqada) as commanders of the districts (ajnād)
 - Shurahbīl b. Hasana's vision
 - The coming of the people of Himyar to Abu Bakr al-Siddīq (r.)
 - [Section II: Abū Bakr al-Siddīq's dispatch of military units to Syria]
 - Khālid b. Said b. al-Ās's march [to Syria]

[Heraclius's reaction to the dispatch of the Muslim units]
 Abu `Ubayda b. al-Jarrāh's (r.) march to Syria and the route he took and travelled along
 This is Abu `Ubayda b. al-Jarrāh's letter to Abu Bakr (r.) informing him of what he learned of Heraclius's, the Emperor of the Byzantines, mobilisation of the Byzantine groups and of what Abu `Ubayda wanted to consult Abu Bakr about
 This is Yazīd b. Abī Sufyān's letter to Abu Bakr (r.)
 The departure of Hāshim b. `Utba [b. Abī Waqqās] (r.)
 The story (qissa) of Saīd b. 'Amir b. Hudhaym's departure]
 The coming of the Arabs to Abū Bakr (r.)
 The arrival of Hamza b. Mālik al-Hamdānī
 The arrival of Abu al-Awar al-Sulamī
 The arrival of Man b. Yazīd b. al-Akhnas al-Sulami
 [The reaction of the people in Syria]
 The story of Abu Bakr's (r.) plan to consult the Qurayshite people of Mecca who delayed embracing Islam [in response to] what Abu `Ubayda b. al-Jarrāh had written; and [the story] about `Umar b. al-Khattāb's hatred of that [consultation]
 Abu Bakr's (r.) appointment (aqd) of 'Amr b. al-'- s (r.) as commander
 Abū Bakr's letter to Abu `Ubayda (r.)
 [The battles of al-Araba and al-Dāthina]
 [Section III: Khālīd b. al-Walīd's activities in Iraq]
 The arrival of al-Muthannā b. Hāritha [al-Shaybānī] to Abu Bakr (r.)
 [Khālīd b. al-Walīd's battles in Iraq]
 The story of deposing Khālīd b. al-Walīd from [commanding the Muslim troops in] Iraq and his taking command of [the Muslim troops in] Syria
 Khālīd b. al-Walīd's march to Syria and his battles against Banti Taghlib and others along his way
 The route which Khālīd took to Syria
 This is Khālīd's letter to Banū Mashja`a
 [Section IV: Conquests and battles in Syria]
 The battle of Bosra and [the fight against] its people
 The battle of Ajnādayn
 Khālīd b. al-Walīd's march to Damascus and his siege of its people
 The Battle of Marj al-Suffar
 The death of Abu Bakr (r.) and his appointment of 'Umar b. al-Khattāb (r.) as his successor [to the rule]
 The letter from Abu `Ubayda and Mu`ādh b. Jabal to `Umar b. al-Khattāb (r.)
 'Umar b. al-Khattāb's letter to Abu `Ubayda b. al-Jai-rah (r.) concerning his [=the latter's] appointment and restitution as [chief] commander of [the troops in] Syria as well as [concerning] the deposition of Khālīd b. al-Walīd (r.)

The conquest of Damascus and its peace-making [process] (sulk)
 'Amr b. al-As's letter to Abu `Ubayda (r.)
 The battle of Fihl
 The story of Mu'adh b. Jabal[']s negotiation with] the Byzantines
 Abu `Ubayda b. al-Jarrāh's letter to `Umar b. al-Khattāb (r.) informing him about the Byzantines' setting up camp in a place called Fihl
 'Umar b. al-Khattāb's letter to Abu 'Ubayda b. al-Jarrāh (r.)
 Abu `Ubayda b. al-Jarrāh wrote [the following letter] to `Umar b. al-Khattāb (r.)
 Abu `Ubayda b. al-Jarrah wrote [the following letter] to 'Umar b. al-Khattāb (r.) [regarding this issue]
 `Umar (r.) wrote [the following letter] to him [in reply]
 The Muslims' march to Hillis after they had finished [their campaigns] in Fihl and in the land of the River Jordan
 The conquest of the city of Mats and its peace-making [process]
 Abu 'Ubayda b. al-Jarrah wrote [the following letter] to `Umar b. al-Khattāb (r.)
 The report on how God (a.) led the Muslims to the conquest of [central] Syria and the report on Caesar when he learned of it
 [Prelude to the battle of al Yarmūk]
 The Byzantines' assembly [of an army] against the Muslims after the Muslims had driven them out of [central] Syria
 Abu `Ubayda b. al-Jarrāh's letter to `Umar b. al-Khattāb (r.) informing him of what he knew about the Byzantines' mustering [of an army] against him
 `Umar b. al-Khattāb's letter to Abu 'Ubayda b. al-Jarrāh (r.)
 'Amr b. al-As's letter to them [=the people of Jerusalem]
 The story of Qays b. Hubayra [al-Murādī] during Abu `Ubayda b. al-Jarrāh's consultation with the Muslims and what they said in reply to Abu `Ubayda
 The report on Qays b. Hubayra [al-Murādī] and some of the Muslim women
 The speech (khutba) of Bāhān, the [chief] commander of the Byzantines, who was ordered to march to the Muslims
 The report on what the corrupt Byzantines, [i.e.] Bāhān's companions, did to the Byzantine people of Syria, and the reason why God eliminated, exterminated and dispersed their group[s]
 Abu `Ubayda b. al-Jarrāh's setting up camp at al-Yarmūk and his request to `Umar b. al-Khattāb (r.) for reinforcements
 The report on Sufyān [b. `Awf b. Mughaffal al-Azdī], Abu `Ubayda's messenger to `Umar (r.)
 Mention of what happened between Khālīd b. al-Walīd and Bāhān, the subordinate of the Emperor of the Byzantines
 Khalid b. al-Walīd's reply

Bāhān's consultation with his companions about how to fight the Muslims, about what they [=the Muslims] have chosen for themselves and about Bāhān's letter to Caesar in that regard

The story of Bāhān's vision

Abu `Ubayda b. al-Jarrāh's (r.) vision

A Byzantine [grand] man's vision

The story of the Byzantine [man] who committed what he committed and of restraining Bāhān from [punishing] him

The battle of al Yarmūk

The story of the chieftainship of al-Ashtar, whose [more complete name] was Malik b. al-Hārith al-Nakha`

The coming of the [news of the] Byzantines' defeat to Caesar, the Emperor of the Byzantines, and what he said thereupon

The story of al-Ashtar [=Mālik b. al-Hārith al-Nakha`ī] and Maysara b. Masrūq [al-Absi]

Abu `Ubayda b. al-Jarrāh's letter to `Umar b. al-Khattāb (r.) [which he wrote] when God ('a.) made him triumphant over the people of al Yarmūk

`Umar b. al-Khattāb's letter to Abū `Ubayda b. al-Jarrāh (r.), [which is] the reply to his [=Abū 'Ubayda's] letter to him [=`Umar]

The story of the peace-making [process] with the people of Jerusalem and of `Umar's (r.) coming to Syria

The story of the owner of the two leaves

'Umar's (r.) speech in al-Jābiya

The story of Ka`b al-Ilabr's [conversion to] Islam (r.); may God rest him

`Umar b. al-Khattāb's return [to Medina]

[The aftermath of the conquest of Jerusalem]

Abu `Ubayda's death; God rest his soul

`Abd al-Rahman b. Mu'ādh b. Jabal's (r.) death

Mu'ādh b. Jabal's will; [may] God rest his soul and be pleased with him

Mu'ādh [b. Jabal's] appointment of `Amr b. al-As as successor; may God's mercy, forgiveness and satisfaction be upon both of them

Mu'ādh b. Jabal's letter to `Umar b. al-Khattāb concerning Abu `Ubayda's death (r.)

The speech of `Ubāda b. al-Samit [al-Ansārī] (r.)

The speech of Abū al-Dardā' al-Ansārī (r.)

The conquest of Caesarea and the appointment of Yazid b. Abī Sufyān [as chief commander] of all the districts of Syria

Yazid b. Abī Sufyān's letter to 'Umar b. al-Khattāb (r.)

'Umar's (r.) letter to Yazid b. Abī Sufyān (r.); may God have mercy upon him

Yazid b. Abī Sufyan's death; God rest him

Bibliography

Index

Excerpt: Over the past decades, al-Azdi's *Futūh al-Shām* has become a main source for our understanding of the Muslim expansion in Greater Syria during the late antique period. Many scholars consider it the earliest extant historical work in Arabic, belonging to the genre of *futuh* (conquest) literature. Surprisingly, however, it has not been translated into any other language. For this reason and because it is widely used as a source of historical research regarding this period, we present a "precise study translation" (M. Hodgson) of the work in English. Before turning to the translation itself, we will briefly introduce the content of the work by summarising its main points (Chapter 1) and reproduce the most important information about the compiler-author of the work, its title as well as the extant manuscripts, their chains of transmission (*riwāyas*), the editions and the most important studies on the work (Chapter 2). Then we will state our policies in translating the work (Chapter 3) and finally present the translated text (Chapter 4).

Al-Azdi's Futūh al-Sham narrates the events that led to the final conquest of Greater Syria ("al-Sham") by several groups of people called "Arabs" or "Muslims" during 633-641 C.E. In this chapter, a summary of the main events as described in *The Conquests of Syria* is provided. This summary makes use of the vocabulary and the concepts of the text, deliberately adopting al-Azdi's perspective. The whole narrative can be divided into four sections that are indicated in the summary and the translation as well. Page numbers in parentheses refer to the pages of the 'Uqla/Banī Yāsīn edition, which are also mentioned as cross-references in our translation. They will help the reader to correlate this summary with the Arabic original.

The narrative starts with a brief reference to Muhammad's death and the "Apostasy Wars (*riḍḍa*)" in the time of Abu Bakr (77-78), after which the latter envisaged attacking the Byzantines in Syria and started the preparations for this undertaking (Section I). Hence, Abu Bakr consulted some important companions on this issue and finally decided to do so (81-86). Having invited some Arabian tribes from Yemen to join him, he then appointed several commanders (among whom were, for example, Abu 'Ubayda b. al-Jarrāh and Yazīd b. Abī Sufyan) and started to dispatch them to Syria (86-108). This marks the beginning of Section II of the text. Then the focus of the narrative switches to the Byzantine Emperor, who mobilised his subjects in Syria to oppose the coming Muslims (108-111). In reply to this, Abu Bakr sent further troops to Syria, some of which were again from Yemen; others came from Mecca (116-136). The first battles occurred at al-Araba and al-Dāthina (136). Then, in Section III of the text, the focus switches to Iraq, to which Abu Bakr dispatched Rīḥ-līd b. al-Walīd to fight and conquer (137-142). After the Battle of al-Ubulla and the conquests of other places, Abu Bakr ordered Khālīd to leave Iraq and support his fellow Muslims in Syria as chief commander (142-154). Khālīd made his famous march through the Syrian desert (154-162) and met Abu 'Ubayda near Damascus (162). With Khālīd's arrival in Syria, Section IV begins. Therein various conquests, battles and events in Syria are mentioned. First, Khālīd conquered Bosra and, together with Abu 'Ubayda, raided Damascus (165-169). Because they had learned that the Byzantines were encamped in Ajnādayn, Khalid and Abu 'Ubayda ordered the

other Muslim commanders to join them, and the ensuing Battle of Ajnādayn is described (169-179). Khālid then continued his operations at Damascus (179-195). During the siege of the city, Abu Bakr died. `Umar succeeded him to lead the Muslim community, deposed Khalid from the chief command and appointed Abu `Ubayda instead (184-191). After fending off a unit of Byzantine reinforcements near Baalbek (195-198), the Muslims turned towards Fibl, which they conquered after strong resistance from its inhabitants (199-237). In the course of fighting there, one of the Muslim leaders, Mu'ādh b. Jabal, had a talk with some Byzantine commanders, in which he introduced major tenets of the Muslims' faith and their motivation for fighting against them (202-210). A second talk, in which the Byzantines offered southern Syria to the Muslims, ended in vain (210-219). The Muslims won the ensuing battle and the land of the River Jordan fell under their control (220-236). Then the Muslims turned towards Hims, which they also conquered (237-244). Having heard about all this, Heraclius consulted his subordinate commanders and decided to dispatch a huge army under the command of Bāhān to fight the Muslims (245-247). In light of this advance, the majority of the Muslims decided to retreat southwards, returning some of their spoils to the previous owners, and met with all other Muslim units near al Yarmūk gorge, a place in central Syria, where they camped opposite the Byzantine army (248-272). The narrative focus then shifts to the Byzantines' encampment, where Bāhān motivated his commanders and soldiers but failed to control his corrupt companions (272-278). Having asked `Umar for reinforcements, Abu `Ubayda prepared the Muslims for battle (279-290). The subsequent Battle of al-Yarmūk, in which Khālid and others excelled, is narrated from several perspectives, highlighting the bravery of many individual Muslims from various tribes (290-341). The battle was interrupted by a talk between Khalid and Bāhān in which Khalid explained to Bāhān why the Muslims would fight to the end and what they would gain from this fight (294-311). Bataan tried yet another way to negotiate peace with the Muslims, but finally realised that he would not be able to beat the Muslims militarily. Nonetheless, he marched out against them with his companions, whose corruption is again noted, and ultimately lost both the battle and his life (311-343). When Heraclius received the news about the Byzantines' defeat, he returned from Antioch to Constantinople after having bid farewell to Syria (343-346). The narrative continues to describe a conflict between al-Ashtar and Maysara b. Masrūq, two Muslim commanders who were sent north again. During his march, Maysara conquered Qinnasrīn and its hinterland but was ordered by Abu `Ubayda to return before he was able to attack Antioch (346-351). Abu `Ubayda appointed commanders over Hims and Damascus and turned with the Muslims towards Jerusalem (352-354), the conquest of which is narrated next (355-366). The narration, however, is interrupted by a short story about a Muslim, called Mukhaymis, who claimed that he entered Paradise and brought two leaves from there to his companions (356-357). The inhabitants of Jerusalem requested that the caliph `Umar should grant them a peace treaty. Thus, `Umar left Medina, travelled to Syria and made his famous speech at al-Jābiya (362-365). After having granted the peace treaty, `Umar stayed in the Muslims' encampment near Jerusalem for some days, during which he decided a legal case concerning cooked, non-alcoholic juice, visited all the commanders and decreed a monthly livelihood for every Muslim (367-370). Before `Umar's return, Ka`b b. Habr's conversion from Judaism to the new faith is narrated (370-374). In the course of his journey back to Medina, `Umar decided more cases that have a legal dimension: one case

about a man who was living with two sisters, one about some negligent taxpayers who had to stand in the sun and one about two men who shared the same wife in their daily life (375-378). The narrative then turns back to Abu `Ubayda, whose death from the plague is described. In addition to Abu `Ubayda's death, the deaths of Abd al-Rahman b. Mu`ādh b. Jabal and his father are narrated. Interestingly, Khālīd b. al-Walīd's, 'Amr b. al-`Ās's and Shurabbīl b. Hasana's deaths are not mentioned. Having succeeded Abu `Ubayda in commanding the Muslims, Mu`ādh b. Jabal appointed 'Amr b. al-As as his successor, while `Umar appointed several other people in command of the various districts and cities of Syria (379-388). Two exhortatory speeches are narrated (one by `Ubāda b. al-Samī; the other by Abu al-Dardā') (388-390) before mentioning the appointment of Yazīd b. Abī Sufyān and the subsequent conquest of Caesarea (390-401). Another conflict between two commanders, Habib b. Maslama and al-Dahhāk b. Qays, occurred (392-396) after which Yazīd handed over the command of the troops shortly before the conquest of Caesarea to his brother Mu`āwiya b. Abī Sufyān, who finally conquered the city (399). The narrative ends with the statement The Muslims rejoiced over that [conquest] greatly and no enemy of them was left, either in the farthest or in the nearest parts of Syria. [Hence,] God had expelled the Polytheists from it and Syria as a whole had fallen into the hands of the Muslims, followed by two short letters, a description of Yazīd's death and a brief summary of Mu`āwiya's (further) rule over Syria (399-403).

As this summary clearly shows, al-Azdī's *Futūh al-Sham* is a typical work of Muslim akhbār historiography. It is composed of a religiously loaded language and many traditions (khabar, pl. akhbār) that are often introduced by a chain of transmitters (isnād) in which the scholars who had presumably passed down the attached text are listed. Another typical feature of this genre is that the narrative depicts the events through actions and speeches of a limited number of collective actors and leading figures. For example, among the Muslims who figure prominently are the caliphs Abu Bakr and 'Umar and the military commanders Abu `Ubayda b. al-Jarrāh, Khalīd b. al-Walīd and Yazīd b. Abī Sufyān. Among the prominent Byzantines are the Emperor Heraclius and his chief commander Bāhān. All these persons often deliver speeches in the *Futūh al-Sham* and correspond with others by exchange of numerous letters. Hence, speeches and letters appear as distinctive features of the narrative as well as of the whole genre. <>

STUDYING THE QUR'ĀN IN THE MUSLIM ACADEMY by Majīd Daneshgar [AAR Reflection and Theory in the Study of Religion Series, Oxford University Press, 9780190067540]

STUDYING THE QUR'ĀN IN THE MUSLIM ACADEMY examines what it is like to study and teach the Qur'an at academic institutions in the Muslim world, and how politics affect scholarly interpretations of the text. Guided by the author's own journey as a student, university lecturer, and researcher in Iran,

Malaysia, and New Zealand, this book provides vivid accounts of the complex academic politics he encountered. Majid Daneshgar describes the selective translation and editing of Edward Said's classic work *Orientalism* into various Islamic languages, and the way Said's work is weaponized to question the credibility of contemporary Western-produced scholarship in Islamic studies. Daneshgar also examines networks of journals, research centers, and universities in both Sunni and Shia contexts, and looks at examples of Quranic interpretation there. Ultimately, he offers a constructive program for enriching Islamic studies by fusing the best of Western theories with the best philological practices developed in Muslim academic contexts, aimed at encouraging respectful but critical engagement with the Qur'an.

Contents

List of Figures and Tables

Preface

Acknowledgments

Introduction

A Taboo-Breaking Project

Study Organization

PART I

1. "Islamic Apologetics" and Islamic Studies

 On "Islamic Apologetics"

 Western Islamic Studies

 Modern Trends in Qur'anic Studies

 Studying Islam outside Its Core Lands

2. The Qur'ān in the Muslim Academy: What Should Be Censored?

 Muslims' Views of Western Islamic Studies

 Western Works in the Muslim Academy: Rippin's Qur'anic Studies

 Studying the Qur'an in Muslim Universities and Seminaries

 Reading the Qur'an with Other Materials

 Self-Sufficiency in Academic Production

 Muslims' Reading of Muhammad's Adopted Son, Zayd

PART II

3. The Sectarian Study of Islam: A Culture of Isolation and the Isolation of Cultures

 From the Islamization of Biblical Literature to the Sectarianizing of the Muslim Academy

 The Forgotten East

 Reception and Marginalization of Minorities

 Forgetting the Language and Culture of Everywhere/Always

4. Hatred of Inferiority and Confrontation with the West: Forgetting Some, Remembering Others

 Forgetting Western Scholars of the Qur'an: Origins

 E. W. Said's Orientalism

 Muslim Study of the Qur'an in Light of Orientalism

 Misunderstanding of Europeans in Orientalism

 Remembering Scientists

5. Final Remarks

Conclusions
Islamic Apologetics Everywhere

Notes
Bibliography
Index

Excerpt: Recent developments in the way Western Islamic studies happen and the effect that such developments are likely to have on the Muslim academy's struggle with Islamic Apologetics are troubling. We should also keep in mind that none of this is happening in a vacuum: There is the complicating factor of penetration of Western theology, politics, and religious studies departments by oil- and Sunni/Shi'i-dominated endowments and institutions from the Islamic world, especially since the events of September 11, 2001.

By emphasizing "dialogue between religions" in their funding and grants, many of the actors of this penetration play a significant role in defining historical and textual approaches to Islam. Scholars respond to the emphasis by underlining distinctions between "ordinary" contemporary Muslims and "extremists." This separation usually involves dissociating modern Muslim culture from its pre-Islamic and Islamic formative periods. As a result, such works as produced under the "dialogue between religions" formula generally enable a superficial knowledge of a historical Islam within a framework that treats modern social, anthropological, and ethnographic concerns. Instead of familiarizing readers with Islam as a faith and culture that has steadily and gradually been evolved by specific communities of believers, they present Islam primarily through the acts and behavior of contemporary communities. None of this allows for speculation about how the Islamic teachings, legal rules, and rituals might have changed over the course of history and therefore how they might change today or in the future.

Recent methodological studies and theories about Islam and the Qur'an in European languages largely ignore how the Qur'an is taught and explored in the Muslim world. If they do consider the role of the Qur'an in the Muslim world, they often treat emerged trends in readings of it by religious elites such as, among others, Hamid al-Din al-Farahi (d. 1930) and Amin Ahsan Islahi (d. 1997) in Pakistan (South Asia), Muhammad Husayn Tabataba'i (d. 1981), `Abdolkarim Soroush (b. 1945), and Mohammad Mojtahed Shabestari (b. 1936) in Iran (Middle East), Abdullah Saleh al-Farsy (d. 1982) in Zanzibar and Kenya, and Ali Muhsin al-Barwani (d. 2006) in Zanzibar (Sub-Saharan Africa), or Hamka (d. 1981) and Quraish Shihab (b. 1944) in Indonesia (Southeast Asia).

Western leadership and investment in projects aiming to strengthen the role and reception of female scholars in Islam, in my view, also reveal a certain ignorance about cultural and scientific issues in the Muslim academy. However well-intentioned, such projects may be more a misguided projection of their own local priorities than help where help is really needed. It is somehow true that women scholars of Islam do not have a strong or really visible presence in Muslim higher education. Equally, female voices are routinely disregarded and feminist perspectives are most often drowned out in overwhelmingly male-dominated environments. And getting women the respect and roles that they merit is a hard slog that has a long way to go.

As in the West, women within their own local Islamic environments have progressively been playing increasingly significant roles in the development of the study of Islam, founding scientific associations, leading departments and doing work that is more and more often cited by male scholars. Citing only Aisha Yousef Al-Mannai (author of *Fundamentals of Belief in the Twelver Shia and Mu` tazila*, 1992), director of Sheikh Muhammad Bin Hamad al-Thani Center for Muslim Contribution to Civilization at Hamad bin Khalifa University of Qatar, Forough Parsa (author of *Shi`i Commentaries on the Qur'an during Persia's Safavid Dynasty*, 2013), head of the Qur'anic Studies Department at the Institute for Humanities and Cultural Studies, Tehran, and Raihanah Binti Haji Abdullah (co-editor of *Women and Islamic Law*, 2001), new director of the Islamic Studies Academy, University of Malaya, we can observe that women are steadily more present and active in the study of Islam.

Study Organization

My work on the under-development of critical study and the development of what can only be termed defensive literature—Islamic Apologetics—in the Muslim academy has two articulating parts developed in light of both my personal experience and my professional concerns.

Part I considers how the critical methodology and tools of Western Islamic studies are dealt with, and, in interaction with the former, Part II deals with the persistence of sectarian treatment of the Qur'an and Qur'anic studies.

Part I is made up of two chapters which highlight the notion of Islamic Apologetics in the Muslim academy and Islamic studies in Western academia as well as the status of Western Islamic-Qur'anic studies among Muslim academics.

The goal of the first chapter is to prepare readers to see how topics discussed in the Western academy are understood differently in the Muslim academy. In it, I try to unpack the motives and intentions behind the development of Islamic Apologetics in the Muslim academy. This, I hope, will enable readers to understand what Islamic Apologetics both is and is not. I also try to outline the development of an academic approach to the pertinent issues in the Western academy.

The second chapter of Part I considers the ways in which Western Islamic studies in general, and Western Qur'anic studies in particular, are received in the Muslim academy. I compare the promotion of Islamic Apologetics and the approaches taken by Christian theology programs in the West. I consider also if and, if so, how, the Qur'an is read in light of science, technology, and biblical literature. Finally, I try to describe how the Muslim academy attempts to set apart and keep separate its institutions and publications from those of Westerners.

Part II, like Part I, is made up of two chapters—3 and 4—and explores how the Muslim academy deals with the Shi`i-Sunni divide, the use of Edward W Said's groundbreaking work on cultural representation *Orientalism*, and how Muslims viewed Western scientists (not Western scholars of Islam) while defending Islamic teachings.

Chapter 3 shows how Muslim academics are, or are obliged to be, inattentive to the cultural and literary connections both between the Shi`i and Sunni traditions and the different diverse Muslim academies. These all combine to create a systemic ignorance of, and systematic disregard for, non-Middle Eastern sources and resources.

As noted, not entirely unconnected to the systemic neglect of Western Islamic and biblical studies, I show that Muslim academics too often do not appreciate the views of co-religionists of a different sect, especially in respect to the Sunni or Shi`i traditions. This neglect of Islamic sources extends to other countries and cultures, even when these are of the same sect. So, for instance, in contrast to European scholars, who were keen to analyze Islamic classical texts and to translate them into European languages, few Muslim scholars pay attention, or have paid attention, to European languages and, perhaps, more importantly, to such Islamic-Asiatic languages as Urdu or Malay. Indeed, in the Muslim academy generally, Middle Eastern sources—Arabic, Persian, and sometimes, (Ottoman) Turkish—are prioritized and other historical and cultural exchanges utterly neglected and treated as unimportant; Qur'anic literature from parts of the Muslim world other than the Middle East is not taken into account seriously and systematically.

There also exist political academic mechanisms that underpin ignorance about sects other than that which is dominant for a particular Muslim region. Chapter 3 shows why works dealing with sensitive aspects of Qur'an and post-Qur'anic literature in Sunni and Shi`i contexts have been and are largely ignored in one region or another or only very selectively treated when they are not ignored. This chapter also raises important questions about the reception of scholarly works produced by Muslims in the Malay-Indonesian world and in Africa.

Readers should be careful to note that I do not deal with the reception in Iran, for example, of general, neutral, progressive, and apologetic mystical and so-called intellectual works by Malay scholars such as Syed Muhammad Naquib al-Attas (b. 1931), or the warm welcome of the Iranian-American Seyyed Hossein Nasr (b. 1933) in the Malay-Indonesian world and Turkey.

In addition to a discussion of the use and abuse of Orientalism and its thesis in chapter 4, in chapter 3, I demonstrate the concerns of Edward W Said (d. 2003), who wrote, a few years before his death:

To assume that the ends of education are best advanced by focusing principally on our own separateness, or what accords with our own ethnic identity, culture and traditions, ironically places us where, as inferior or lesser races, we had been placed by nineteenth-century racial theory: unable to share in the general riches of human culture.

So, where is the Muslim academy in its ability "to share in the general riches of human culture"?

Indeed, what do we in the study of Islam have to do to move away from the philosophy of separateness and move toward an embrace of the riches of human diversity, both within the Islamic faith and outside of it? By sharing my thoughts and by offering a frank critique of the Muslim academy, I hope to encourage Muslim academic authorities and faculties to take heed of Said's strictures.

The Muslim academy needs especially to put on foot strategies for welcoming the diversity of the Muslim world. It must emphasize mutual awareness of Sunni and Shi'i and other Islamic and non-Islamic traditions as well as welcome the perspectives of Muslim peoples, countries, and cultures outside the Middle East.

But, as I argue in chapter 4 of Part II, getting the Muslim academy's act together is not just a question of overcoming a non-embrace of Muslim diversity. It also requires recognizing the value of, and welcoming, non-Muslim critical approaches to Islam and Islamic studies.

Why are a large number of Western Qur'anic studies so differently—grudgingly, poorly—received in the Qur'an and Hadith departments and Islamic theology faculties of the Muslim world?

To answer this question, chapter 4 focuses its optics particularly on the influence on Muslim approaches to the West and Westerners and the study of the Qur'an in the Muslim academy of Edward W. Said's important work on cultural representation, *Orientalism*. I look at how Said, whose works I always impressed with, did not, in the nature of things, accurately depict the West and Westerners and how, in respect to the study of Islam, Muslims have tended to substitute Western scientists and literary figures for Western scholars of Islam. Finally, chapter 4 seeks to explain how a Muslim "inferiority complex" as [tacitly] played out in *Orientalism*, has over the years been absorbed into the religious teaching of Islam and given rise to much of the substance to the defensive quality of the Islamic Apologetics that the Muslim academy has opposed to historical critical Islamic studies.

I believe that the Muslim confrontation with Western Islamic studies came to a head at the end of the 1970s as the different cultural revolutions that had roiled the world.

At that time, two groups of works on Islam, its texts and its cultures, faced off against each other. The one focused on a critical approach to the history and development of Islamic texts and beliefs. The other focused on how Islam and Islamic culture had hitherto been presented; the former group was largely seen as a "negative" and the latter's as a "positive" view of Islam among Muslim traditionalists, fundamentalists, and revolutionaries.

Foremost of the "negative" group was John Wansbrough's 1977 *Qur'anic Studies*, which denied the divine origin of the Qur'ān. Wansbrough's ideas are explained in chapter 1.

The "positive" group included especially Edward W. Said's 1978 *Orientalism* and Maurice Bucaille's 1976 *La Bible, le Coran et la science* ("The Bible, The Qur'ān and Science"), both of which presented critiques of Western Christian literature.

Muslim scholars countered Wansbrough's and his followers' critical-historical findings with arguments developed, especially in Said's *Orientalism*, an analysis of Western cultural imperialism and orientalism with respect to the Arab world, and Bucaille's *La Bible*, which argued the scientific reliability of the Qur'ān, in contrast to that of the Bible.

Although Orientalism was not a Qur'an-oriented study, in the Muslim world it has served as the primary reference for Muslim "anti-imperialist" works that harshly critique Orientalists, from its publication in 1978 until the present day. In the early years of the Islamic Revolution, for instance, Iranian "religious intellectuals" established journals and magazines and ran special issues dedicated to Islam and the West in which one of the source references was mainly Said's Orientalism. In fact, even the briefest review of academic literature and debate since the book's publication shows that, more than that of any other Western philosophical or literary thinker, Said's thesis has pride of place among all Islamic scholarly humors, including traditionalists, nationalists, anti-Westerners and anti-imperialists (anti-Orientalists) in the Muslim academy proper and in the broader Islamic disposition.

The central place of Said's Orientalism and its critique of imperializing cultural representation is also present across the different disciplines of the humanities in the Muslim academy, at the expense of other, more contemporary Western thinkers whose concerns focus and develop Said's.

Consider the works of the renowned Nobel-prize-winning African American writer, literary and social critic, and activist Toni Morrison (b. 1931). Hers—like Said's—are popular in the West and cover most of the principal themes covered by Orientalism, including otherness, outsider-ship, exploitation and cultural colonialism and imperialism.

Yet Morrison's readership in the Muslim academy is primarily students of English-language literature; one would be hard-pressed to find, for instance, even a free publisher's copy of Morrison's essay *The Origin of Others*, in translation or not, on the bookshelf of one of the Muslim academy's experts on Islam or history, or politics, or sociology.

Morrison, like Said, whose family immigrated to America from another continent and who, despite his significant influence on American society and academia, deeply felt his status as "Other, knows what being on the outside is like. She too is concerned with its destructive effects on the human spirit.

As well, like Said, Morrison is able to take distance from her own pain and see a wider picture. For example, she is able to characterize the Jim Crow laws that enforced racial segregation in the United States as "silly" or absurd insofar as they "prohibited any negro and white, in any public space, from playing together, 'in game with cards, dice, dominoes or checkers;" even as she recognizes the deeper social and political intentions involved and the terrible consequences for black America in particular and American society in general.

Morrison, in this also like Said, is someone who knows in the gut "the poison of foreignness;" "otherness," and "of not being at home in their homeland; of being exiled in the place where they belong."

But Morrison is very different from Said in this: Her ancestors were Africans, brought to America as slaves who would be considered legally different, if not absolutely inferior, to other Americans until the 1965 Civil Rights Act definitively outlawed all distinctions. Although Arab and immigrants, the Suids were always unquestionable legal equals of their American-born neighbors.

Morrison argues how a black person became the focus of a white scientist's study, in the same way that Said emphasized the way the Orient and Oriental became the focus of study for a colonial officer. Morrison cites Samuel Cartwright (d. 1863) a physician and slaveowner, who said:

Negroes, as a general rule, to which there are but few exceptions, can only have their intellectual faculties awakened in a sufficient degree to receive moral culture, and to profit by religious or other instruction, when under the compulsory authority of the white man From their natural indolence, unless under the stimulus of compulsion, they doze away their lives with the capacity of their lungs for atmospheric air only half expanded, from the want of exercise The black blood distributed to the brain chains the mind to ignorance, superstition and barbarism, and blots the door against civilization, moral culture and religious truth.¹⁹

I hope chapter 4 stimulates readers to rethink colonial and post-colonial theories through the lens of my investigation of how Said became the author of reference for revolutionary Muslims inside and outside the academy. I hope that readers will begin to reflect, too, on why Said continues ascendant to the exclusion of such powerful contemporary thinkers as Morrison in the Muslim world. <>

DISRUPTIVE VOICES AND THE SINGULARITY OF HISTORIES (Histories of Anthropology Annual, Volume 13) edited by Regna Darnell and Frederic W. Gleach [Histories of Anthropology Annual, University of Nebraska Press. 9781496217691]

Histories of Anthropology Annual presents diverse perspectives on the discipline's history within a global context, with a goal of increasing awareness and use of historical approaches in teaching, learning, and conducting anthropology. The series includes critical, comparative, analytical, and narrative studies involving all aspects and subfields of anthropology.

Volume 13, **DISRUPTIVE VOICES AND THE SINGULARITY OF HISTORIES**, explores the interplay of identities and scholarship through the history of anthropology, with a special section examining fieldwork predecessors and indigenous communities in Native North America. Individual contributions explore the complexity of women's history, indigenous history, national traditions, and oral histories to juxtapose what we understand of the past with its present continuities. These contributions include Sharon Lindenburger's examination of Franz Boas and his navigation with Jewish identity, Kathy M'Closkey's documentation of Navajo weavers and their struggles with cultural identities and economic resources and demands, and Mindy Morgan's use of the text of Ruth Underhill's O'odham study to capture the voices of three generations of women ethnographers.

Because this work bridges anthropology and history, a richer and more varied view of the past emerges through the meticulous narratives of anthropologists and their unique fieldwork, ultimately providing

competing points of access to social dynamics. This volume examines events at both macro and micro levels, documenting the impact large-scale historical events have had on particular individuals and challenging the uniqueness of a single interpretation of “the same facts.”

CONTENTS

List of Illustrations

Editors' Introduction REGNA DARNELL AND FREDERIC W. GLEACH

1. Totalitarian Critique: Fabian and the History of Primitive Anthropology FREDERICO DELGADO ROSA

Ich Bin Jüdischer Abstammung (I Am of Jewish Lineage): The Conflicted Jewish Identity of the Anthropologist Franz Boas SHARON LINDENBURGER

A Document in an Unexpected Place: John P. Harrington and the Stevenson Scrapbook NANCY J. PAREZO

Diasporas Of and By Design: Exploring the Unholy Alliance between Museums and the Diffusion of Navajo (Dine) Textile Designs KATHY M'CLOSKEY

5. Mock Rituals, Sham Battles, and Real Research: Anthropologists and the Ethnographic Study of the Bontoc Igorot in 1900s "Igorrote Villages" DEANA L. WEIBEL

6. Indigenous Studies in Argentina: Anthropology, History, and Ethnohistory from the 1980s CLAUDIA SALOMON TARQUINI

Voicing the Ancestors

Fieldwork Predecessors and Indigenous Communities in Native North America IRA BASHKOW

No Object without Its Story: Franz Boas, George Hunt, and the Creation of a Native Material Anthropology IRA JACKNIS

Encounters in Ontario: Acts of Ethnographic Search and Rescue MARGARET M. BRUCHAC

10. The Boas Plan: A View from the Margins SAUL SCHWARTZ

n. Look Once More at the Old Things: Ruth Underhill's O'odham Text Collections MINDY MORGAN

Rereading Deloria: Against Workshops, for Communities SEBASTIAN F. BRAUN

"Let's Do Better This Time": Vine Deloria Jr.'s Ongoing Engagement with Anthropology ROBERT L. A. HANCOCK

Contributors

Excerpt: This thirteenth volume of *Histories of Anthropology Annual* continues to problematize the plurality of histories and the entailed impossibility of arriving at a monolithic understanding of "what really happened" in the past. The location of this work, bridging anthropology and history, brings to bear a compound set of interests and methods that together offer a richer view of our past. The characteristic anthropological emphasis on ethnographic voice resonates with widespread attention across the humanities and social sciences to the contingencies underlying both specific events and the processes of emergence underlying them. Historicist approaches to texts and process ground the work and infuse dynamism into synchronic events. Most scholars in our disciplinary history deploy both sets of tools and strategies, but individual experience and perspectives produce competing narratives of anthropology's history that can provide a critical point of access to social dynamics.

Over recent decades, the historical disciplines have ventured beyond grand narratives of warfare, commerce, and empire to explore the impact of epic-scale events on particular individuals grounded in equally particular local contexts, often disrupting previous and official histories. Social and cultural historians unravel the complexity of women's history, Indigenous history, national traditions, and oral histories to juxtapose what we understand of the past with its present continuities. This changing focus requires historians to look beyond the intentions recorded in archival documents to what was omitted because it did not seem to be historically significant to participants at the time. Retrospectively, however, historians can synthesize individual and community perspectives that are only accessible from a distance of time and immediate context.

Literary models exemplify the explanatory power of combining micro and macro perspectives in this way: Leo Tolstoy's *War and Peace* documents Napoleon's march on Moscow; Herman Melville's *Moby Dick* grounds multiple positions within the whaling industry at its peak to lend heroic proportions to the confrontation between nature and human will; Albert Camus's *The Plague* dissects the escalating impacts of contagion and quarantine on a community. Similarly, many historians of anthropology approach archival records using ethnographic methods to tease out social and cultural contexts inherent in them and combine insights from multiple archives to disrupt the uniqueness of any single interpretation of "the same" facts. Like archaeologists, archival scholars cannot interrogate their research subjects directly, but traces of past actions and motives remain as grist for the investigator's mill across disciplines and distances.

From its inception, HOAA has addressed how history-of-science disrupts comfortable readings of the past: from national traditions; to individuals holding seminal positions in events later judged to be significant; to disciplines and subdisciplines of anthropology, history, and related fields. The "disruptive voices" we emphasize in the title of this volume are not unique here, nor is any individual author necessarily seeking to be disruptive. Taken together, the contributions here continue the project of using specific studies to shake up our understandings of the discipline.

Claudia Salomon Tarquini meticulously documents Indigenous studies in Argentina through the lens of an amalgam of anthropology, history, and ethnohistory, three disciplines that are inextricable in the Argentine context. World anthropologies rarely import categories without such adaptation to local conditions. The hegemony of North American and European traditions recedes as new anthropological traditions emerge and interact across national boundaries.

Sharon Lindenburger examines how Franz Boas navigated his Jewish identity through the intersection of German and American anthropology. Her inferences from Boas's own statements, or lack thereof, problematize the variations within Judaism itself during Boas's early education and family exposure to the revolutionary ideals of 1948, his professional choices at different periods of his life, and his changing relationship to his homeland during two world wars (from pacifism to antiracism). She argues that Reform Judaism, then and now, shared much of Boas's own ambivalence, openness to assimilation, and engagement with the Ethical Culture movement of Felix Adler in New York City. Frederico Delgado Rosa reexamines the concept of the primitive in anthropology in a sophisticated "comparative history of

anthropology" that goes beyond particular case studies to interrogate the "allochronism" around which Johannes Fabian organized his 1983 critique of the anthropological conceit of the ethnographic present. Both text and footnotes abound with exemplars; cases particular to Indigenous North America can be found in the "Voicing the Ancestors" chapters in this volume. Rosa argues that the methodology of the Americanist tradition that grew up around Franz Boas and his students has permeated the discipline beyond the study of Native Americans. His conclusions set the continuity of such traditions within a shared space-time of (post-) modern anthropology and contemporary Indigenous adaptations. Anthropologists and historians obtain their data through multiple methods that produce surprisingly parallel results across shared questions of historicity. Kathy M'Closkey is a fieldworking anthropologist with long-term relationships to Navajo weavers and weaving as craft, cultural identity, and economic resource. She deploys this lived experience to interrogate archival documents revealing the socioeconomic exploitation of Navajo weavers. The viability and value of Navajo rug designs to their creators and their communities disrupts easy acceptance of cheap knockoffs of Navajo rug designs in a neo-capitalist economic era. Archival and ethnographic evidence combine to resituate Navajo community at the core of the critique.

Deana Weibel uses her family genealogy as the great-granddaughter of impresario Richard Schneidewind with the Bontoc Igorot of the Philippines to explore the contrived contexts of observation and performance, deployed by both researchers and their collaborators—especially experienced interpreter and ethnographic assistant Antero Cabrera—as actors in a living exhibit at a series of World's Fairs and Expositions. Weibel catalogues the publicity gimmicks of exoticism, illusion, metaphor, and misrepresentation as cultures meet in an artificial performance context that intersects with realities back home in the Philippines and belies the early twentieth-century narrative of the vanishing savage.

From the archive of John P. Harrington, a notorious packrat, Nancy Parezo ferrets out fascinating documentation of the personal side of the southwestern U.S. fieldwork of James and Matilda Coxe Stevenson. When long-term fieldworkers and archival historians pore over documents in search of evidence on other matters, familiarity with larger contexts often allows them to recognize and reframe matter out of place, the document that does not belong where it is found.

HOAA policy normally accepts no more than three chapters from any given conference or conference session because of our commitment to span the range of potential histories of anthropology rather than encourage a series of thematic volumes. We make an exception in this volume because each of the chapters on the perspectives of Native North Americans as studied populations reflects themes that recur across multiple earlier volumes of this series. Although each paper stands on its own, their juxtaposition challenges a simple narrative of interpretive voice. Native American intellectuals (as well as ordinary people) have persistently and often stridently disrupted the right of outsiders to speak for them and have disputed the accuracy and validity of what has been spoken and written about them. These chapters argue that the persistent challenge to the legitimacy of the anthropological voice is resolved, to the extent that it is, by collaboration with Indigenous communities and those of their members open to sharing cultural expertise in the hope of enhancing cross-cultural understanding. Ira Bashkow provides an overview of the commonalities of such collaborations, despite their dramatic surface variation over

time and across particular scholars and ethnographic sites. Several contributors are Indigenous and reflect their insider standpoint. Because Bashkow presents more extensive framing of the collective intentions of the six chapters that follow, they are treated briefly here.

Ira Jacknis returns to the canonical collaboration between George Hunt and Franz Boas to reveal how the two men, each for his own reasons, worked together to establish Kwakwaka'wakw material culture in a museum context intelligible to a non-Indigenous public audience. Margaret Bruchac emphasizes how what was once dismissed as ethnographic salvage today functions to reawaken past knowledge for use in contemporary revitalization contexts and assesses the ambivalent legacy of Frank Speck in northeastern ethnology as both activist and gatekeeper.

Saul Schwartz considers the consequences for Indigenous communities of the distance implicit in Boas's vision of anthropology and its changing interpretation as contemporary Indigenous communities return to ethnographic records to support cultural and linguistic revitalization.

Mindy Morgan chooses Ruth Underhill's O'Odham texts from among the many others that might exemplify what can be brought back into the present and documents the cumulative record from three generations of women ethnographers speaking to multiple audiences, both professional and public.

Sebastian Braun and Robert Hancock, in quite different ways, approach the seminal figure of Vine Deloria Jr. as a catalyst for the relationship of Indigenous voices to Indigenous control over Indigenous knowledge and its dissemination. Crucially, Indigenous anthropologists and historians struggle to insert their disruptive voices and to destabilize mainstream knowledge through a more stereoscopic lens. The histories of anthropology are indeed plural. Braun provides background context for the political maelstrom underlying Deloria's often strident voice, whereas Metis anthropologist and historian Robert Hancock, in the cameo method perfected by George Stocking, explores Deloria's satiric voice in a single session at the American Anthropological Association meetings, defining it as a call to collaborative action alongside Indigenous allies and colleagues.

We trust that readers will find in this volume perspectives, interpretations, and specific cases that will articulate in productive ways with their own experiences. Some may reinforce, while others may challenge each individual's understanding of the discipline's histories. As always, we encourage others to read and write on their particular and collective aspects of disciplinary history and to submit their work for future volumes in this series. <>

THE CHIMERA PRINCIPLE: AN ANTHROPOLOGY OF MEMORY AND IMAGINATION by Carlo Severi, Translated by Janet Lloyd, Foreword by David Graeber [Hau - Malinowski Monographs, HAU Books, 9780990505051]

Available in English for the first time, anthropologist Carlo Severi's *The Chimera Principle* breaks new theoretical ground for the study of ritual, iconographic technologies, and oral traditions among non-literate peoples. Setting himself against a tradition that has long seen the memory of people “without writing”—which relies on such ephemeral records as ornaments, body painting, and masks—as fundamentally disordered or doomed to failure, he argues strenuously that ritual actions in these societies pragmatically produce religious meaning and that they demonstrate what he calls a “chimeric” imagination.

Deploying philosophical and ethnographic theory, Severi unfolds new approaches to research in the anthropology of ritual and memory, ultimately building a new theory of imagination and an original anthropology of thought. This English-language edition, beautifully translated by Janet Lloyd and complete with a foreword by David Graeber, will spark widespread debate and be heralded as an instant classic for anthropologists, historians, and philosophers.

Reviews

“Here is an ambitious, comparative anthropology of mnemonic arts proposed with special attention to visual imagery and related ‘techniques for constructing memorable knowledge.’ Severi has conducted extensive research among Kuna peoples of Central America and is influenced by the brilliant ruminations of the cultural theorist Aby Warburg (1866–1929). Severi calls for recognition of deliberately ambiguous ‘ways of organizing differences’ to propose particular understandings ‘that do not recognize any pre-established center of epistemological priority.’ ‘Oral cultures’ represent knowledge in teasing instability and incompleteness, he asserts, for community members seeing an Apache pictograph or hearing an Iatmul myth are expected to fill in details from their senses of how the world works and what is at stake during a given performance event. ‘A society’s memory is never single,’ Severi reminds readers, and ‘every ... memory is, inevitably, the memory of a person’ bound to forget details and invent replacements. Exegeses further vary according to political and aesthetic needs of the moment. Through a ‘chimera principle,’ counterintuitive juxtapositions of heterogeneous ideas, references, and parts-of-wholes (think *gargoyle* as a synonym of *chimera*) instigate imagination, even as wisdom is recalled and creative problem solving is undertaken. . . . Recommended.” — *Choice*

“This highly engaging and deftly written book is the fruit of exemplary scholarly work and is likely to become an indispensable reference for future research on the anthropology of memory and the so-called ‘oral’ cultures. . . . *The Chimera Principle* is an exceptionally detailed and analytical work of great academic value, which can nevertheless be read by non-specialists and be of interest to a broad and diverse reading public. Putting the old argument about the supposed fragility of memory among so-called ‘oral’ societies, as well as the common view that pictography was either a communication system that is

forever lost to us or an ‘unsuccessful attempt to invent a type of writing,’ on an entirely new basis, *The Chimera Principle* is a fascinating work that makes an important contribution to the anthropology of memory.” — *Journal of the Anthropological Society of Oxford*

"The centrality of comparative interpretation to anthropology is dazzlingly illustrated in Severi's *The Chimera Principle*. This is a book in the grand tradition of Claude Levi-Strauss' *Mythologiques*. Severi begins with a meditation on a Zande harp, followed by a discussion of the art historian Aby Warburg's expansive efforts to understand so-called primitive art. Warburg visited the Hopi in 1895–96 and became fascinated by children who, when asked to draw lightning, drew a snake. The lightning-snakes they drew become the prototype of Severi's chimeras, artistic productions that Western analysts have consistently misinterpreted in terms of the referential function of language—a tack that leads them to categorize such objects as “crudely realistic,” “abstract,” “decorative” or “imaginary” (Severi 2015a:33–34). None of those terms, Severi argues, gets at the mnemonic and ritual functions of such arts, and he sets out on a grand quest, mainly across the Americas (but with forays into Oceania and New Guinea) to create a new “anthropology of memory and imagination,” as the subtitle of his book has it.” — Richard Handler, *Reviews in Anthropology*

"**THE CHIMERA PRINCIPLE: AN ANTHROPOLOGY OF MEMORY AND IMAGINATION** making a contribution to different fields of interest in anthropology: memory, ritual, and images, among others, bringing them together in a coherent argument... this is not just a collection of essays, on the contrary it is a very coherent volume with a sustained narrative that unfolds chapter by chapter." — Roger Sansi, *Anthropological Forum*

"Carlo Severi's **THE CHIMERA PRINCIPLE: AN ANTHROPOLOGY OF MEMORY AND IMAGINATION** is an essential work of anthropological literature for the study of so-called 'oral' societies but also for researchers interested in the transmission of memory, belief, oral tradition, and so on.... Due to his groundbreaking reflections on the old anthropological concepts **THE CHIMERA PRINCIPLE** has all the values of the monumental anthropological synthetic works worth reading and 'thinking with.'" — Katja Hrobat Virloget, *American Anthropologist*

"There are at least two ways of constructing memories, Severi urges. The first is narrational: legends, myths, and stories based on linear sequences in established genres. The second, contrastively, is a song form, depending on an iconic formulation of knowledge: as in shamanistic ritual action that constructs complex images characterized by simultaneity and condensation of certain commonplaces that the tradition would transmit. But the images are also chimeras: allusive, contradictory, unfinished, calling on the imagination of culture members to be collaboratively or dialogically exercised in ceremonial contexts for the purpose of together 'remembering' 'the culture'... Carlo Severi's **THE CHIMERA PRINCIPLE: AN ANTHROPOLOGY OF MEMORY AND IMAGINATION** evidences much careful archival scholarship that would reconstrue earlier anthropological understandings of 'primitive art'; rather than representations of the world, here are objects of memory and imagination that provide a codification of mental space. The book calls for a comparative anthropology of iconographic traditions that work through the mnemonic use of images – understood as the 'non-Western memory arts' (p.

19)." — Nigel Rapport, *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*

"Originally published in French in 2007 and now available in English for the first time, Carlo Severi's influential **THE CHIMERA PRINCIPLE: AN ANTHROPOLOGY OF MEMORY AND IMAGINATION** is a book that seeks to transform the anthropology of memory and imagination, as its subtitle suggests. Based on Severi's fieldwork among the Kuna of Panama, as well as on his extensive bibliographic knowledge of art and anthropology, the book considers long-standing anthropological questions such as the relationship between oral and literate cultures, the prevalence of the mnemonic form in Amerindian the ambiguous character of shamanic singers... and the relevance of projection to the anthropological concept of belief." — Guilherme Orlandi Heurich, *Current Anthropology*

"Carlo Severi's **THE CHIMERA PRINCIPLE: AN ANTHROPOLOGY OF MEMORY AND IMAGINATION** is a forceful study for anyone who wants to move beyond conventional concepts of 'text' and 'image.'... In this brilliant translation of what is certain to become an instant classic in visual anthropology, we come to understand how sound and image become alive in acts of communication." — Thomas Cummins, co-author of *Beyond the Lettered City: Indigenous Literacies in the Andes*

Contents

Foreword by David Graeber

Acknowledgments

Illustration sources xxi

Introduction

WARBURG THE ANTHROPOLOGIST, OR THE DECODING OF A UTOPIA:
FROM THE BIOLOGY OF IMAGES TO THE ANTHROPOLOGY OF MEMORY

Warburg: Visual symbols and chimeras

Forgotten roots, or the biology of images

Forms and ideas: Pitt-Rivers and the prophecy of the past

Hjalmar Stolpe: Prototypes and cryptoglyphs

A return to the lightning-snake

Warburg the anthropologist, or the decoding of a utopia

Image-sequences and chimera-objects

Image-sequences

Chimera-objects

AN AMERINDIAN MNEMONIC FORM: PICTOGRAPHY AND PARALLELISM

A decoding of pictography: The Dakota Bible

Pictography and shamanistic song: The Kuna case

Concerning mental pivots and civilizations of memory

Fritz Saxl used to say that Warburg, in each of his articles, would write an introduction to a science that would never see the light of day. (p. 38)

[E]very technique for remembering is also a technique of the imagination.

Excerpt: It's hard to deny, these days, that many fields of anthropology have been reduced to a desultory state. These include some of those that, traditionally, have been most vital, such as the study of kinship. But nowhere is it more true than for the study of myth, ritual, cosmology—all those endeavors through

which anthropologists once aspired to contribute to a broader, comparative science of meaning. It is very hard to imagine any contemporary anthropologist producing an analysis of a mythic cycle, a sacrificial ritual, or even, say, temple architecture with the richness and density we used to expect regularly from figures like Claude Lévi-Strauss, Nancy Munn, or Victor Turner.¹ The irony is not because there have been no advances in our understandings of such matters over the last several decades. To the contrary: it's precisely because there have been.

The dilemma is, as cognitive science has demonstrated, that the entire apparatus of assumptions about the nature of language, meaning, and thought on which those analyses was founded is simply false, but it has not yet provided us with the tools to create nearly as sophisticated analyses on a more sound basis. We know now that symbolic thought is not structured like a language. We understand that no synthesis of Prague school phonemics and Schleiermachiian hermeneutics will ever get us even remotely close to understanding what is really happening when a man in Borneo recites a prayer over the disinterred bones of his ancestor, or a woman in Burundi tells a funny story while embroidering a piece of cloth. We know the tools we had been using were wildly inadequate. But any new tools we have are still extraordinarily crude. Cognitive science (let alone neuroscience, or allied branches of philosophy) has not come anywhere close to providing us with means to build analytical structures that could rival something like, say, Jean-Pierre Vernant's (1980) analysis of the myth of Prometheus, Lévi-Strauss' *The raw and the cooked* ([1964] 1983), let alone, to take just one example, the kind of richly beautiful ethnographic analysis we find in a book like Catherine Hugh Jones' *From the Milk River* (1978) or Stephen Hugh Jones' *The palm and the Pleiades* (1979).

We have, therefore, the promise of a new science of thought in front of us. We know it will someday exist. But we still don't know what it will ultimately look like.

True, the situation has, admittedly, played itself out quite differently in the English-speaking world than on the Continent. Anglophone social theorists have reacted mainly by abandoning any pretense that what they are doing has much to do with science in the first place. It's rare even to hear the term "social science" anymore, except from rational choice theorists and similar positivists. Instead, the project has been redefined as "social theory," and "theory" now refers not to hypotheses that can be tested in some way, but to ideas culled from the tradition of Continental philosophy, starting with Spinoza and ending, perhaps, with Derrida, Agamben, or Badiou. In contrast, French, German, and Italian social theorists have been reluctant to accept such a division. Many are much more willing to try to incorporate the results of cognitive science with the (largely Anglo-American) tradition of analytic philosophy that has engaged with it. They have, in other words, at least begun to undertake the painstaking and often decidedly unglamorous work of rebuilding everything from scratch.

Carlo Severi's *The chimera principle* is, it seems to me, the first work in that latter tradition that affords us a glimpse of what this new, fully evolved science of meaning—one that does not simply do violence to what we know now about the human mind and human communication, but one that also is capable of genuinely engaging with all the big questions of myth, magic, art, ritual—might eventually look like. This is why its publication in English can be considered a landmark.

Granted, it is a first effort, a series of explorations, a throwing open of windows, each vista opening the way to another even more sweeping vision of some body of inquiry that may someday come to exist. But this is only half its charm and power. It is a work that reminds us of futures long forgotten, of days when it seemed self-evident to those drawn to the discipline that anthropology would, eventually, unlock the secrets of the human soul. Fittingly, Severi draws here on a great tradition of other such unrealized or half-realized intellectual projects from those early days: Augustus Pitt-Rivers' biology of images, Aby Warburg's Atlas of Memory, Gregory Bateson's sketch for an ethnography of the materiality of latmul thought, Frances Yates' (1966) work on the Medieval arts of memory and the literature that has followed in its wake.

Yates' book is an excellent example of such frustrated promises—or perhaps it just seems that way to me because I'm old enough to remember when it was (re)discovered in the anthropology department in Chicago in the 1980s. I well remember, as a graduate student, the excitement with which many of us felt, especially as we compared it with A. R. Luria's *The mind of mnemonist* (republished in 1987), and Jonathan Spence's *The memory palace of Matteo Ricci* (1985). We were convinced that something important was happening—or should be; that a new sub-discipline dedicated to the comparative study of mnemotechnics was in the process of formation. But it never ultimately happened. Apart from a couple pioneering, but largely ignored, works by David Napier (1987, 1996), the anticipated field failed to materialize, and everyone moved on to other things.' Perhaps now, in retrospect, we can understand why: the field just wasn't ready to absorb this kind of material; the intellectual tools at our disposal were simply inadequate. Now, with this book, a quarter century later, the moment seems to have finally arrived.

It is as a book about the arts of memory, one imagines, that **THE CHIMERA PRINCIPLE: AN ANTHROPOLOGY OF MEMORY AND IMAGINATION** is most likely to make its mark. Perhaps this is understandable: it certainly makes a very provocative intervention in this regard. Much of what we have considered "primitive art," the author argues, were not meant as self-contained objects in their own right, or even as elements in some larger performance, but as memory cues to texts—usually to be performed in some sort of ritual context—whose exact nature is, often as not, entirely lost to us. These images were never meant to exist apart from words. Yet those words were a form of artistry in and of themselves. The conclusion immediately shatters half a dozen complacent assumptions we normally bring, unthinkingly, to any analysis of comparative aesthetics: the assumption of a simple distinction between "orality" and "literacy," for example; the notion of "picture-writing"; most of our assumptions about the relationship between icon, ritual, and text. And that shattering of assumptions, in turn, proves endlessly productive. Over the course of the book it allows Severi to raise a whole series of further questions about magic, knowledge, trauma, and imagination to create a fresh technical terminology (e.g., the song-form, nachleben, objective and subjective parallelism, chimera-objects, projective belief), and thus to cast even more complacent assumptions into doubt.

Still, it would be a shame if *The chimera principle* ends up being remembered simply as a book about memory techniques. True, even if that's all it were, its publication would be a landmark. But its aims are in fact much more ambitious. Severi not only builds on imaginary sciences, he also lays the groundwork

for a veritable science of the imagination. It is not memory but the nature of the human imagination that the author is ultimately trying to understand. The matter is rarely stated quite as explicitly as it might be. Sometimes one almost has the sense the author feels if he were to name his quarry too explicitly, it would take heed and slip away. Still this ultimate purpose shapes every aspect of the argument: from the early evocation of Vischer and Löwy on memory images to the startling analyses of messianic and penitential cult movements with which The chimera principle comes to a close. The premise of the book is that there is always, everywhere, an intrinsic relation between the means by which we store and classify knowledge, and what would otherwise seem to be its opposite, "evocation, ideation, and poetic imagination," the inner resources that enable us to leap beyond the received order of things to create something radically new.

Hence the "chimera principle" itself. The central argument is that imagination is a social phenomenon, dialogic even, but crucially one that typically works itself out through the mediation of objects that are at once paradoxical, startling (in such a way as to become imagines agentes, "active" in the Yatesian sense), but also—and this is the crucial element others have largely ignored—to some degree unfinished, teasingly schematic in such a way as to, almost perforce, mobilize the imaginative powers of the recipient to fill in the blanks. Even what we are accustomed to thinking of as religious or magical "belief," Severi argues, is largely to be accounted for through the workings of this unstable, inherently ambiguous, endlessly imaginative process of paradox and imaginative projection.

A science of imagination. It's hard to imagine an intellectual project more ambitious. As much as anything that has been written in recent decades, this book really is an attempt to use the tools of anthropology to unfathom secrets of the human soul.

How then to celebrate a book of such ambitions? Perhaps best by simply pausing to reflect on some of the vistas it opens up. Consider, for a moment, the question of history. It was always clear that the ancient and medieval systems of "artificial memory" described by Yates (1964), Carruthers ([1990] 2008), and the rest, based on the arrangement of striking images in sequence within a fixed imaginary space, had to be rooted—however idiosyncratic they seemed—in some kind of universal human capacity. How else, for instance, could Luria's twentieth-century Russian mnemonist have come up with almost exactly the same system with, apparently, absolutely no awareness that he was doing so? So: are the various lost arts of memory described in this book also independent inventions, historically unconnected? Actually, there is one surprising piece of evidence that suggests that they are not.

For Severi, the "chimera principle" goes well beyond the mere creation of "chimera objects" such as Warburg's lightning-serpent, or actual gorgons and chimeras—that is, images created by schematizing and formalizing parts of animal or human bodies and recombining them in striking and unexpected ways. It is a much more general principle which lies at the heart of human imaginative practices everywhere. Still, it is helpful to focus for a moment on monstrous images of this sort. Because they do seem to have a specific history. They did not always exist. As archeologist David Wengrow painstakingly demonstrates

in his recent monograph *The origins of monsters* (2013), in the Pleistocene, and on through the Neolithic, such figures were either extraordinarily rare or entirely nonexistent. The habit of breaking creatures up into abstract component elements and then reassembling them into strange—and usually terrifying—forms has a specific historical origin: it is the product of what he calls "the first age of mechanical reproduction," roughly corresponding to the creation of the first bureaucratic systems of governance in Mesopotamia and Egypt, whose administrative cadres were also responsible for the systematic development of systems of math and writing, and who, generally, specialized in this sort of schematization and rearrangement of aspects of the world. Odd though it may sound, chimeras were originally a bureaucratic invention.

In other words, for much of our history, some of the features we are used to identifying most closely with "primitive art" simply did not exist. At best, hybrid creatures might have popped up here and there as isolated flights of fancy, but there was nothing remotely like the systematic elaboration we've come to associate with, say, Sepik River societies of Melanesia, the Northwest coast of North America, or the nomadic kingdoms of Central Asia. And when they did appear in the bureaucratic environments of Egypt or Mesopotamia, they do not seem to have had anything to do with the kind of mnemotechnics that Severi describes. True, once they existed, the "cognitive catch" that made such images so potentially easy to fix in memory did, gradually, have its effect. Eventually, images of composite creatures spread almost everywhere, and took on a new life and new meaning as they did. Yet how this happened, and why, is something historians have hardly begun to piece together.

We don't know what really happened, but, since this is a book about imagination, perhaps it would be fitting to apply some and try to envision one possible scenario. Let us say, perhaps, there came to be a certain band of civilization, existing alongside, in opposition to, yet also intimately related to the bureaucratic urban civilizations with their writing systems. These have been referred to as heroic societies (Chadwick 1926, Wengrow 2011, Graeber 2013), but they could just as easily be referred to as "civilizations of heroic memory." Both the bureaucratic and commercial cities of the valleys, and the heroic societies of the hills, deserts, and steppes surrounding them, came to define themselves against one another. Where one valued order and administrative regularity, the other created an endlessly fluctuating world of heroic aristocrats, boasting, dueling, vying with one another in every sort of spectacular potlatch or sacrifice. Where one was held together by registers, ledgers, and accounts, the other rejected writing systems altogether, substituting either the kind of elaborate systems of oral composition that Parry (1930) and Lord ([1960] 2000) so famously described (which almost invariably were used to extemporize heroic epics that celebrated precisely this sort of heroic society), or, we can now add, the kinds of iconographic memory systems Carlo Severi documents.

Could these arts of memory have formed originally not as an alternative but as a defiant response to urbanization and written script? It's possible. In fact, in the case of the Old World, it fits the evidence quite nicely. Still, the case of the Americas renders this picture infinitely more complex. It is by no means entirely clear what relation, say, the Hopi or Bellacoola had to the large urban civilizations of the Mississippi Valley or Central Mexico. And those urban civilizations themselves had an extremely ambivalent relationship with writing. We would have to ask why the evolution of bureaucratic systems

of tallies and accounts, which ultimately led to the development of Mesopotamian cuneiform and Egyptian hieroglyphics, took such a different course in the Andes—where the tallies did not lead to the emergence of a script—and Central America, where writing emerged only among the Maya and was not adopted by any of their neighbors.

In fact, it has always struck me that the latter is one of the great historical mysteries that almost no one has really attempted to explain. Mesopotamian cuneiform was widely adopted by neighboring urban civilizations, and in the process simplified into Ugaritic, and then into the Phoenician alphabet, which became the basis for an endless series of different scripts. Nothing like this happened in the Americas. Why was the Maya syllabic system never adopted by any of their neighbors? Why did the urban civilizations of Oaxaca, for example—who obviously would have known about it—instead continue to write codices using the sort of memory systems Severi describes?

Once we throw off the evolutionary shackles that still implicitly dominate our thinking on such matters, and realize that politics has always existed, such questions become far easier to address. After all, what is politics, in the final analysis, but a collection of quarrels over contrasting conceptions of what is valuable in human life? Perhaps the balance of forces in the Americas simply came out the other way. In Eurasia and Africa, bureaucratic civilization proved resilient and enduring, and heroic systems of memory where either pushed to the margins, or, as in the classical and medieval European worlds, were maintained as a kind of subculture in the shadow of the written word. Could it be that early systems of writing did emerge in a remote historical past we are now unable to reconstruct—perhaps not just in the Maya lowlands but elsewhere? And that a similar dynamic of schismogenetic mutual definition did take place, but that the political balance in this case tipped the other way? After all, if, say, the Olmecs had produced thousands of barkcloth codices, how would we really know? Perhaps the complex of values that came to be ranged against the urban, bureaucratic systems simply proved more resilient, and even in the cities, scribes came to adopt the alternative memory systems instead.

This is pure speculation. We really do not know. It's possible we never could know. Still, I think the notion of "civilizations of heroic memory" might provide a helpful starting point for a larger historical analysis—even if one that will probably have to be discarded once we develop a more nuanced understanding. If nothing else, many of the techniques described in this book seem designed to lend themselves to ostentatiously heroic feats of recall. One need think only of the extraordinary capacities of latmul men of knowledge, each bearing in his head lists of up to tens of thousands of totemic names. The latmul seem a perfect example of a society in which heroic values have been, as it were, democratized: where instead of a mass of retainers shifting allegiance between a collection of boastful feuding aristocrats, and an elite of bards or priests or druids—masters of complex, unwritten arcane lore—all adult males are expected to be either "men of violence" or "men of discretion," boastful warriors or guardians of totemic lore. Surely, in the endless heated men's house debates that mark latmul political life, feats of memory are meant to directly parallel heroic feats in war. Here, memory itself becomes an exploit.

Yet it is also—as in just about every example recounted in the hook—a memory of exploits as well.

In no case, among the many cases Severi assembles, do we encounter the kind of lists, inventories, and accounting procedures that appear to have led to the development of writing in Mesopotamia, Egypt, the Indus Valley, or China. Math is minimal. Even the latmul lists of names, which might seem to bear the closest resemblance to what we have come to think of as bureaucratic procedures, really encode moments in a mythic journey that led to the gradual creation of the material and social universe. In every case the narratives these arts of memory seek to preserve involve travels, either in physical or conceptual space; almost invariably, too, these travels are punctuated by heroic feats of creation or destruction. They are memories of hunts, shamanic journeys, or military expeditions. The form, and content, of the systems of memory appears to bear a constant homology, one which itself suggests a structure of value inherently opposed to those embodied in writing as administrative technique.

One legacy of that complex of values that has historically surrounded and supported techniques of writing is the notion of the "text." Ideally, a text, once created, is seen as floating entirely free of any concrete context of its creation or, not to mention, as a purely linguistic abstraction in no way dependent on any particularly visual element (typeface, illustrations, size, shape, design, etc.) through which it might, at any moment, be embodied or conveyed. This is the conception of text that lay behind the most influential works of interpretive anthropology (the Balinese cockfight being, of course, the most famous example)—much to the disadvantage of the hermeneutic project as a whole. But of course, this conception of text itself represents a kind of utopian ideal, in which the imaginative genius of a single, unique artist is seen to create an equally unique object destined to transcend space and time to endure forever.

That complex of values that has supported the various arts of memory has entirely different implications. In many of the cases examined in this book, the "texts," such as they are, are precisely what we no longer have. But in a way, this is a minor absence, since texts in anything like that utopian sense clearly do not exist and no one really imagines that they ought to. We are confronted instead with a series of material technologies that externalize the process of memory and imagination, making that process something intrinsically dialogic and contextual. Everything turns on a tacit complicity, whereby the author leaves the work, in effect, half-finished so as to "capture the imagination" of the interpreter. This clearly has powerful implications for any theory of human creativity.

It seems to me it has important implications for our most basic understanding of human thought as well.

Let me conclude by explaining what I mean by this. In recent years, two philosophers of mind, Andy Clark and David Chalmers (1998), have created a great deal of stir both among analytical philosophers and cognitive scientists by challenging the assumption that the human mind must necessarily be coextensive with the brain. The assumption seems to be contradicted even by the most ordinary everyday experience. Consider, they propose, two people: one is trying to remember a colleague's name and calls it up from their memory; the other has a bad memory and turns just as automatically to their address book. Or perhaps one is doing a problem of long division in her head, and the other is working it out with a pencil and paper. If so, why is the notebook, or the pencil and paper, not, at that moment, part of that person's mind? If mind is a process of thinking, then surely the notebook, or the

pencil and paper, play exactly the same role in the process as the part of their brain would have done and which otherwise would have been activated. It would be completely arbitrary to insist that the part of the woman's brain in which one is working out the long division is part of one's mind, during the moment when she is solving the problem, but that the pencil and paper is not.

This would indeed seem to be common sense; but it has enormous implications. Clark and Chalmers are more interested in human beings' relations to technology than in their relations to one another, so they devote a great deal of energy to fobbing off what any anthropologist would (I hope) consider the obvious next question: if this is true of the dynamic relation between human brains and physical technologies (abacuses, computers, rooms arranged in such a way to act as astrological calendars, etc.), then what about the relationship between brains and other brains? Cognitive science reveals that fully self-conscious thought is remarkably fleeting. Unless one practices some form of artificial mental discipline like meditation, conscious reflection rarely lasts more than a few seconds. Or, this is true of solitary reflection. It's obviously not the case when one is engaged in intense conversation with someone else. (This is presumably the reason so many people engage in imaginary dialogues when trying to work out a problem.) But if so, self-conscious thought generally tends to occur precisely when the difference between one mind and another is least apparent, when it might make just as much sense to speak of a single, dialogic consciousness.

The extended mind hypothesis, as it has come to be called, is one of the more dramatic philosophical breakthroughs of recent years. Yet it is riddled with gaps, contradictions, and conceptual blind spots. Its bestknown exponents have almost nothing to say about creativity, cultural meaning, or social relations; sometimes they write as if they were actually unaware of them. Yet a book like this is precisely what's required to begin to turn all this around.

But consider the perspective such an approach opens up. Severi cites Vischer, Löwy, Warburg, and ultimately Boas to make a compelling case that what was then described as "primitive art" is not a crude attempt to represent the world as it reveals itself to human vision, but, rather, is a representation of mental space, of objects of memory and imagination as they reveal themselves to the human mind. Yet if he is right about the role so many of these objects played in arts of memory, and if the extended mind hypothesis is right, then we can go much further. When an archeologist unearths a series of ancient chimera-objects, she is not simply discovering a representation of the inside of an ancient mind, she is holding in her hand an object that actually was part of a human mind. Indeed, insofar as we think through our physical environment, we are surrounded by objects that are, in certain contexts, forms of consciousness, though merely background noise in others. But if so, the images discussed in this book are of a class of objects that plays a particularly important role in human thought because, by mobilizing imagination in such a way to link different brains, at least momentarily, contextually, into one unified process of thinking, they become pivots around which—through which—new forms of dialogic consciousness—new minds—come into being.

Armed with this understanding, would it not be possible to return to some of the foundational issues of classical social theory—e.g., Marx's fetishes, Durkheim's ritual effervescence—and see them in an

entirely different light? But this time, return to them armed with a conceptual apparatus that actually reflects the findings of contemporary science? It is exciting to imagine that we are finally living in times when such things have become possible again.

ANTHROPOLOGICAL THEORY: AN INTRODUCTORY HISTORY, SEVENTH EDITION by R. Jon McGee, Richard L. Warms [Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 9781538126202]

ANTHROPOLOGICAL THEORY: AN INTRODUCTORY HISTORY, SEVENTH EDITION, presents a selection of critical essays in anthropology from 1860 to the present day. Classic authors such as Marx, Durkheim, Boas, Radcliffe-Brown, Benedict, Rappaport, Geertz, and Turner are joined by contemporary thinkers including Das, Ortner, Kwiatkowski, and Mattingly.

What sets McGee and Warms's text apart from other collections are its introductions, footnotes, and index. Detailed introductions examine critical developments in theory, introduce key people, and discuss historical and personal influences on theorists. In extensive footnotes, the editors provide commentary that puts the writing in historical and cultural context, defines unusual terms, translates non-English phrases, identifies references to other scholars and their works, and offers paraphrases and summaries of complex passages. The notes identify and provide background information on hundreds of scholars and concepts important in the development of anthropology. This makes the essays more accessible to both students and current day scholars. An extensive index makes this book an invaluable reference tool.

New to This Edition

- Zora Neale Hurston: *From Of Mules and Men* (1935)
- Roy Rappaport: *Ritual Regulation of Environmental Relations among New Guinea People* (1967)
- James P. Spradley: *A Bucket Full of Tramps* (1970)
- Eric R. Wolf: *Facing Power—Old Insights, New Questions* (1990)
- Tom Boellstorff: *The Emergence of Political Homophobia in Indonesia: Masculinity and National Belonging* (2004)
- Lynn Kwiatkowski: *Feminist Anthropology: Approaching Domestic Violence in Northern Viet Nam* (2016)
- Veena Das: *Engaging with the Life of the Other: Love and Everyday Life* (2010)
- Cheryl Mattingly: *Luck, Friendship, and the Narrative Self* (2014)

Contents
Preface
Timeline
Introduction

Part I: HISTORICAL FOUNDATIONS OF ANTHROPOLOGICAL THEORY

Nineteenth-Century Evolutionism

Herbert Spencer: *The Social Organism* (1860)

Sir Edward Burnett Tylor: *The Science of Culture* (1871)

Lewis Henry Morgan: *Ethnical Periods* (1877)

Karl Marx (1818-1883) and Friedrich Engels: *Feuerbach: Opposition of the Materialist and Idealist Outlook* (1846)

The Foundations of Sociological Thought

Émile Durkheim: *What Is a Social Fact?* (1895)

Marcel Mauss: *Excerpts from The Gift* (1925)

Max Weber: *Class, Status, Party* (1922)

Part II: CULTURE THEORY IN THE EARLY TWENTIETH CENTURY

The Boasians

Franz Boas: *The Methods of Ethnology* (1920)

A. L. Kroeber: *On the Principle of Order in Civilization as Exemplified by Changes of Fashion* (1919)

Ruth Benedict: *The Science of Custom: The Bearing of Anthropology on Contemporary Thought* (1929)

Margaret Mead: *Introduction to Coming of Age in Samoa* (1928)

Zora Neale Hurston: *Of Mules and Men, Chapter IV* (1935)

Benjamin L. Whorf: *The Relation of Habitual Thought and Behavior to Language* (1941)
Functionalism 209

Bronislaw Malinowski: *The Essentials of the Kula* (1922)

A. R. Radcliffe-Brown: *On Joking Relationships* (1940)

Part III: THEORY AT MID-CENTURY

The Reemergence of Evolutionary Thought

Leslie White: *Energy and the Evolution of Culture* (1943)

Julian Steward: *The Patrilineal Band* (1955)

Neomaterialism

Marvin Harris: *The Cultural Ecology of India's Sacred Cattle* (1966)

Roy A. Rappaport: *Ritual Regulation of Environmental Relations among a New Guinea People* (1967)

Structure, Language, and Cognition

Claude Lévi-Strauss: *Four Winnebago Myths: A Structural Sketch* (1960)

James Spradley: *A Bucket Full of Tramps* (1970)

Part IV: LATE-TWENTIETH-CENTURY DEVELOPMENTS

Sociobiology and Behavioral Ecology

Edward O. Wilson: *The Morality of the Gene* (1975)

Rebecca Bliege Bird, Eric Alden Smith, and Douglas W. Bird: *The Hunting Handicap: Costly Signaling in Human Foraging Strategies* (2001)

Feminist Anthropology

Sally Slocum: *Woman the Gatherer: Male Bias in Anthropology* (1975)

Eleanor Leacock: Interpreting the Origins of Gender Inequality: Conceptual and Historical Problems (1983)

Symbolic and Interpretive Anthropology

Mary Douglas: External Boundaries (1966)

Victor Turner: Symbols in Ndembu Ritual (1967)

Clifford Geertz: Deep Play: Notes on the Balinese Cockfight (1972)

French Social Thought: Postmodernism and Practice

Pierre Bourdieu: Structures, Habitus, Practices (1980)

Michel Foucault: The Incitement to Discourse (1976)

Postmodernism

Renato Rosaldo: Grief and a Headhunter's Rage (1989)

Allan Hanson: The Making of the Maori: Culture Invention and Its Logic (1989)

Globalization

Eric R. Wolf: Facing Power-Old Insights, New Questions (1990)

Arjun Appadurai: Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural Economy (1990)

Theodore C. Bestor: Kaiten-zushi and Konbini: Japanese Food Culture in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction (2006)

Part V: TRENDS IN CONTEMPORARY ANTHROPOLOGY

Gender

Lila Abu-Lughod: A Tale of Two Pregnancies (1995)

Tom Boellstorff : The Emergence of Political Homophobia in Indonesia: Masculinity and National Belonging (2004)

Lynn Kwiatkowski : Feminist Anthropology: Approaching Domestic Violence in Northern Viêt Nam (2016)

Agency and Structure

Philippe Bourgois: From Jíbaro to Crack Dealer: Confronting the Restructuring of Capitalism in El Barrio (1995)

Sherry Ortner: Power and Projects: Reflections on Agency (2006)

Ruth Gomberg-Munoz: Willing to Work: Agency and Vulnerability in an Undocumented Immigrant Network (2010)

The Anthropology of the Good

Veena Das: Engaging the Life of the Other: Love and Everyday Life (2010)

Cheryl Mattingly: Luck, Friendship, and the Narrative Self (2014)

References

Credits

Index

Excerpt: Theory is the core of anthropology. Students often do not realize that the ethnographic materials they read in their textbooks and discuss in class are interpretations of data collected by anthropologists whose theoretical training determines the types of questions they ask and the sorts of information they collect. Without a solid understanding of theory, anthropology is reduced to a collection of exotic ethnographic vignettes. With a knowledge of theory, these vignettes become attempts to answer important philosophical and practical problems. Thus, it is crucial for anthropologists to understand theory and its historical context.

Students face two choices if they wish to understand the theoretical perspectives that ultimately drive ethnographic fieldwork: They can read original articles, or they can read someone's interpretations of those articles. For readers who are not well versed in anthropological theory, neither choice is ideal. We created this volume to provide an accessible means of introducing readers to the past century and a half of theory in anthropology.

We believe that it is essential for students to read original essays by influential scholars whose work has determined the paths in which anthropology has developed. Reading original works promotes depth of understanding and opens possibilities of analysis that even the best books describing theory can never provide. What better introduction to nineteenth-century evolutionary thinking than reading Herbert Spencer and E. B. Tylor? To develop an in-depth understanding of Marxist analysis in anthropology, what could be more effective than reading Karl Marx, Eleanor Leacock, or Philippe Bourgois? If you are interested in knowing about practice theory or thinking about globalization in anthropology, shouldn't you read the men and women who developed those fields such as Pierre Bourdieu, Michel Foucault, Arjun Appadurai, and Sherry Ortner?

Many students find reading original essays extremely demanding. Sometimes we do, too. The language is often difficult, and the intellectual disputes, references to other thinkers, and historical contexts may be obscure. We have attempted to make the task less onerous by providing detailed commentary, in close proximity to difficult passages in the original essays, to illuminate obscure references, arcane language, and unfamiliar contexts.

You are now reading the seventh edition of *Anthropological Theory*. We have struggled to refine the book's approach for more than twenty years (the first edition came out in 1996). As we have repeatedly revised this text, our goals for the book have grown. *Anthropological Theory* is primarily a textbook designed for students in advanced undergraduate and beginning graduate classes. However, we have increasingly tried to write a reference work that both students and professionals will want to keep within easy reach. We have done this by writing extensive footnotes on an enormous variety of individuals and topics and providing an extensive two-level index with well over one thousand entries. You will find basic information on everyone from Leo Frobenius to Daisy Bates, from Ibn Khaldun to Dina Dreyfus. Of course, no book can possibly include information on everyone and everything, but we believe that there is no other single book in anthropology that has as much basic information about as many different theories and people as this volume. In addition to the notes, we have also added a timeline to help readers place authors and significant works in the context of what was going on in the world at the time the piece was published.

Approach

We have assembled a diverse collection of essays by authors who are important thinkers in anthropology. We deliberately favor essays that are ethnographic examples of theoretical positions over those that are simply declarations of theory. We have selected essays that are well written, concise, and accessible. The collection begins in the mid-nineteenth century and ends in 2016. It is divided into sections encompassing well-known theoretical positions that are represented by authors generally

considered to be the outstanding spokespersons for their points of view, or essays that are especially vivid illustrations of a perspective. In each section, our selections fit together either because they illustrate different aspects of a theoretical perspective or they are good ethnographic examples of a theory.

Pedagogy

We have provided extensive support material to help students understand the forty-three essays that make up this volume. Each of the sixteen sections begins with an introduction to acquaint readers with some of the most important advocates of a school of thought, the problems they set out to solve, the methods they used, and the dilemmas they faced. Extensive editorial footnotes that provide additional information to help the reader understand and interpret the reading accompany each essay. In addition to providing definitions, translations of foreign phrases, and historical information, the notes help students trace the intellectual connections among thinkers both inside and outside of anthropology. The notes are meant to inform, raise interesting questions, and foster further creative and original thinking. They make essential but sometimes difficult information accessible to students and provide some interesting little-known background details. Anthropological theory, even that of a century ago, is alive and vital. We hope our commentary helps readers see it that way.

In this edition, the placement of our notes has been standardized. All of our notes appear at the end of paragraphs. When our notes define words that appear in the essays, those words are in bold. Original notes by the essay's author appear as endnotes.

No book of theory and commentary can ever be entirely without bias, but we have tried to come as close to this ideal as we can. In our introductions and commentary, we point to both the strengths and weaknesses of each theoretical position. Although astute readers can probably figure out which perspectives we like and which we dislike, we do not intend to promote one theory at the expense of another. In fact, we come from quite different theoretical perspectives, and our ideas have evolved through the years as we teach our theory classes and prepare new editions of this text. Every introductory section and note in this volume was written and rewritten by both of us, and we have been willing to accept substantial criticism and revision of ideas we hold dear. For us, editing this volume continues to be an exciting process of discovery and interpretation. Research, careful reading, discussion, and argumentation, as well as the comments of numerous reviewers and readers of earlier editions, have greatly deepened our understanding of the works of the great thinkers in anthropology. Writing this book has forced us to rethink what we believed we knew, and in the process, we have become better scholars of theory. Selecting these essays and writing the introductions and commentary for them has been profoundly rewarding for us. We hope that reading the original material and our comments will be as productive for students and colleagues.

New to This Edition

Our seventh edition is a substantial revision of the sixth, and we owe a great deal to our editor Nancy Roberts for her guidance and vision for the book. The edition contains eight new essays as well as a new section: "The Anthropology of the Good." We have incorporated new information and brought an

expanded selection of authors and opinions to the volume. Some of the notable changes in this edition include the following new sections and essays:

- In "The Boasians" we introduce a new essay by Zora Neale Hurston from her book *Of Mules and Men*. In the introduction to this section, there is information about Hurston's career as well as information about other African American anthropologists in the first half of the twentieth century.
- Our section on "Neomaterialism" brings back a critical essay by Roy Rappaport that had appeared in earlier editions. "Ritual Regulation of Environmental Relations among a New Guinea People" is presented with rewritten notes.
- In the "Structure, Language, Cognition" section, we introduce "A Bucket of Tramps," Chapter 4 from James P. Spradley's classic ethnography of skid row, *You Owe Yourself a Drunk*.
- The "Globalization" section of the book has been relocated from part 5, "Contemporary Trends," to part 4, "Late Twentieth Century Developments," and we have added Eric R. Wolf's Distinguished Lecture to the American Anthropological Association, "Facing Power—Old Insights, New Questions."
- Our "Gender" section includes two new essays: Tom Boellstorff's "The Emergence of Political Homophobia in Indonesia: Masculinity and National Belonging" and Lynn Kwiatkowski's "Feminist Anthropology: Approaching Domestic Violence in Northern Viet Nam." In addition, especially for this edition, Professor Boellstorff has written a brief postscript to his essay, taking account of recent developments in Indonesia.
- Finally, with this edition, we introduce a new section, "The Anthropology of the Good." Our section includes the essays "Engaging in the Life of the Other" from Veena Das and "Luck, Friendship, and the Narrative Self" from Cheryl Mattingly's book *Moral Laboratories: Family Peril and the Struggle for a Good Life*.

We have written a new introduction for "The Anthropology of the Good" and updated the others. Each introduction includes an annotated list of suggested readings chosen from important works in each subject area.

Of course, it is impossible to reprint essays from all of the great thinkers who have made significant contributions to anthropology, but we discuss many of these in the introductions and in our notes. Thus, you will find information about the contributions of people such as Jeremy Bentham, A. C. Haddon, James Frazer, Antonio Gramsci, Monica Wilson, Andrew Vayda, Michelle Rosaldo, Edith Turner, and hundreds of others whose work has played a major role in anthropological theory. We have tried to include information on women who have been influential in anthropology but are often left out of general textbooks. For example, among the scores of scholars included you will find information on Elsie Clews Parsons, Dina Dreyfus, Gene Weltfish, Hilda Kuper, Hortense Powdermaker, Rhoda Métraux, Winifred Hoernle, Monica Wilson, Hildred Geertz, Emily Martin, Sarah Franklin, and many others. New to this edition is information about Zora Neale Hurston's life as well as material on other African American anthropologists in the first half of the twentieth century.

Anthropology is concerned with understanding people. Typically, anthropologists study the behavior, beliefs, and lifestyles of people in other cultures. Some examine current cultures; others study the remains of past societies to re-create the lives of people who disappeared long ago; still others study primates to see what our closest relatives can tell us about being human. What unites this diverse work is a common ground in some fundamental theoretical ideas concerning biological evolution and social behavior.

We teach both undergraduate and graduate courses in anthropological theory at Texas State University. Each fall as the semester begins, we face the same issues: Some students want to know why, if they are studying X (fill in the blank), the theory course is required, and others worry about reading original works by authors and delving into a subject that seems esoteric. Because both matters are important, we begin this book by telling you why we think theory is essential in anthropology and why it is valuable to read original works rather than predigested theoretical summaries.

Why Study Theory?

Theory is critical because, although anthropologists collect data through fieldwork, data in and of themselves are meaningless. Whether stated explicitly or assumed, theories are the tools anthropologists use to decide what are and what are not data. They are used to give meaning to data. Anthropologists' understanding of the events they record or the artifacts they excavate in the field is derived from their theoretical perspective. It is only through the application of a theoretical perspective that one can interpret designs carved into a rock ten thousand years ago, a cache of silver coins buried with a victim of the plague in fourteenth-century London, or a wink as distinguished from a twitch. Theories are the tools anthropologists use to sort the significant from the meaningless.

One's choice of theory largely determines the data to be collected in the first place. A structuralist interested in the unconscious meaning of mythology probably will not spend too much time studying subsistence patterns. An economic anthropologist might ignore ritual and religion. Without theory, one cannot do anthropology of any sort.

Although this is a book about theory in sociocultural anthropology, the different branches of anthropology have always freely borrowed ideas from each other and from other sciences. In the nineteenth century, Herbert Spencer, a sociologist, and Charles Darwin, a naturalist, greatly influenced each other's work. Sigmund Freud was well versed in nineteenth-century evolutionary theories, and his work is imbued with ideas taken from anthropology; anthropology, in turn, has been greatly influenced by his theories. Sociobiologists study human behavior in terms of evolutionary biology and cultural adaptations. Interpretive anthropologists and postmodernists rely on tools developed in the study of literature. In the course of their research, anthropologists today delve into biology, geology, psychology, history, literature, physics, chemistry, medicine, and other subjects.

Modern anthropology is built on the work of earlier generations of researchers. Indeed, anthropologists today ask many of the same questions that occupied scholars in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

Nineteenth-century theories continue to resonate in popular culture. Have you ever heard the phrase "survival of the fittest," for example? It was first used by Herbert Spencer in his 1864 book *Principles of Biology*. Do you think that technology is a measure of a society's development? Then you will be comfortable reading Lewis Henry Morgan's *Ancient Society*, first published in 1877. To fully comprehend anthropological writing, you must appreciate the history of the ideas that inform it. These are, ultimately, the principles upon which current work is based.

Anthropological theory is also important because it helps us think about who and what we are as human beings. It does this by asking us to consider the ways in which we view and understand each other. At its most basic level, anthropology asks how we are to understand other people in the world, those who look different from us and have different languages and customs (what anthropologists have come to call different cultures). Are such people inferior to us, superior to us, or just different? Are their cultures unchanging, following their own paths of evolution, or bound to ours in a grand evolutionary scheme? How should we behave toward such people?

Studying other cultures has led anthropologists to think deeply and critically about their own cultures. The process of understanding others led to questions concerning how we are to understand ourselves. For well over a century, anthropologists have offered insights and critiques into their own cultures. In the past half-century, they have particularly focused on thinking about the histories, meanings, and pathways of power of these cultures.

At a second level, anthropology forces us to consider if we, as human beings, are fundamentally part of the natural world. If so, perhaps we can be studied by the scientific methods and principles used by biologists, physicists, and other scholars in the traditional physical sciences. Alternatively, are human beings sufficiently different from the rest of the world that studying them with these methods will produce only trivial and confusing results? If that is true, the skills needed might be creative insight, imaginative interpretation, and empathy—analytic tools traditionally associated with the arts and humanities.

A final level of discourse deals with the otherness of culture itself. By directing us to the comparison of cultures, anthropology ultimately points toward the study of human nature. If we could strip away the cultural clothing of all peoples, would we be left with some set of basic principles or underlying essence? Would this be equivalent to finding human nature before us in the buff? If so, how are we to understand human culture? Is it that which permits the full and satisfying expression of human nature, or that which prevents human nature from destroying human society? At some level, all theory in anthropology, whether written in the eighteenth, nineteenth, twentieth, or twenty-first centuries, addresses these essential questions about culture. Sometimes individual theorists take extreme postures and for a time quiet the voices of those who hold alternative positions. However, no definitive conclusion has ever been reached on any of these issues. Perhaps these questions are ultimately unanswerable by their very nature. But the fact that no authoritative conclusion has been reached does not lessen the importance of the debate, for how we answer these questions has practical applications in our world. The answers determine our understanding of ourselves and our behavior toward others. In a world of instantaneous

communication and virtually unlimited capacity for violence, ethnic strife, war, and terrorism, surely these are among the most important questions that face us.

Why Read Original Works?

We believe it is important to read original works for several reasons. First, commentary on a theory cannot replace the original work because commentators unavoidably (and frequently intentionally) place their own interpretations on the material. For instance, Robert Lowie's 1937 *History of Ethnological Theory* and Marvin Harris's 1968 *The Rise of Anthropological Theory* are both comprehensive summaries of anthropological theory, but they provide strikingly different perspectives on the field. Each is an ideological document supporting a particular interpretation of the history and proper goals of anthropology.

Second, part of the importance of classic works in theory is their subtlety and complexity. The creation of theory is part of an ongoing dialogue with earlier thinkers, and their writings are a portion of that dialogue. As our understanding changes, we return to these older works. Sometimes we find insights that advance our thinking or perceive errors against which we react. Through this process, new theory is generated. When works are summarized or when we read only analyses, the theoretical dialogue is flattened, simplified, and ultimately impoverished.

In this volume, we provide what we believe is useful commentary on the essays we present, but reading such analysis cannot replace careful reading of the original texts. As new insights are made, many of our notes may become outdated. The essays themselves have a much longer shelf life.

Finally, a firsthand reading of the original sources helps one avoid inaccuracies. In preparing this text, we have run across numerous cases in which the popularly accepted information passed to us by our professors or found in textbooks was incorrect. Some of the folk wisdom of anthropology consists of half-truths or is frankly inaccurate. We bring this up not to point fingers or assign blame but to suggest that reading original sources can serve as a partial corrective for this problem.

Using This Textbook

This book is designed to help you understand critical concepts in cultural anthropology through the work of ethnographers and social scientists over the last 150 years, and to help you formulate your theoretical position in the field today. It is a historical overview of some of the principal developments in culture theory since the 1850s. The book is different from others because it contains our introductions and paragraph-by-paragraph comments to inform your reading and raise interesting points or questions.

Theory texts are problematic because their contents tend to become accepted doctrine. Readers and critics suppose that the authors of such a text have chosen to present those pieces universally considered the most important works in the field. Should you entertain this notion, let us disabuse you of it. No group of professional anthropologists, however small, will agree on a single set of critical works. We have selected what we feel are representative articles by individuals associated with particular theories and works that seem to us to be good examples of theories in practice. An

enormous corpus of work in anthropology now exists. We believe that the best way to study anthropological theory is to read as widely as possible. No collection of diverse writings, however artfully chosen, will be able to substitute for years of reading in the field, and that is what is ultimately required for a solid background in theory.

You will find that our commentary on the texts varies from extremely straightforward definitions and explanations to fairly elaborate speculation on the motives of authors and influences upon them. Although it is almost impossible to entirely eliminate mistakes, we have checked our work carefully; when we point to a fact, you may be reasonably certain that it is correct. However, please remember that our interpretations are just that. They are meant to guide your reading, stimulate discussion, call your attention to certain ideas, and get you to think about different issues. You are invited to disagree with them and propose alternatives. If you read through this book and find nothing with which to disagree, you are not reading carefully enough or critically enough.

Although our likes and dislikes may become apparent to the careful reader, we do not intend to promote any particular viewpoint. In fact, we were trained in very different theoretical perspectives (McGee in interpretive-symbolic and Warms in positivist-materialist). We have tried to present the key strengths and weaknesses of each position, but we frequently differ in our interpretations of theory and amuse our students by arguing about them. In short, while we hope that readers will agree with most of what we have written, we have tried to write at least something bound to rile your theoretical sensibilities, no matter who you are. <>

THE SCANDAL OF CONTINUITY IN MIDDLE EAST ANTHROPOLOGY: FORM, DURATION, DIFFERENCE edited by Judith Scheele and Andrew Shryock [Public Cultures of the Middle East and North Africa, Indiana University Press, 9780253043764]

Despite a rich history of ethnographic research in Middle Eastern societies, the region is frequently portrayed as marginal to anthropology. The contributors to this volume reject this view and show how the Middle East is in fact vital to the discipline and how Middle Eastern anthropologists have developed theoretical and methodological tools that address and challenge the region's political, ethical, and intellectual concerns. The contributors to this volume are students of Paul Dresch, an anthropologist known for his incisive work on Yemeni tribalism and customary law. As they expand upon his ideas and insights, these essays ask questions that have long preoccupied anthropologists, such as how do place, point of view, and style combine to create viable bodies of knowledge; how is scholarship shaped by the historical context in which it is located; and why have duration and form become so problematic in the study of Middle Eastern societies? Special attention is given to understanding local terms, contested knowledge claims, what remains unseen and unsaid in social life, and to cultural patterns and practices

that persist over long stretches of time, seeming to predate and outlast events. Ranging from Morocco to India, these essays offer critical but sensitive approaches to cultural difference and the distinctiveness of the anthropological project in the Middle East.

Review

Highlights the severely underappreciated theoretical productivity of work in Middle East anthropology. This is an exciting and intellectually fluent work that avoids most of the clichés of contemporary anthropological thought. —(Gregory Starrett, editor (with Eleanor Abdella Doumato) of *Teaching Islam: Textbooks and Religion in the Middle East*)

'Continuity' includes the ideas and practice of kinship, tribe, lineage, and moral authority that continue to underlie on shared values that are not just global or local, but that encompass much in between. It is good to think with. —(Dale F. Eickelman, author of *Muslim Politics*)

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments

Introduction: On the Left Hand of Knowledge by Judith Scheele and Andrew Shryock

1 Dialogues of Three: Making Sense of Patterns by That Outlast Events / Andrew Shryock

2 Totality and Infinity: Sharia Ethnography in Lebanon / Morgan Clarke

3 A Mirror for Fieldworkers by Christa Salamandra

4 Who Are the Taliban? The Deflection of Truth among Tribal Pashtuns in Pakistan by Ammara Maqsood 98

5 Secrecy and Continuity in Rajasthan by Anastasia Piliaysky

6 The Place of Strangers in Moroccan Domesticity: Nostalgia, Secrets, and the Continuity of Scandal by Mary Montgomery

7 Claiming an Individual Name: Revisiting the Personhood Debate with Afghan Poets in Iran by Zuzanna Olszewska

8 Segmentation versus Tyranny: Politics as Empirical Philosophy by Judith Scheele

9 The Republic of Precarity: 'Abd al-Fattah al-Sisi, Trickster Politician by Walter Armbrust

Afterword: Experience and Its Modes by Paul Dresch

References Cited

Index

Into the Field

This volume gathers contributions made by Dresch's students, who, each in their own way, continue the tradition outlined above. What lends coherence to the essays is not so much their attention to field sites that are geographically peripheral to the dominant Middle Eastern culture zones—quite as many contributions deal with cities as with tribal areas, and settings range from Morocco via Chad to Egypt, then to Iran, and finally to northern India. Rather, the binding thread is a certain stance in relation to the "field"—a fateful relationship between our work, a region, and a point of view or style. Historical materials and sensibilities are prominent in several of the essays, as is an awareness of a hegemonic cultural tradition or political center. The metropolitan and cosmopolitan are never far from view. We are repeatedly drawn, nonetheless, to the defining margins of the contexts we study, to "remote areas,"

whether these are filled with elite or subaltern social types, and whether they are located in oasis villages along trans-Saharan trade routes or in Damascus neighborhoods, where film crews produce the latest Arabic-language TV serials.

We all recognize that field-workers are and must be vulnerable and that our work should be grounded in local concerns, which often grate against disciplinary trends. The whole point is to find out what local terms are compelling. This can be done across multiple topical fields, using a mix of theoretical and methodological toolkits, but the approach will fail if we impose our own intellectual, political, or ethical concerns on "the society studied," to invoke again Pocock's triad. As a result of these commitments, the topics considered here often have a scandalous continuity. They are scandalous because they are old—many go back to analytical terms and problems forged by the *Annie sociologique*, whose leading figures were fascinated by moral systems, classification, identification and mutual recognition, modes of solidarity, personhood, and other facets of community formation that, in their view, imbued social life with a deeply structural character. These are human fixations, not merely academic ones. Their Middle Eastern variants pull us toward issues that predate the region as an object of area studies and transcend it even today—problems of authority (divine and human), family and kinship, authenticity and power, the role of texts and literate expression in social life, the city as a protected and privileged space, hierarchy and equality, relations between men and women. This subject matter is scandalous, too, because it takes up ethnographic business that is nowadays pushed aside—typically, because it calls the normative modernity of our subjects into question—only to reappear in oddly refracted forms. Amid national and Islamist politics, neoliberal market forces, mass-mediated technological change, and popular uprisings, our essays return inevitably to issues of revelation and concealment, oppositional identities, truth claims, honor, modesty, and the integrity of domestic spaces.

The volume opens with reflections on fieldwork in various Middle Eastern settings: the ways in which it can and cannot be done, the patterns of public and private thereby implied, and how the place allotted to strangers is crucial to the knowledge ethnographers produce. As Andrew Shryock demonstrates in his paper on escort and tribal history-making in Jordan, customary ways of moving through physical space are important preconditions for research. They act as "hidden replicators" of diverse social forms, reproducing tribal geographies and giving shape to historical knowledge itself. Relations of escort and protection determine how an outsider can know Bedouin worlds in Jordan, where control over space and access to "truth"—of the sort conveyed by authentic genealogical links to the speech, blood, and deeds of ancestors—combine to give local sociality and notions of moral personhood their distinctive quality.

Morgan Clarke's essay shows how similar principles apply in the elite quarters of religious scholarship—specifically, among Lebanon's actual and aspiring mujtahids, who claim the ability to apply and interpret Islamic law correctly. In this domain of bookish expertise, uncertainty and skepticism flourish. Who exactly is a mujtahid? Are their credentials real? Can their decisions be trusted? These questions are hard to answer definitively, and Clarke suggests that the remaining nodes of doubt are not leftovers in a secure hierarchy of religious authority. Instead, they serve as essential pivots that allow a genealogical system to persist, despite occasional failures in the legitimate transfer of learning from one mujtahid to

the next, by locating ultimate knowledge (and best practices) in other places, in the past or future, or with God. Fieldwork in these settings consists of a technical apprenticeship in how to move through space and time, an apprenticeship that does not yield "objective knowledge"—despite prevailing obsessions with "truth"—but fosters an ability to interpret the connections between highly contested knowledge claims.

Christa Salamandra's essay, which unfolds across two decades of ethnography in Damascus, sums up the challenges of following such an approach in conspicuously elite and urban spaces, where metropolitan social theory and cosmopolitan culture makers—urban planners, heritage experts, and TV serial producers—continually draw the ethnographer's attention to aspects of personhood, gender, sectarianism, and kinship that are contested as signs of modernity and "traditional culture." Salamandra argues that there is, in fact, no way to represent these topics that will avoid provoking criticism, in large part because Damascenes are themselves a "community of disagreement." In an authoritarian polity that insists on uniform support for its leadership and national culture, Salamandra's insights are intensely problematic, but the reality of incessant social critique—and the right to make social criticism a protected aspect of public media culture—remains crucial to the construction of Syrian modernities, especially now, as the country is torn apart by war.

Because of the salience of patterns of knowability and secrecy in the Middle East, the reaction to any "gaze," that of the empire or that of the neighbors next door, might easily be the assertion that there is "nothing to see here"; the observer is actively encouraged to look in other directions. Fieldwork thus becomes a "trade in secrets" (Dresch 2000a, 109), and the simple observation that the truth lies elsewhere can be expanded—in segmentary fashion, one is tempted to say—from domestic matters to those of international relations, as Ammara Maqsood demonstrates in her paper on who is, or might be, Taliban in Pakistan. The apparent lack of reliable "data," and indeed the impossibility of neatly defining the categories to which such data would refer—Talib, Pashtun tribesman, soldier, insurgent, foreign spy, collaborator—is itself a "social fact" that shapes perceptions of insecurity and divided loyalties in contemporary Pakistan, sentiments that permeate folk theories about the country's internal and external relations. Maqsood's interlocutors, Pashtun migrants in Lahore, have complicated relationships to geopolitical spaces that government forces cannot easily enter and do not fully control. They use the "remoteness" of Pakistan's tribal areas—their "imperfect attachment" to the center and overdetermination by outsiders (Ardener 1989, 221-22)—to "deflect the truth" of their own involvement with the Taliban. Yet some of Maqsood's informants admit that they once belonged to the movement, or suggest that other families or factions do so now, thereby inviting her into a zone of protected knowledge that is bounded, ethically, by the same patterns of "deflected truth" that define all talk of the "war on terror" in Pakistan.

Anastasia Piliaysky's essay deals with comparable patterns of knowability among Kanjars, a caste of professional thieves in Rajasthan. Their stealth, magical acumen, and astonishing longevity are "secret attributes" known, ironically, to everyone, while mundane knowledge of how Kanjars operate and who they work for is sensitive and must be hidden from public view. Experts in "disappearing acts," break-ins, and other penetrations of intimate, domestic spaces, the Kanjars facilitate interaction between social

categories—criminals and the state, sisters-in-law and brothers-in-law, patrons and the poor—that are normally defined by mutual distinction and avoidance. Piliaysky shows that the Kanjars, as a named group, are centuries old, and so is the dirty work they do: impeccable reputations need invisible thugs to prop them up, just as the right hand needs the left.

Threats to the integrity of private space are likewise the focus of Mary Montgomery's essay on domestic servants in urban Morocco, where interstitial patterns of moral guardianship, similar to the protocols of escort described by Shryock in Jordan, make it possible to bring total strangers into the most secret (and often most banal) of settings: the household. In Montgomery's case, however, they are admitted as servants, cooks, and nannies rather than anthropologists. Playing off a mythical narrative of a golden age in which all domestic labor was performed by kin, who were trustworthy, grateful, and just like "daughters of the house," Montgomery shows how even the most profound socioeconomic changes—in Rabat, the emergence of an anonymous labor market—are dealt with, or at least tentatively moralized, through long-standing patterns of incorporation. Unknown domestic workers are redefined either as "kin" (with all the disappointment that necessarily ensues from purposeful misrecognition) or as "known," through mostly fragile, even dubious links. "Strong moral models" are clearly in evidence, as is a sense of responsibility for domestics, but state regulation of these new labor relations would do away with the moral ambiguities that pervade kinship and host-guest ties and is thus rejected by all.

Zuzanna Olszewska's essay addresses similar tensions between the intimate and the public as expressed in changing models of personhood among Afghan poets in Iran. Ethnographers have characterized personhood in the Middle East in contradictory ways, putting weight on either individualistic or relational values. For Olszewska, this is a false debate, as both individualism and relationality have long coexisted in the region, for men and women alike, and both inform personal life histories and struggles for recognition today. Distinguishing between two aspects of individual personhood that tend to be conflated in Western academic rhetoric—moral autonomy and the recognition of one's unique attributes, talents, or virtues—Olszewska argues that the Afghan case shows how one can be achieved without the other and that individual self-assertion does not necessarily imply a break with collectivist moral proprieties, even when these are of a hierarchical nature.

Judith Scheele's paper, based on material drawn from North Africa and the Sahara, argues that by limiting its subject matter to state formations and state politics, contemporary political anthropology evades questions that are in fact central to it. Although one could easily demonstrate that today large parts of the world's population, willingly or not, live unencompassed by states, Scheele makes a more fundamental claim: namely, that "politics," beyond definitions of power and its distribution, is about the possibility of imagining different forms of sociality. These alternatives might be located at the margins of state systems or fully within them, but they touch on notions of moral autonomy and personhood that cannot be subsumed in state rhetoric or generated in response to statist claims; in many cases, moreover, they demonstrate astonishing historical and regional depth. Approaching political anthropology from a radically different angle, Wallter Armbrust concentrates on recent events in Egypt, where local and international models of "revolution" have produced a new political climate, unsettled between radical change and a "new normal," in which "tricksters" thrive. Drawing on the work of Victor

Turner and Arnold van Gennep, Armbrust explores the liminal spaces that open up within moments of political transition. In contemporary Cairo, authoritarian and neoliberal trends converge to produce leaders—like the newfangled dictator, Sisi, and the regime-supporting media pundit, Taufiq `Ukasha—whose similar talents for hoodwinking, intimidation, and breaking and making rules are chillingly obvious, although one of these men commands a modern army while the other hosts a popular television program. Armbrust and Scheele work in very different settings, yet the oddness of contemporary state arrangements, and the structural violence on which they are based, are paralleled in both essays by a persistent desire to undermine the state, co-opt or blunt its powers, and drain its resources—whether from its heart or from its edges.

Conclusion

All of these papers are careful to engage closely with local terms and relations, but they also listen for the unsaid. They pay attention to patterns that are discernible over long stretches of time and that seem, quite literally, to predate and outlast events; they assess contested knowledge claims; and they move incessantly between the right and left hand of knowledge, between the proper and the less so. This is vividly apparent when, among adept practitioners of Islamic law in Beirut, claims to high-minded expertise are mixed with (and sometimes produce) suspicions of immoral conduct and juridical fraud, or when elite families in Rajasthan deploy Kanjars as mercenaries and mediators in their political disputes. It is evident among Afghan poets, male and female, who explore modernist notions of expressive freedom in their verse and marital choices but craft careers that uphold the moral integrity of domestic spaces that, because they protect the modesty of women, resist certain forms of mass mediated celebrity. It is true of the "war on terror" in Pakistan, where local conspiracy theories, village gossip, and the practicalities of the regional fruit trade are part of geopolitical contests that involve hypermodern weapons, espionage, and propaganda campaigns mounted by global superpowers. In all of these cases, the "left hand" is intrinsic to social life and its proprieties, a fact that is troublesome only when it is discussed too loudly and openly, as if transparency (not deft opacity) were a virtue.

How then should we appropriately engage with the left hand as such? We know that it is not invariably residual, or weak, or a zone of stigma. It is everywhere. It is remote yet coextensive with the center. It is marginal yet part of the mainstream. It can be backward and trendy, incorrect and preferred. For easy proof, consider the Arab Gulf States, where millions of people are wealthy and highly educated, live in gleaming new cities, and have conspicuously crafted tribal identities, which they express in nationally televised poetry contests, in electoral contests and legal practice, in heritage tourism, in genealogical research, and in the display of "traditional" material culture in domestic and public spaces (Drench 2005; Cooke 2014; Samin 2016). How one sees societies of this kind is itself diagnostic: are they a study in continuity or transformation; are their traditions invented or authentic; is the persistence of tribal formations in these countries evidence of cultural resilience or a new form of institutional racism? However one might answer these questions or rephrase them, it should be apparent that we are not necessarily talking about country folk, the oppressed, or the primitive when we talk about left-sided cultural spaces. The spaces we have described in this volume belong to another kind of interactive milieu, one that is pervasive but is not designed to admit everyone. Often, this milieu is valued precisely

because it is alternative to the modern, the Western, the progressive, the properly democratic, the correctly gendered, or the respectably Muslim. Insofar as anthropologists aspire to unsettle hegemonic assumptions about how people should live, the left side of experience will be a space in which our projects can thrive, fed by the moral uncertainties we encounter in fieldwork, and expressed in the new languages we create as we try—with the help of our subjects, our colleagues, and our own intellectual traditions—to grasp durable forms of human life.

JUDITH SCHEELE is Directrice d'études at the Écoles des hautes études en sciences sociales (EHESS) in Paris. She has carried out research in Algeria, northern Mali, and Chad. She is author of *Village Matters: Politics, Knowledge and Community in Kabylia* and *Smugglers and Saints of the Sahara: Regional Connectivity in the Twentieth Century*, and co-author of *The Value of Disorder: Autonomy, Prosperity and Plunder in the Chadian Sahara*.

ANDREW SHRYOCK is Arthur F. Thurnau Professor of Anthropology at the University of Michigan. He studies political culture in the Middle East, Arab and Muslim immigrants in North America, and new approaches to history writing. His recent books include *Deep History: The Architecture of Past and Present*, *Islamophobia/Islamophilia: Beyond the Politics of Enemy and Friend*, and *From Hospitality to Grace: A Julian Pitt-Rivers Omnibus*. <>

SIGN LANGUAGE AN INTERNATIONAL HANDBOOK

edited by Roland Pfau, Markus Steinbach, Bencie Woll
[Handbook of Linguistics and Communication Science:
Handbucher zur Sprach- und Kommunikationswissenschaft De
Gruyter Mouton, 9783110204216]

Die Reihe **HANDBÜCHER ZUR SPRACH- UND KOMMUNIKATIONSWISSENSCHAFT** erschließt einen Wissensbereich, der sowohl die allgemeine Linguistik und die speziellen, philologisch orientierten Sprachwissenschaften als auch diejenigen Wissenschaftsgebiete umfasst, die sich in den letzten Jahrzehnten aus der immer umfangreicher werdenden Forschung über die vielfältigen Erscheinungen des kommunikativen Handelns entwickelt haben.

In der klassischen Disziplin der Sprachwissenschaft erscheint eine Zusammenfassung des Wissensstandes notwendig, um der im Wechsel der Theorien rasch voranschreitenden Forschung eine Bezugsbasis zu geben; in den neuen Wissenschaften können die Handbücher dem Forscher Übersicht geben und Orientierung verschaffen.

Um diese Ziele zu erreichen, wird in der Handbuchreihe, was

- die Vollständigkeit in der Darstellung,
- die Explizitheit in der Begründung,

- - die Verlässlichkeit in der Dokumentation von Daten und Ergebnissen und
- - die Aktualität im Methodischen

angeht, eine Stufe der Verwirklichung angestrebt, die mit den besten Handbuchkonzeptionen anderer Wissenschaftszweige vergleichbar ist. Alle Herausgeber, die der Reihe und diejenigen der einzelnen Bände, wie auch alle Autoren, die in den Handbüchern ein Thema bearbeiten, tragen dazu bei, dieses Ziel zu verwirklichen. Veröffentlichungssprachen sind Deutsch, Englisch und Französisch.

Wenngleich als Hauptzweck der Handbuchreihe die angemessene Darstellung des derzeitigen Wissensstandes in den durch die jeweiligen Handbuchbände abgedeckten Ausschnitten der Sprach- und Kommunikationswissenschaft zu gelten hat, so wird doch bei der Abgrenzung der wissenschaftlichen Bereiche, die jeweils in einem Handbuchband erschlossen werden sollen, keine starre Systematik vorausgesetzt. Die Reihe ist offen; die geschichtliche Entwicklung kann berücksichtigt werden. Diese Konzeption sowie die Notwendigkeit, dass zur gründlichen Vorbereitung jedes Bandes genügend Zeit zur Verfügung steht, führen dazu, dass die ganze Reihe in loser Erscheinungsfolge ihrer Bände vervollständigt werden kann. Jeder Band ist ein in sich abgeschlossenes Werk.

Die Reihenfolge der Handbuchbände stellt keine Gewichtung der Bereiche dar, sondern hat sich durch die Art der Organisation ergeben: der Herausgeber der Reihe bemüht sich, eine Kollegin oder einen Kollegen für die Herausgabe eines Handbuchbandes zu gewinnen. Hat diese/r zugesagt, so ist sie/er in der Wahl der Mitherausgeber und bei der Einladung der Autoren vollkommen frei. Die Herausgeber eines Bandes planen einen Band inhaltlich unabhängig und werden dabei lediglich an bestimmte Prinzipien für den Aufbau und die Abfassung gebunden; nur wo es um die Abgrenzung zu anderen Bänden geht, ist der Reihenherausgeber inhaltlich beteiligt. Dabei wird davon ausgegangen, dass mit dieser Organisationsform der Hauptzweck dieser Handbuchreihe, nämlich die angemessene Darstellung des derzeitigen Problem- und Wissensstandes in den durch die jeweiligen Handbuchbände abgedeckten Teilbereichen, am besten verwirklicht werden kann.

Translation:

The series HANDBOOKS ON LANGUAGE AND COMMUNICATION SCIENCE opens up a field of knowledge that encompasses both general linguistics and the special, philologically-oriented linguistics as well as those areas of science that have developed over the past decades from the ever-increasing research on the diverse phenomena of communicative action to have.

In the classical discipline of linguistics, a summary of the level of knowledge appears necessary in order to provide a basis for reference in the rapidly changing research of theories; In the new sciences, the manuals can give the researcher an overview and provide orientation.

To achieve these goals, the handbook series explains what

- the completeness of the presentation,
- the explicitness in the justification,
- the reliability in the documentation of data and results and

- topicality in methodology

approached a level of realization that is comparable to the best handbook conceptions of other branches of science. All editors, those of the series and those of the individual volumes, as well as all authors who work on a topic in the handbooks, help to achieve this goal. Publication languages are German, English and French.

Although the main purpose of the handbook series is to adequately present the current state of knowledge in the sections of language and communication science covered by the respective handbook volumes, the delimitation of the scientific areas, which are each to be indexed in a handbook volume, does not become a rigid system provided. The row is open; historical development can be taken into account. This concept and the need for sufficient time to thoroughly prepare each volume mean that the entire series can be completed in a loose sequence of their volumes. Each volume is a self-contained work.

The order of the handbook volumes does not represent a weighting of the areas, but has resulted from the type of organization: the publisher of the series tries to get a colleague to publish a handbook volume. If the latter has agreed, they are completely free to choose the co-editors and to invite the authors. The editors of a volume plan a volume independently and are only bound to certain principles for the structure and the drafting; the series editor is only involved in terms of content where it is different from other volumes. It is assumed that this organizational form is the best way to achieve the main purpose of this series of manuals, namely to adequately present the current level of problems and knowledge in the sub-areas covered by the respective manual volumes.

Contents

Preface

Notational conventions

Sign language acronyms

1. Introduction • Roland Pfau, Markus Steinbach & Bencie Woll
- I. Phonetics, phonology, and prosody
 2. Phonetics • Onno Crasborn
 3. Phonology Diane Brentari
 4. Visual prosody • Wendy Sandler
- II. Morphology
 5. Word classes and word formation • Irit Meir
 6. Plurality • Markus Steinbach
 7. Verb agreement • Gaurav Mathur & Christian Rathmann
 8. Classifiers • Inge Zwitterlood
 9. Tense, aspect, and modality • Roland Pfau, Markus Steinbach & Bencie Woll
 10. Agreement auxiliaries • Galini Sapountzaki
 11. Pronouns • Kearsy Cormier
- III. Syntax

- 12. Word order • Lorraine Leeson & John Saeed
- 13. The noun phrase • Carol Neidle & Joan Nash
- 14. Sentence types • Carlo Cecchetto
- 15. Negation • Josep Quer
- 16. Coordination and subordination • Gladys Tang & Prudence Lau ..
- 17. Utterance reports and constructed action • Diane Lillo-Martin ...
- IV. Semantics and pragmatics
- 18. Iconicity and metaphors • Sarah E Taub
- 19. Use of sign space • Pamela Perniss
- 20. Lexical semantics: Semantic fields and lexical aspect • Donovan Grose
- 21. Information structure • Ronnie B. Wilbur
- 22. Communicative interaction • Anne Baker & Beppie van den Bogaerde

- V. Communication in the visual modality
- 23. Manual communication systems: evolution and variation • Roland Pfau
- 24. Shared sign languages - Victoria Nyst
- 25. Language and modality • Richard P. Meier
- 26. Homesign: gesture to language • Susan Goldin-Meadow
- 27. Gesture • Ash Özyürek
- VI. Psycholinguistics and neurolinguistics
- 28. Acquisition • Deborah Chen Pichler
- 29. Processing • Matthew W G. Dye
- 30. Production • Annette Hohenberger & Helen Leuninger
- 31. Neurolinguistics • David Corina & Nicole Spotswood
- 32. Atypical signing • Bencie Woll
- VII. Variation and change
- 33. Sociolinguistic aspects of variation and change - Adam Schembri & Trevor Johnston
- 34. Lexicalization and grammaticalization • Terry Janzen
- 35. Language contact and borrowing • Robert Adam
- 36. Language emergence and creolisation • Dany Adone
- 37. Language planning • Trude Schermer
- VIII. Applied issues
- 38. History of sign languages and sign language linguistics • Susan McBurney
- 39. Deaf education and bilingualism • Carolina Plaza Pust
- 40. Interpreting • Christopher Stone
- 41. Poetry • Rachel Sutton-Spence
- IX. Handling sign language data
- 42. Data collection • Mieke Van Herreweghe & Myriam Vermeerbergen
- 43. Transcription • Nancy Frishberg, Nini Hoiting & Dan I. Slobin
- 44. Computer modelling • Eva Sáfár & John Glauert

- Indexes
- Index of subjects

Index of sign languages
Index of spoken languages

The impact of sign language research on linguistics

Before the beginning of sign language linguistics, sign languages were regarded as exemplifying a primitive universal way of communicating through gestures. Early sign linguistic research from the 1960s onward emphasized the equivalences between sign languages and spoken languages and the recognition of sign languages as full, complex, independent human languages. Contemporary sign linguistics now explores the similarities and differences between different sign languages, and between sign languages and spoken languages. This move has offered a new window on human language but has also posed challenges to linguistics. While it is uncommon to find an introductory text on linguistics which does not include some mention of sign language, and sign language linguistics is increasingly offered as a subject within linguistics departments, instead of being restricted to departments of speech and language pathology, there is still great scope for linguists to recognize that sign language linguistics provides a unique means of exploring the most fundamental questions about human language: the role of modality in shaping language, the nature of linguistic universals approached cross-modally, the functions of iconicity and arbitrariness in language, and the relationship of language and gesture. The answers to these questions are not only of importance within the field of linguistics but also to neuroscience, psychology, the social sciences, and to the broadest understanding of human communication. It is in this spirit that this Handbook has been created.

Why a handbook on sign language linguistics is timely and important

The sign language linguistics scene has been very active in recent years. First of all, sign language linguists have contributed (and continue to contribute) to various handbooks, addressing topic from a sign language perspective and thus familiarizing a broader audience with aspects of sign language research and structure; e.g. linguistics in general (Sandler/Lillo-Martin 2001), cognitive linguistics (Wilcox 2007), linguistic analysis (Wilcox/Wilcox 2010), phonology (Brentari 2011), grammaticalization (Pfau/Steinbach 2011), and information structure (Kimmelman/Pfau forthcoming). A recent handbook that focuses entirely on sign languages is Brentari (2010); this handbook covers three broad areas: transmission, structure, and variation and change. There have also been several comprehensive introductory textbooks on single sign languages — e.g.

British Sign Language (Sutton-Spence/Woll 1999), Australian Sign Language (Johnston/Schembri 2007), and Israeli Sign Language (Meir/Sandler 2008) — which discuss some of the issues also addressed in the present handbook. The focus of these books, however, is clearly on structural, and to a lesser extent, historical and sociolinguistic, aspects of the respective sign language. A textbook that focuses on structural and theoretical aspects of sign language grammar, discussing examples from different sign languages (mostly American Sign Language and Israeli Sign Language), is Sandler and Lillo-Martin (2006). The central aim of that book is to scrutinize the existence of alleged linguistic universals in the light of languages in the visual-gestural modality.

The time is thus ripe for a handbook on sign language linguistics that addresses a wider range of topics from cross-linguistic, cross-modal, and theoretical perspectives. It is these features which distinguish the present handbook from previous publications, making it a unique source of information: First, it covers

all areas of contemporary linguistic research. Second, given that sign language typology is a fascinating and promising young research field, authors have been encouraged to address the topic of their chapter from a broad typological perspective, including — wherever possible — data from different sign languages, thus also illustrating the range of variation attested among sign languages. Third, where appropriate, the contributions also sketch theoretical analyses for the phenomena under discussion, providing a neutral survey of existing, sometimes conflicting, approaches. Therefore, this handbook is of relevance to general linguistics, that is, it is designed not only for linguists researching sign language but also for linguists researching spoken language. Examples are provided from a large number of sign languages covering all regions of the world, illustrating the similarities and differences among sign languages and between sign languages and spoken languages. The book is also of interest to those working in related fields such as psycholinguistics and sociolinguistics and to those in applied fields, such as language learning and neuropsychology.

Structure of the handbook

The handbook consists of 44 chapters organized in nine sections, each of which has been supervised by a responsible section editor. Although each chapter deals with a specific topic, several topics make an appearance in more than one chapter. The first four sections of the handbook (sections I—IV) are dedicated to the core modules of grammar (phonetics, phonology, morphology, syntax, semantics, and pragmatics). The fifth section deals with issues of sign language evolution and typology, including a discussion of the similarities and differences between signing and gesturing. Psychoand neurolinguistic aspects of sign languages are discussed in section VI. Section VII addresses sociolinguistic variation and language change. Section VIII discusses a number of applied issues in sign language linguistics such as education, interpreting, and sign language poetry. Finally, section IX deals with questions of sign language documentation, transcription, and computer modelling.

Despite the broad coverage, a few topics do not receive a detailed discussion in the handbook; among these are topics such as Deaf culture, literacy, educational practices, mental health, sign language assessment, ethical issues, and cochlear implants. We refer the reader to Marschark and Spencer (2003, 2010), two comprehensive handbooks that address these and many other issues of an applied nature. We hope — whatever one's background — the reader will be drawn along new paths of interest and discovery. <>

Essay: Linguistics and Hermeneutics by Stanley E. Porter

Before I turn to the content of this essay, I wish first to congratulate my colleague Timothy Meadowcroft, the worthy recipient of this celebratory volume. Whether appropriately titled in German as a *Festschrift* or not, such a volume is designed genuinely to recognize and commend its recipient as one honored and feted by colleagues. Tim is certainly held in such regard by his friends and colleagues, and I know that those at Laidlaw College in Auckland, both students and academic staff, who have relied upon him over the years, will now miss him in his retirement. I here merely wish to add my congratulations to him and offer high hopes that these retirement years will be the productive ones that he has envisioned and anticipated.

When I had an invitation to lecture in New Zealand a few years ago, I enjoyed the opportunity to engage in discussion with a number of students and academic colleagues over a range of topics related to the field of hermeneutics in its various forms and expressions. This discussion came out of my own

comments and approach to linguistics within the hermeneutical enterprise and especially as it relates to our common task as biblical interpreters. In honor of Tim, I thought that I would explore in this essay the relations among some of these notions in more detail, not because I believe that I have any great insights to offer but because I believe that the relationship of linguistics and hermeneutics, especially in relation to biblical interpretation, is one that merits clearer discernment than it has often garnered. In fact, the relationship—perhaps more of a distinction than a relationship—is one that usefully helps to understand some of the important interpretive issues that we as biblical scholars face.

Definitions of Hermeneutics

Before we are able to understand the relationship of linguistics to hermeneutics, we must first understand what we mean by hermeneutics, and this is where the problems begin. The definitions have varied considerably over the years, with sometimes narrow and sometimes very broad definitions obtaining. Richard Palmer in his (at one time) groundbreaking introduction to hermeneutics offers what he characterizes as “six modern definitions of hermeneutics.” I realize that he published these definitions in 1969, but so far as I can determine from more recent work, especially in New Testament studies, these definitions are still relevant and sufficient for my exposition of the issues. These six definitions provide a suitable platform for identifying various works of biblical hermeneutics and interpretation that follow these models, as a prelude to discussion of linguistics in relationship to hermeneutics.

The first definition is of hermeneutics as the “theory of biblical exegesis.” This conception predated invention of the word “hermeneutics” that was later formulated to describe “the rules for proper exegesis of Scripture.” Palmer traces such biblical exegesis from the Old Testament itself to the New and through the early church and the Reformers up to the time of the Enlightenment. In this sense, biblical exegesis or interpretation is as old as the Bible itself. This use of the term is precritical and concerned with determining “rules, methods, or theory” as distinct from doing exegesis (often focused in recent forms on trinitarianism as a basis), although the definition of the term is sometimes also broadened to include nonbiblical literature. Some volumes on biblical hermeneutics or interpretation still reflect this perspective, such as those by Milton Terry, Louis Berkhof, William Larkin, Gerhard Maier, Robert Thomas, Manfred Oeming, and probably Jens Zimmermann and Craig Bartholomew.

The second definition is of hermeneutics as “philological methodology.” This definition of hermeneutics emerged out of the Enlightenment and the development of historical criticism, as found in such authors as Johann August Ernest (1707–1781) and Johann Salomo Semler (1725–1791). This is called the philological method, because it parallels the first two major periods in modern language study, the rationalist and the comparative-historical, before the emergence of so-called modern linguistics, and it coincides with the emergence of historical-critical method seen in terms of applying general rules of philology and ascertaining determinate meanings. A recent figure closely associated with this view is the literary critic E. D. Hirsch. Many, if not most, recent volumes specifically on biblical hermeneutics or interpretation reflect this perspective, such as Berkeley Mickelsen, Bernard Ramm, Henry Virkler, Clayton Croy, Andreas Köstenberger and Richard Patterson, Craig Keener, and William Klein, Craig Blomberg, and Robert Hubbard.

The third definition is of hermeneutics as “the science of linguistic understanding.” Palmer attributes this view to Friedrich Schleiermacher (1768–1834), who departed from the rule-based philological method and introduced the notion of general hermeneutics as the science of describing the conditions for understanding. This is in some ways a problematic definition by Palmer, as the notion of linguistics held

by Schleiermacher is significantly different from that of Ferdinand de Saussure and modern linguistics. By calling this view “linguistic,” Palmer does not seem to mean the major tenets of Saussure’s thought but instead indicates that Schleiermacher was concerned not just with language and its rules but with reconstructing the psychology of the author and hence with the author’s thoughts expressed in the author’s style. This shifted the interpretive emphasis from language to the human subject and its inward psychology and thought. Even though Schleiermacher formulates what might be called a romantic hermeneutic, with emphasis upon the self, the subject, and experience, he sees language as fundamental to this psychological exploration, a factor not always appreciated in Schleiermacher’s thought and apparently what is meant by “linguistic” in this definition, and as close as we are going to get to what is called modern linguistics. This approach would find recent representation in advocates of ordinary language philosophy and the Speech Act Theory of J. L. Austin and John Searle. If we adopt this expansive view of language and linguistics as related to Schleiermacher and those who have followed his path through modern linguistics (if such a path can indeed be found), we see that this approach to hermeneutics is found in a few biblical hermeneutical and interpretive works. These include the diverse theories of Severino Croatto, some of the work of Anthony Thiselton, Kevin Vanhoozer, Luis Alonso Schökel, Grant Osborne to a degree, Richard Briggs, David Holgate and Rachel Starr at least in part, and perhaps clearest of all, Petr Pokorny.

The fourth definition is of hermeneutics “as the methodological foundation for the Geisteswissenschaften,” or human sciences. According to this definition, Wilhelm Dilthey sought to ground the human sciences in a method that was different from that of the natural sciences. He believed that they warranted a different hermeneutic based upon their historical, contextual, and personal dimensions. Few works of biblical hermeneutics or interpretation of which I am aware adopts this definition, even if some of them might recognize a difference between the natural and human sciences, apart from that of Edgar McKnight, although there may be some that I have missed.

The fifth definition is of hermeneutics as “the phenomenology of Dasein and of existential understanding.” This is the definition attributed to Martin Heidegger’s interpretation and application of phenomenology, concerned with being in the world (Dasein). This position was later expanded by Hans-Georg Gadamer, who also came to recognize the importance of language as the means by which one confronts reality. Gadamer’s perspective has come to be identified with what is called philosophical hermeneutics, and it has spawned a number of developments that continue to push the notion of hermeneutics forward even as far as poststructuralism and its related thought. This approach to hermeneutics, although widely accepted in the field of hermeneutics, is taken by relatively few in the field of biblical studies, but includes Thiselton, Stanley Porter and Jason Robinson, and Bradley McLean.

The sixth definition is of hermeneutics as “a system of interpretation” that recovers meaning.¹⁸ This view is represented by Paul Ricoeur, who argues in some ways for a return to the rule-driven exegesis of a previous era. However, rather than hermeneutics being confined to matters of language, other means are available for uncovering the deeper meanings of any complex symbol system, such as psychoanalysis. Hermeneutics focuses upon the symbolic meanings of texts to reveal their deeper meanings. Two hermeneutical approaches to these symbol systems may either sympathetically “demythologize” them, to use the language of Rudolf Bultmann, or seek to destroy them, as in the work of Marx, Nietzsche, and Freud. Those who sympathetically engage the text have the possibility of hermeneutically encountering the language, symbols, and myths that lie behind it. This approach to

biblical interpretation and hermeneutics is taken by relatively few in the field of biblical studies, but includes the early work of Vanhoozer and the later work of Thiselton.

These six definitions—if they are an accurate account of the six major current definitions of hermeneutics—provide a conspectus upon the various and broad definitions of hermeneutics, the distribution of a number of biblical interpreters according to this scheme, and a suitable point of departure for discussion of the relationship of linguistics to hermeneutics.

Linguistics and the Six Definitions of Hermeneutics

There are a number of different ways in which these six definitions may be examined in relationship to linguistics. Before doing that, however, I must clarify what I mean by linguistics. By linguistics, I am referring to what is often described as modern linguistics, the movement that fundamentally changed conceptions of language, beginning most especially in the early twentieth century with the work of Ferdinand de Saussure and then the Geneva School of Linguistics, the Prague Linguistics Circle, and the descriptive studies of Native American languages in North America. Most histories of linguistics point to at least Saussure, and often other influences such as mentioned here, as signaling the beginning of modern linguistics. Modern linguistics has continued to develop in a variety of ways since this early work, especially in the form referred to as structuralism. Structuralism had a widespread impact upon many intellectual disciplines, including not only linguistics but also other social sciences such as anthropology, the humanities in literary studies, and even the so-called hard sciences such as mathematics. Linguistic structuralism came to dominate the academic study of language, including both Europe and North America, until the field today is highly diverse, with a variety of competing models and theories.

There are a variety of ways that modern linguistics can be divided up, including seeing the division between syntactocentric and communication and cognition models, between formal, cognitive, and functional models, and between those focused upon language being in context, text, heads, or groups. Most of these models would agree upon a number of factors that distinguish modern linguistics from the two major previous periods of language study. These would be synchrony over diachrony, language as system, the arbitrary nature of the sign, the distinction between langue and parole (with debate over which is to be emphasized), language as difference, the distinction between syntagmatic and paradigmatic relations, and language as a social entity (again, debated). The two earlier periods of importance were the rationalistic period of the Enlightenment to the eighteenth/nineteenth century, which was dominated by rationalism and empiricism, and the comparative-historical period of the nineteenth century, which was dominated by historical, comparative, and source questions. This brief conspectus of linguistics sets the stage for an analysis of the varied definitions of hermeneutics.

The first observation to make is that, in light of these definitions, it is not surprising that there is such variety in books that use the terms “hermeneutics” and “biblical interpretation,” as both are terms closely attached to the six definitions. The first three definitions are focused around language, and the second three on hermeneutics per se, even if language plays a role. Thus, half of the definitions of hermeneutics revolve around definitions of language, while half of them orient themselves to philosophical questions. The titles of the books written in these models reflect the diversity of orientations. Some books on hermeneutics focus upon matters of language, while others emphasize interpretation. They are simply reflections of different models of hermeneutics broadly defined. Hence,

we can find books that reflect several varieties of hermeneutics, which is not surprising given that the topic is hermeneutics.

Many of the most recent works on hermeneutics in biblical studies focus upon the work of Gadamer and Ricoeur, often without making the kind of differentiation made by Palmer or later by Schmidt. Thus, Thiselton's *New Horizons* devotes major sections to both Gadamer, whom he treated at length in *The Two Horizons*, and to Ricoeur, and the two of them recur in his introductory *Hermeneutics*. The two of them are also featured in Porter and Robinson's survey of hermeneutics, and in McLean's work as well. Matters of language have been important in the stream of thought from Heidegger to Gadamer to more recent developments. However, one probably cannot say that such thought accurately reflects modern linguistics, but more repeats theories regarding language and reality from the nineteenth century or uses linguistic notions to formulate philosophical statements. In 1920–21, Heidegger published an essay, "Introduction to the Phenomenology of Religion," in which he exegetes Paul in phenomenological terms. In the course of doing so, Heidegger makes a distinction between two Greek words for time found in Paul, χρόνος and καιρός. Heidegger characterizes chronotic time as "historical time" and kairotic time as "a unified flow of life that opens up to future possibilities," in which there is a sense of the "present moment." Those familiar with the discussion will note that similar kinds of distinctions regarding words for time were a part of the Biblical Theology movement, especially the work of Oscar Cullmann, and soundly and decisively criticized, especially by James Barr, for their lack of support within the language and their violating sound principles of general linguistics. Heidegger, however, goes even further than the biblical theologians, transforming the words for time into philosophical concepts that orient one to the world. In other essays, Heidegger makes clear that he believes that language mediates experience, and that the experiences we have are conveyed by language (to the point of making translatability impossible, something most modern linguists would not endorse) as language governs how we think—a form of linguistic relativity.

Gadamer to a large extent follows Heidegger in his view of language, to the point where he says that language mediates reality in a subjective way. Gadamer's major chapter on language in his *Truth and Method* speaks of it as a "horizon of a hermeneutic ontology," and includes a section on "language as experience of the world." Gadamer, as Thiselton notes, reflects Wilhelm von Humboldt's views, developed further in the Sapir-Whorf hypothesis (though not mentioned by Gadamer), on linguistic relativism and determinism, in which languages differ and are reflective of the users' perspectives on the world. Jens Zimmermann characterizes Gadamer's view of language as somewhere between the Saussurean notion of it being an arbitrary system of signs to being a representative of reality (the earlier referential theory). Zimmermann goes on to note that Gadamer in his views of language draws analogies with trinitarian theology in which language becomes revelatory. Language is thus epistemologically and even ontologically central to Gadamer's thought in a way that apparently moves far beyond what is found in modern linguistics. Bradley McLean refers to what he calls the "linguistic turn" as the transition from the precritical to the postcritical period in hermeneutics. He traces in particular the importance of the Sapir-Whorf hypothesis, found in various earlier forms in both Heidegger and Gadamer. This leads him to identify the taxonomic power of language, that is, the power of language to divide up its world according to its own categories. For McLean, the linguistic turn involves recognition that in its taxonomic properties and symbolic systems language "shapes what we take to be reality." The instability of the sign, and self-referentiality of every sign system, has been recognized by later thinkers. However, such poststructuralist thinkers as Jacques Derrida, Michel Foucault, and Roland Barthes, along with

others, have also been severely criticized for many of the limitations of their modern linguistic knowledge, in particular what Thomas Pavel calls their “anti-referential and binary theses.” Thus, despite the use of language to make claims about language, this stream of hermeneutical thought cannot be characterized as robustly or modernly linguistic, despite their claims and intentions towards language and even, in some places, literary study.

Ricoeur is also well aware of developments regarding language, especially as the results of structuralism, and shares the belief with Heidegger and Gadamer that language mediates reality. Ricoeur’s work is diverse and complex, so it is difficult to summarize his position on such an important topic as language. Nevertheless, there seems to be a common thread that runs through a number of his writings. In his early work, Ricoeur introduces the notion of semantics into his hermeneutical thought by means of the symbol, so that he endorses two levels of meaning. The secondary and figurative meaning is accessed through the primary and literal level. However, Ricoeur is opposed to some of the fundamental tenets of structuralism, especially the structuralism of Saussure and some of the more rigorous linguists such as Louis Hjelmslev and his glossematics, and he takes a more functional approach. As a result, Ricoeur disputes the role of language as an object of scientific investigation, he gives priority to language as change (*parole*) over language as system (*langue*), and he questions the self-defining sign system of language and its autonomous self-referential nature—all clearly opposing the modern linguistic agenda. Ricoeur pursued many of these ideas later, among other volumes, in his volume on Interpretation Theory: Discourse and the Surplus of Meaning. Ricoeur states that the problem of language stems from a distinction between language as code (system or structure) and language as it is used or functions. Ricoeur emphasizes language as discourse, which he equates with *parole*, over *langue*. *Parole* is heterogeneous, while *langue* is homogeneous. The sentence takes on significance within Ricoeur’s

thought and is linked to propositions (having predicate structure). Ricoeur ends up rejecting Roman Jakobson’s model of language and prefers instead the Speech Act Theory of Austin and Searle. For Ricoeur, authorial meaning is a property of the text, not of authors, hence Ricoeur takes a realist view of meaning in which language has an inherent referent and reflects reality. The symbolic and metaphorical extensions of meaning of a text are limited by probabilities. Even though Ricoeur acknowledges the role of language, he is much less sanguine about the role of linguistics, even if it is a more Saussurean structuralism.

With Palmer’s three more temporally recent hermeneutical definitions, numbers four to six, taking positions that do not provide a clear role for linguistics, we turn to the other three definitions. We can see from the six definitions above that three of the six definitions of hermeneutics are explicitly related to language, the first to the precritical period before the advent of post-Enlightenment studies of language and the second to the post-Enlightenment period of the rationalistic and comparative-historical study. The first and second of these definitions can hardly be called modern linguistic (at least as that term is usually understood) but would be associated with what is often referred to as traditional grammar. Traditional grammar is frequently linked with traditional exegesis and even with the early stages of language study up through both the rationalist and comparative historical periods. The linguist David Crystal has defined the major characteristics of traditional grammar, in a section in which he distinguishes linguistics from that which it is not. The things that it does not include are the tendency to equate linguistics with philology or the study of the history and development of language especially as seen in the classical languages, the all too ready attempt to equate linguistics with the ability to learn and

to teach other languages, some confusion over whether a linguist is also a literary critic, and especially its distinctions from traditional grammar. Traditional grammar tends not to differentiate between spoken and written language, restricts its analysis to selected forms of the language (often formal in nature), provides a distorted view of the probabilities of language phenomena in light of its skewed sampling, utilizes the insights and even categories from other languages including Latin, and makes inappropriate value judgments regarding language such as its complexity, value, sophistication, or beauty. The first and second definitions of hermeneutics clearly fit within the parameters of traditional grammar, with their precritical and even rationalist and comparative historical approaches.

If we agree that the above description of the history of language study is reasonable—though admittedly very brief—then we have to acknowledge that only one of the six definitions of hermeneutics actually addresses the question of linguistics, and it does so in an admittedly unusual way by beginning with Schleiermacher and continuing through to Speech Act Theory. In other words, the strand that Palmer has identified follows the line of what one might call the author-oriented intentionalists. These intentionalists were given a foundation by Schleiermacher's location of meaning in the psychology of the author, and their lineage continued down through the ordinary language philosophers and then Speech Act Theory. There is no doubt that much modern linguistics would be equated with this strand of thought, especially if we expand the definition to include those linguistic theories that are equated with formalism and cognitive studies. To greatly simplify for the sake of the discussion, formalism, as found in the work of Noam Chomsky and his various and diverse followers, is a constituency-based phrase structure and transformational grammar that has expanded to include a variety of related grammatical models based upon constituency constructions. The cognitivists are concerned with the embodied mind. Palmer's definition, so far as it is representative of hermeneutics, neglects what might be called functional views of language, as mentioned by Ricoeur as his preference over structuralism. Functional grammars would include a variety of language models that emphasize the functions of language over its formal structures, as represented in such models as Systemic Functional Grammar, Tagmemics, Stratificational Grammar, and various forms of Functionalism (Continental, Northwestern, etc.). These functional approaches comprise major models within linguistics that do not seem to have a readily apparent home within the definitions of hermeneutics. In other words, as helpful as it is for one of the six definitions of hermeneutics to recognize a connection with developments in modern linguistics (definition five), the discussion is skewed by the framing of the definitions, and in fact is highly limited in its appreciation of the field of modern linguistics.

If my analysis above is correct, then it is no wonder that modern linguistics and hermeneutics have had much less significant critical interaction than two disciplines—no matter how abstractly construed they may be—focused upon texts might reasonably be expected to have. There is no doubt that hermeneutics recognizes the importance of language, to the point where three of the definitions recognize the history and role of language in the history of interpretation (definitions one to three), and to the point where even those definitions that do not align themselves with modern linguistics recognize the significance of language for hermeneutics to the point of seeing language as playing a significant role in mediating reality (definition six). However, there is little within these definitions to accommodate modern linguistics as usually defined.

Summative Observations Regarding Linguistics and Hermeneutics

In light of the previous discussion, one might legitimately ask regarding the relationship and hence future of linguistics and hermeneutics, or at least the future of linguistics and hermeneutics as disciplines that share legitimate interpretive concerns. Let me make three observations.

The first is that it appears that most theories of hermeneutics are not concerned with modern linguistics, or only concerned with modern linguistics as a small part of its overall perspective. In that regard, for hermeneutics, precritical and traditional language studies are at least as viable as modern linguistics. This is seen not only in the fact that several of the standard definitions of hermeneutics are based upon traditional conceptions of language but in the fact that the three definitions of hermeneutics most closely attuned to philosophical hermeneutics are only tangentially and peripherally engaged with modern linguistics. The major stream from Heidegger to Gadamer to the poststructuralists does not seem to have drawn seriously upon the modern linguistic tradition, but instead has, in its more recent forms, appropriated elements of the poststructural turn, arguably in ways that have not fully understood the linguistic issues involved. A similar comment might also be made regarding the tradition following in the line of Ricoeur.

The second observation is that—somewhat in defense of hermeneutics—much modern linguistics is not overtly and consciously concerned with hermeneutical matters. Hermeneutists may well wish to argue that if hermeneutics is concerned with theories of understanding and interpretation, then modern linguistics is, by default and definition, hermeneutical in nature. There is merit to this argument that should be taken seriously by those engaged in modern linguistic study. However, the number of modern linguists who overtly incorporate hermeneutics into their conceptual framework is very limited. If introductory linguistics books are any indication of how hermeneutics is treated within linguistics (and I realize that they may not be indicative, but I am not sure how else to test this hypothesis), then one would expect introductions to linguistics to attempt to situate their discipline within the wider history of interpretation and understanding. I surveyed twenty-five introductions to linguistics of various types that I happen to own, all published from 1970 (using Palmer as a point of reference, whose book was published in 1969) to the present (the latest was 2012), and not a single one included hermeneutics as an entry in its indexes (one volume did not have an index) and not a single one includes hermeneutics in a chapter title. Let me note that these volumes are full of discussion of such topics related to language (a major topic in hermeneutics) as meaning, semantics, pragmatics, culture, discourse, even structuralism, and the like—yet not a single one seems to have made a meaningful and explicit reference to hermeneutics. Thus, it is not just hermeneutics that does not appear to have a cognizance of its relationship to matters of linguistics, but linguistics itself seems to be oblivious to its hermeneutical relations.

The third and final observation is that the potential nexus of linguistics and hermeneutics is one waiting to be fully developed. There are many reasons, possibly even good ones, why the lines will not or cannot be drawn between the two fields concerned with interpretation, such as disciplinary isolation, academic specialization, the silo effect of contemporary academic institutions, and the like. However, both hermeneutics as a form of cultural philosophy and linguistics as dealing with forms of human communication are interdisciplinary in constitution, even if not always in execution and performance. The areas of overlap, especially around questions of the meanings and use of language, cannot be ignored, and merit much further exploration. It is difficult to speak for an entire discipline, especially one as diverse as linguistics, but linguistics tends to function with implicit intentionality, definitive meanings, and sometimes almost positivist knowledge of the structures of human communication. The discipline

could benefit from realizing that assumptions about language, meaning, communication, function and the like also invoke larger questions of understanding. Hermeneutics tends to function with either entirely outmoded theories of language—as we have seen, hermeneutics accepts some theories of language more readily than others, especially, surprisingly, some that are clearly antithetical to more recent hermeneutical theories—or in ways that call into question some of the advances of modern linguistic theory, when various word fallacies or views of the relation of speaking and writing are simply asserted. There clearly is a lack of communication between the two that can and should be addressed.

Conclusion

The relationship of linguistics and hermeneutics represents relatively unexplored territory. They have many things in common, especially the concern for language and its functions, that demand further recognition of what each discipline could bring to bear on the other. I have not offered any clear guidelines on how this might be effected, but instead have been content simply to identify how both hermeneutics and linguistics have not yet apparently availed themselves of the potential resources that each could bring to the other. What might those next stages look like? I have no idea, but I think that neither linguistics nor hermeneutics will be able to do its work in the same way as before if each takes the other seriously and learns from what the other has already discovered about human language and communication. <>

<>

Bibliography

[The Decadent Society: How We Became the Victims of Our Own Success](#) by Ross Gregory Douthat [Avid Reader Press / Simon & Schuster, 9781476785240]

From the *New York Times* columnist and bestselling author of *Bad Religion*, a powerful portrait of how our turbulent age is defined by dark forces seemingly beyond our control

Today the Western world seems to be in crisis. But beneath our social media frenzy and reality television politics, the deeper reality is one of drift, repetition, and dead ends. *The Decadent Society* explains what happens when a rich and powerful society ceases advancing—how the combination of wealth and technological proficiency with economic stagnation, political stalemates, cultural exhaustion, and demographic decline creates a strange kind of “sustainable decadence,” a civilizational languor that could endure for longer than we think.

Ranging from our grounded space shuttles to our Silicon Valley villains, from our blandly recycled film and television—a new *Star Wars* saga, another *Star Trek* series, the fifth *Terminator* sequel—to the escapism we’re furiously chasing through drug use and virtual reality, Ross Douthat argues that many of today’s discontents and derangements reflect a sense of futility and disappointment—a feeling that the future was not what was promised, that the frontiers have all been closed, and that the paths forward lead only to the grave. <>

[The Broken Heart of America: St. Louis and the Violent History of the United States](#) by Walter Johnson [Basic Books, 9780465064267]

A searing portrait of the racial dynamics that lie inescapably at the heart of our nation, told through the turbulent history of the city of St. Louis.

From Lewis and Clark's 1804 expedition to the 2014 uprising in Ferguson, American history has been made in St. Louis. And as Walter Johnson shows in this searing book, the city exemplifies how imperialism, racism, and capitalism have persistently entwined to corrupt the nation's past.

St. Louis was a staging post for Indian removal and imperial expansion, and its wealth grew on the backs of its poor black residents, from slavery through redlining and urban renewal. But it was once also America's most radical city, home to anti-capitalist immigrants, the Civil War's first general emancipation, and the nation's first general strike -- a legacy of resistance that endures.

A blistering history of a city's rise and decline, **[The Broken Heart of America](#)** will forever change how we think about the United States. <>

[The Betrayal of the Duchess: The Scandal That Unmade the Bourbon Monarchy and Made France Modern](#) by Maurice Samuels [Basic Books, 9781541645455]

Fighting to reclaim the French crown for the Bourbons, the duchesse de Berry faces betrayal at the hands of one of her closest advisors in this dramatic history of power and revolution.

The year was 1832 and the French royal family was in exile, driven out by yet another revolution. From a drafty Scottish castle, the duchesse de Berry -- the mother of the eleven-year-old heir to the throne -- hatched a plot to restore the Bourbon dynasty. For months, she commanded a guerilla army and evaded capture by disguising herself as a man. But soon she was betrayed by her trusted advisor, Simon Deutz, the son of France's Chief Rabbi. The betrayal became a cause célèbre for Bourbon loyalists and ignited a firestorm of hate against France's Jews. By blaming an entire people for the actions of a single man, the duchess's supporters set the terms for the century of antisemitism that followed.

Brimming with intrigue and lush detail, **[The Betrayal of the Duchess](#)** is the riveting story of a high-spirited woman, the charming but volatile young man who double-crossed her, and the birth of one of the modern world's most deadly forms of hatred. <>

[American Prophets: The Religious Roots of Progressive Politics and the Ongoing Fight for the Soul of the Country](#) by Jack Jenkins [HarperOne, 9780062935984]

From one of the country's most respected religion reporters, a paradigm-shifting discussion of how the Religious Left is actually the moral compass that has long steered America's political debates, including today.

Since the ascendancy of the Religious Right in the 1970s, common wisdom holds that it is a coalition of fundamentalist powerbrokers who are the “moral majority,” setting the standard for conservative Christian values and working to preserve the status quo.

But, as national religion reporter Jack Jenkins contends, the country is also driven by a vibrant, long-standing moral force from the left. Constituting an amorphous group of interfaith activists that goes by many names and takes many forms, this coalition has operated since America’s founding — praying, protesting, and marching for common goals that have moved society forward. Throughout our history, the Religious Left has embodied and championed the progressive values at the heart of American democracy—abolition, labor reform, civil rights, environmental preservation. <>

[Loss of Indigenous Eden and the Fall of Spirituality](#) by Blair A Stonechild [University of Regina Press, 9780889777019]

Highlights the commonalities between Indigenous nations, while calling for global recognition and respect of their rights and spirituality.

As a follow-up to his award-winning *The Knowledge Seeker: Embracing Indigenous Spirituality*, Blair Stonechild continues his exploration of the Indigenous spiritual teachings passed down to him by Elders, and then moves his study further afield. He identifies the rise of what he terms a dominant wetigo worldview, marked by an all-consuming and destructive appetite that is antithetical to the relational philosophy of Indigenous thinking whereby all things are interrelated and in need of care and respect.

Based on Stonechild's work with Indigenous peoples around the world, from Inuit communities in northern Canada, to the Mapuche in Chile, the Dalits in India and the Uighurs in the Xinjiang Autonomous Region of China, **[The Loss of Indigenous Eden and the Fall of Spirituality](#)** brings together and highlights the fundamental commonalities that connect all Indigenous nations, while calling for global recognition and respect of their rights and spirituality. <>

[Loss of Indigenous Eden and the Fall of Spirituality](#) by Blair A Stonechild [University of Regina Press, 9780889777019]

Highlights the commonalities between Indigenous nations, while calling for global recognition and respect of their rights and spirituality.

As a follow-up to his award-winning *The Knowledge Seeker: Embracing Indigenous Spirituality*, Blair Stonechild continues his exploration of the Indigenous spiritual teachings passed down to him by Elders, and then moves his study further afield. He identifies the rise of what he terms a dominant wetigo worldview, marked by an all-consuming and destructive appetite that is antithetical to the relational philosophy of Indigenous thinking whereby all things are interrelated and in need of care and respect.

Based on Stonechild's work with Indigenous peoples around the world, from Inuit communities in northern Canada, to the Mapuche in Chile, the Dalits in India and the Uighurs in the Xinjiang Autonomous Region of China, **[The Loss of Indigenous Eden and the Fall of Spirituality](#)** brings

together and highlights the fundamental commonalities that connect all Indigenous nations, while calling for global recognition and respect of their rights and spirituality. <>

[Defend the Sacred: Native American Religious Freedom beyond the First Amendment](#) by Michael D. McNally [Princeton University Press, 9780691190891]

The remarkable story of the innovative legal strategies Native Americans have used to protect their religious rights

From North Dakota's Standing Rock encampments to Arizona's San Francisco Peaks, Native Americans have repeatedly asserted legal rights to religious freedom to protect their sacred places, practices, objects, knowledge, and ancestral remains. But these claims have met with little success in court because Native American communal traditions don't fit easily into modern Western definitions of religion. In **[Defend the Sacred](#)**, Michael McNally explores how, in response to this situation, Native peoples have creatively turned to other legal means to safeguard what matters to them.

To articulate their claims, Native peoples have resourcefully used the languages of cultural resources under environmental and historic preservation law; of sovereignty under treaty-based federal Indian law; and, increasingly, of Indigenous rights under international human rights law. Along the way, Native nations still draw on the rhetorical power of religious freedom to gain legislative and regulatory successes beyond the First Amendment. <>

[A Climate Policy Revolution: What the Science of Complexity Reveals about Saving Our Planet](#) by Roland Kupers [Harvard University Press, 9780674972124]

Humanity's best hope for confronting the looming climate crisis rests with the new science of complexity.

The sheer complexity of climate change stops most solutions in their tracks. How do we give up fossil fuels when energy is connected to everything, from great-power contests to the value of your pension? Global economic growth depends on consumption, but that also produces the garbage now choking the oceans. To give up cars, coal, or meat would upend industries and entire ways of life. Faced with seemingly impossible tradeoffs, politicians dither and economists offer solutions at the margins, all while we flirt with the sixth extinction.

That's why humanity's last best hope is the young science of complex systems. Quitting coal, making autonomous cars ubiquitous, ending the middle-class addiction to consumption: all necessary to head off climate catastrophe, all deemed fantasies by pundits and policymakers, and all plausible in a complex systems view. <>

[Nature's Broken Clocks: Reimagining Time in the Face of the Environmental Crisis](#) by Paul Huebener [University of Regina Press, 9780889777149]

Examines how cultural narratives of time are intimately connected to the challenges and disruptions of ecological time

The environmental crisis is, in many ways, a crisis of time. From the distress cries of birds that no longer know when to migrate, to the rapid dying of coral reefs, to the quickening pace of extreme weather events, the patterns and timekeeping of the natural world are falling apart. We have broken nature's clocks.

Lying hidden at the root of this problem are the cultural narratives that shape our actions and horizons of thought, but as Paul Huebener shows, we can bring about change by developing a critical literacy of time. Moving from circadian rhythms and the revival of ancient frozen bacteria to camping advertisements and the politics of oil pipelines, *Nature's Broken Clocks* turns to works of fiction and poetry, examining how cultural narratives of time are connected to the problems of ecological collapse and what we might do to fix them. <>

[A Wild Love for the World: Joanna Macy and the Work of Our Time](#) by Joanna Macy edited by Stephanie Kaza [Shambhala, 9781611807950]

Joanna Macy is a scholar of Buddhism, systems thinking, and deep ecology whose decades of writing, teaching, and activism have inspired people around the world. In this collection of writings, leading spiritual teachers, deep ecologists, and diverse writers and activists explore the major facets of Macy's lifework. Combined with eleven pieces from Macy herself, the result is a rich chorus of wisdom and compassion to support the work of our time.

“Being fully present to fear, to gratitude, to all that is—this is the practice of mutual belonging. As living members of the living body of Earth, we are grounded in that kind of belonging. Even when faced with cataclysmic changes, nothing can ever separate us from Earth. We are already home.”—Joanna Macy

To learn more, visit www.joannamacy.net. <>

[Living Landscapes: Meditations on the Five Elements in Hindu, Buddhist, and Jain Yogas](#) by Christopher Key Chapple, Foreword by John Grim and Mary Evelyn Tucker [SUNY Press, 9781438477930]

Explores the role of meditation on the five elements in the practice of Yoga.

In **[Living Landscapes](#)**, Christopher Key Chapple looks at the world of ritual as enacted in three faiths of India. He begins with an exploration of the relationship between the body and the world as found in the cosmological cartography of Sāṃkhya philosophy, which highlights the interplay between consciousness (*puruṣa*) and activity (*prakṛti*), a process that gives rise to earth, water, fire, air, and space. He then turns to the progressive explication of these five great elements in Buddhism, Jainism, Advaita, Tantra, and Haṭha Yoga, and includes translations from the Vedas and the Purāṇas of Hinduism, the Buddhist and Jain Sūtras, and select animal fables from early Hinduism, Buddhism, and Jainism. Chapple also describes his own pilgrimages to the Great Stupa at Shambhala Mountain Center in Colorado, the

five elemental temples (*pañcamahābhūta mandir*) in south India, and the Jaina cosmology complex in Hastinapur. An appendix with practical instructions that integrate Yoga postures with meditative reflections on the five elements is included. <>

Transforming Industrial Policy for the Digital Age: Production, Territories and Structural Change edited by Patrizio Bianchi, Clemente Ruiz Durán, Sandrine Labory [Edward Elgar Publishing, 9781788976145]

Transforming Industrial Policy for the Digital Age: Production, Territories and Structural Change argues that digital globalization is inducing deep and productive transformations, making industrial policy necessary in order to reorientate development towards inclusive and more sustainable growth. It demonstrates that industrialization remains an important development process for emerging economies.

Featuring contributions by leading scholars, this timely book unpacks the dynamics of 'Industry 4.0', including computer-based algorithms, integration with cloud computing, and the Internet of Things. As existing global value chains take advantage of the new technologies to reorganize production, the contributors explore the implications of new industrial policies, and to what extent they have promoted structural changes that maintain sustainability. This book reflects on the lessons that can be drawn from the history of national industrial policies from across the globe, covering the successes and failures of national policy in promoting industry in response to productive transformations in industrial organization.

Insightful and nuanced, this book will benefit scholars of both economics and industrial public policy. International experts and policy-makers will also appreciate this book's critical insight into the transformative shifts in global industrial organization and policies. <>

Kalila and Dimna by Nasrullah Munshi, Translated from the Persian by Wheeler Thackston [Hackett Publishing Company, Inc., 9781624668098]

Fables and fairy tales featuring dynamic animal characters have captured the imaginations of children and adults around the world for thousands of years. Tales are often handed down from generation to generation because of their compelling story lines and the wisdom they offer. Fables relate to our lives, no matter who we are or where we live. *Kalila wa Dimna* (**Kalila and Dimna**) is a collection of animal fables that centers around the jackals **Kalila and Dimna**, who are also brothers. The story cycle originated in India more than two thousand years ago and circulated widely in the Near East. It is considered one of the most popular collections of stories ever written. Three of the stories have been adapted in this book; they are tales about resourcefulness, jealousy, and friendship. <>

Sainthood and Authority in Early Islam: Al-Hakīm al-Tirmidht's Theory of wilaya and the Re-envisioning of the Sunni Caliphate by Aiyub Palmer [Studies on Sufism, Brill, 9789004408302]

In [**Sainthood and Authority in Early Islam: Al-Hakīm al-Tirmidhī's Theory of wilāya and the Re-envisioning of the Sunni Caliphate**](#) Aiyub Palmer recasts *wilāya* in terms of Islamic authority and traces its development in both political and religious spheres up through the 3rd and 4th Islamic centuries. This book pivots around the ideas of al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, the first Muslim theologian and mystic to write on the topic of *wilāya*.

By looking at its structural roots in Arab and Islamic social organization, Aiyub Palmer has reframed the discussion about sainthood in early Islam to show how it relates more broadly to other forms of authority in Islam. This book not only looks anew at the influential ideas of al-Tirmidhī but also challenges current modes of thought around the nature of authority in Islamic societies. <>

[**Sufism and the Perfect Human: From Ibn 'Arabī to al-Jīlī**](#) by Fitzroy Morrissey [Routledge Sufi Series, Routledge, 978-0367426729]

Studying the history of the notion of the 'Perfect Human' (al-insān al-kāmil), this book investigates a key idea in the history of Sufism. First discussed by Ibn 'Arabī and later treated in greater depth by al-Jīlī, the idea left its mark on later Islamic mystical, metaphysical, and political thought, from North Africa to Southeast Asia, up until modern times.

The research tells the story of the development of that idea from Ibn 'Arabī to al-Jīlī and beyond. It does so through a thematic study, based on close reading of primary sources in Arabic and Persian, of the key elements of the idea, including the idea that the Perfect Human is a locus of divine manifestation (maẓhar), the concept of the 'Pole' (quṭb) and the 'Muhammadan Reality' (al-ḥaqīqah al-Muhammadiyah), and the identity of the Perfect Human. By setting the work of al-Jīlī against the background of earlier Ibn 'Arabī treatments of the idea, it demonstrates that al-Jīlī took the idea of the Perfect Human in several new directions, with major consequences for how the Prophet Muhammad – the archetypal Perfect Human – was viewed in later Islamic thought. <>

[**On the Sultan's Service Halid Ziya Usakligil's Memoir of the Ottoman Palace, 1909-1912**](#) by Douglas Scott Brookes [Indiana University Press, 9780253045508]

"When at last we were approaching the Harem, the Sultan, surely quite alarmed, said to me in a low voice (was that so the eunuch walking in front of us wouldn't hear, or because in this lonely and dark passageway he was frightened of his own voice?), Ne olacak? 'What is to become of things?'"

Translated into English for the first time, this memoir provides fascinating first-hand insight into the personalities, intrigues, and inner workings of the Ottoman palace in its final decades. Written by Halid Ziya Uşaklıgil, who was First Secretary to Sultan Mehmed V and would go on to be one of Turkey's most famous novelists, [**On the Sultan's Service Halid Ziya Usakligil's Memoir of the Ottoman Palace, 1909-1912**](#) makes available to English readers the remarkable account of life and work in the Ottoman palace chancery—the public, "business" side of the palace—in its final incarnation. We learn of the court's new role under this second-to-last Sultan in post-Revolution Turkey. No longer exercising political power, the palace negotiated the minefields between political factions, sought ways to unite the

empire in the face of sharpening nationalist aspirations, and faced with a kind of shocked despondency the opening salvos of the wars that were to overwhelm the country. Uşaklıgil includes interviews with the Imperial family and descriptions of royal nuptials, the palaces and its visitors, and the crises that shook the court. He delivers an insightful and moving portrait of Mehmed V, the elderly gentleman who reigned over the Ottoman Empire through both Balkan Wars and World War I. <>

[The Early Muslim Conquest of Syria: An English Translation of al-Azdī's Futūh al-Sham](#)

translated and annotated by Hamada Hassanein and Jens Scheiner [Culture and Civilization in the Middle East, Routledge, 9780367230258]

This book narrates the battles, conquests and diplomatic activities of the early Muslim fighters in Syria and Iraq vis-à-vis their Byzantine and Sasansian counterparts. It is the first English translation of one of the earliest Arabic sources on the early Muslim expansion entitled **[Futūh al-Shām \(The Conquests of Syria\)](#)**.

The translation is based on the Arabic original composed by a Muslim author, Muḥammad al-Azdī, who died in the late 8th or early 9th century C.E. A scientific introduction to al-Azdī's work is also included, covering the life of the author, the textual tradition of the work as well as a short summary of the text's train of thought. The source narrates the major historical events during the early Muslim conquests in a region that covers today's Lebanon, Israel, Palestinian Territories, Jordan, Syria, Turkey and Iraq in the 7th century C.E. Among these events are the major battles against the Byzantines, such as the Battles of Ajnādayn and al-Yarmūk, the conquests of important cities, including Damascus, Jerusalem and Caesarea, and the diplomatic initiatives between the Byzantines and the early Muslims. The narrative abounds with history and Islamic theological content. <>

[Studying the Qur'ān in the Muslim Academy](#) by Majid Daneshgar [AAR Reflection and Theory in the Study of Religion Series, Oxford University Press, 9780190067540]

[Studying the Qur'ān in the Muslim Academy](#) examines what it is like to study and teach the Qur'an at academic institutions in the Muslim world, and how politics affect scholarly interpretations of the text. Guided by the author's own journey as a student, university lecturer, and researcher in Iran, Malaysia, and New Zealand, this book provides vivid accounts of the complex academic politics he encountered. Majid Daneshgar describes the selective translation and editing of Edward Said's classic work *Orientalism* into various Islamic languages, and the way Said's work is weaponized to question the credibility of contemporary Western-produced scholarship in Islamic studies. Daneshgar also examines networks of journals, research centers, and universities in both Sunni and Shia contexts, and looks at examples of Quranic interpretation there. Ultimately, he offers a constructive program for enriching Islamic studies by fusing the best of Western theories with the best philological practices developed in Muslim academic contexts, aimed at encouraging respectful but critical engagement with the Qur'an. <>

[Disruptive Voices and the Singularity of Histories](#) (Histories of Anthropology Annual, Volume 13) edited by Regna Darnell and Frederic W. Gleach [Histories of Anthropology Annual, University of Nebraska Press. 9781496217691]

Histories of Anthropology Annual presents diverse perspectives on the discipline's history within a global context, with a goal of increasing awareness and use of historical approaches in teaching, learning, and conducting anthropology. The series includes critical, comparative, analytical, and narrative studies involving all aspects and subfields of anthropology.

Volume 13, **[Disruptive Voices and the Singularity of Histories](#)**, explores the interplay of identities and scholarship through the history of anthropology, with a special section examining fieldwork predecessors and indigenous communities in Native North America. Individual contributions explore the complexity of women's history, indigenous history, national traditions, and oral histories to juxtapose what we understand of the past with its present continuities. These contributions include Sharon Lindenburger's examination of Franz Boas and his navigation with Jewish identity, Kathy M'Closkey's documentation of Navajo weavers and their struggles with cultural identities and economic resources and demands, and Mindy Morgan's use of the text of Ruth Underhill's O'odham study to capture the voices of three generations of women ethnographers.

Because this work bridges anthropology and history, a richer and more varied view of the past emerges through the meticulous narratives of anthropologists and their unique fieldwork, ultimately providing competing points of access to social dynamics. This volume examines events at both macro and micro levels, documenting the impact large-scale historical events have had on particular individuals and challenging the uniqueness of a single interpretation of "the same facts." <>

[The Chimera Principle: An Anthropology of Memory and Imagination](#) by Carlo Severi, Translated by Janet Lloyd, Foreword by David Graeber [Hau - Malinowski Monographs, HAU Books, 9780990505051]

Available in English for the first time, anthropologist Carlo Severi's *The Chimera Principle* breaks new theoretical ground for the study of ritual, iconographic technologies, and oral traditions among non-literate peoples. Setting himself against a tradition that has long seen the memory of people "without writing"—which relies on such ephemeral records as ornaments, body painting, and masks—as fundamentally disordered or doomed to failure, he argues strenuously that ritual actions in these societies pragmatically produce religious meaning and that they demonstrate what he calls a "chimeric" imagination.

Deploying philosophical and ethnographic theory, Severi unfolds new approaches to research in the anthropology of ritual and memory, ultimately building a new theory of imagination and an original anthropology of thought. This English-language edition, beautifully translated by Janet Lloyd and complete with a foreword by David Graeber, will spark widespread debate and be heralded as an instant classic for anthropologists, historians, and philosophers. <>

[Anthropological Theory: An Introductory History, Seventh Edition](#) by R. Jon McGee, Richard L. Warms [Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 9781538126202]

[Anthropological Theory: An Introductory History, Seventh Edition](#), presents a selection of critical essays in anthropology from 1860 to the present day. Classic authors such as Marx, Durkheim, Boas, Radcliffe-Brown, Benedict, Rappaport, Geertz, and Turner are joined by contemporary thinkers including Das, Ortner, Kwiatkowski, and Mattingly.

What sets McGee and Warms's text apart from other collections are its introductions, footnotes, and index. Detailed introductions examine critical developments in theory, introduce key people, and discuss historical and personal influences on theorists. In extensive footnotes, the editors provide commentary that puts the writing in historical and cultural context, defines unusual terms, translates non-English phrases, identifies references to other scholars and their works, and offers paraphrases and summaries of complex passages. The notes identify and provide background information on hundreds of scholars and concepts important in the development of anthropology. This makes the essays more accessible to both students and current day scholars. An extensive index makes this book an invaluable reference tool. <>

[The Scandal of Continuity in Middle East Anthropology: Form, Duration, Difference](#) edited by Judith Scheele and Andrew Shryock [Public Cultures of the Middle East and North Africa, Indiana University Press, 9780253043764]

Despite a rich history of ethnographic research in Middle Eastern societies, the region is frequently portrayed as marginal to anthropology. The contributors to this volume reject this view and show how the Middle East is in fact vital to the discipline and how Middle Eastern anthropologists have developed theoretical and methodological tools that address and challenge the region's political, ethical, and intellectual concerns. The contributors to this volume are students of Paul Dresch, an anthropologist known for his incisive work on Yemeni tribalism and customary law. As they expand upon his ideas and insights, these essays ask questions that have long preoccupied anthropologists, such as how do place, point of view, and style combine to create viable bodies of knowledge; how is scholarship shaped by the historical context in which it is located; and why have duration and form become so problematic in the study of Middle Eastern societies? Special attention is given to understanding local terms, contested knowledge claims, what remains unseen and unsaid in social life, and to cultural patterns and practices that persist over long stretches of time, seeming to predate and outlast events. Ranging from Morocco to India, these essays offer critical but sensitive approaches to cultural difference and the distinctiveness of the anthropological project in the Middle East. <>

[Sign Language An International Handbook](#) edited by Roland Pfau, Markus Steinbach, Bencie Woll [Handbook of Linguistics and Communication Science: Handbuecher zur Sprach-und Kommunikationswissenschaft De Gruyter Mouton, 9783110204216]

Die Reihe **[Handbücher Zur Sprach- Und Kommunikationswissenschaft](#)** erschließt einen Wissensbereich, der sowohl die allgemeine Linguistik und die speziellen, philologisch orientierten Sprachwissenschaften als auch diejenigen Wissenschaftsgebiete umfasst, die sich in den letzten Jahrzehnten aus der immer umfangreicher werdenden Forschung über die vielfältigen Erscheinungen des kommunikativen Handelns entwickelt haben.

In der klassischen Disziplin der Sprachwissenschaft erscheint eine Zusammenfassung des Wissensstandes notwendig, um der im Wechsel der Theorien rasch voranschreitenden Forschung eine Bezugsbasis zu geben; in den neuen Wissenschaften können die Handbücher dem Forscher Übersicht geben und Orientierung verschaffen.

The series HANDBOOKS ON LANGUAGE AND COMMUNICATION SCIENCE opens up a field of knowledge that encompasses both general linguistics and the special, philologically-oriented linguistics as well as those areas of science that have developed over the past decades from the ever-increasing research on the diverse phenomena of communicative action to have.

In the classical discipline of linguistics, a summary of the level of knowledge appears necessary in order to provide a basis for reference in the rapidly changing research of theories; In the new sciences, the manuals can give the researcher an overview and provide orientation. <>